

500 Australian Avenue South
Suite 850
West Palm Beach, FL 33401
Office: +1 (561) 746-6900



June 25, 2024

Town of Palm Beach
Public Works Department
951 Okeechobee Road, Suite A
West Palm Beach, FL 33401

Attention: Julie Parham, P.E.
Senior Project Engineer

Reference: ITB No. 2024-23 - Phase 5S and Phase 3S: Milling and Paving Improvements

Dear Ms. Parham,

Chen Moore and Associates, Inc. (CMA) has conducted a review of the four (4) bids for the Phase 5S and Phase 3S: Milling and Paving Improvements. The lowest bidder is M & M Asphalt Maintenance, Inc. with a total submitted bid of \$2,374,763.90. The second lowest bidder is R & D Paving with a total submitted bid of \$3,414,098.95. The third lowest bidder is Janice M. Riley d.b.a. The Paving Lady with a total submitted bid of \$3,598,352.18. The fourth lowest bidder is Ranger Construction Industries, Inc. with a total submitted bid of \$4,914,578.74

The engineer's opinion of probable cost is \$4,770,200.00. Three of the four bid prices are below the engineer's estimate. It is prudent for the Engineer and the Town to evaluate the cost variance in the project's components. After further review, it is CMA's opinion that the cost submitted by M & M Asphalt Maintenance, Inc. is the lowest cost that the Town can successfully construct the project while meeting the established goals. There does not appear to be any omissions in the cost components in the price submitted.

The M & M Asphalt Maintenance, Inc. references were previously submitted and verified for a similar milling and paving improvement project in 2023. The reference check performed included questions verifying the type of work completed and contractor performance during the project. Further, the contractor has qualifying experience within the Town of Palm Beach.

In conclusion, M & M Asphalt Maintenance, Inc. is the lowest bidder and is qualified to perform the work. CMA recommends awarding the contract to M & M Asphalt Maintenance, Inc. based on the submitted unit prices and for the total bid price of **\$2,374,763.90**.

Respectfully submitted,

David Cowan, Jr., P.E.
Senior Engineer
Chen Moore and Associates, Inc.