Subject: FW: Carriage House Outdoor seating request **Date:** Monday, October 03, 2022 4:26:36 PM

Kelly Churney Deputy Town Clerk

Town of Palm Beach 360 S. County Rd. Palm Beach, FL 33480 561-838-5416 www.townofpalmbeach.com

----Original Message-----

From: Paul Queally <PQueally@wcas.com> Sent: Monday, October 3, 2022 2:50 PM

To: Kelly Churney < KChurney @ Townof Palm Beach.com >

Cc: community@carriagehousepb.com

Subject: Carriage House Outdoor seating request

******Note: This email was sent from a source external to the Town of Palm Beach. Links or attachments should not be accessed unless expected from a trusted source. Additionally, all requests for information or changes to Town records should be verified for authenticity.******

Dear Mayor and Town Council Members,

I would like to lend my support to the Carriage House's application for outdoor dining. I am somewhat unique in that my wife and I are club members and live on the middle block of Seabreeze. While I understand the reluctance of some Palm Beach residents to grant outside dining to local restaurants, I generally think outdoor dining adds to town's charm and has become the new normal since the pandemic began.

The proposed outdoor dining at the Carriage House is quite similar to the outdoor dining at Renato's or Cafe Flora, an enclosed area off the street that muffles any possible noise and disruption. I walk by dogs by the club early each evening and never knew there was a courtyard until I had a tour of the club's interior. The space not only evokes the esprit de corps needs that Addison MIzner promoted, but importantly allows older diners to feel safe amid the outside air.

With warmest regards.

Paul Queally 326 Seabreeze Ave.

Subject: FW: Carriage House Outdoor Seating Request **Date:** Monday, October 03, 2022 4:25:45 PM

Kelly Churney
Deputy Town Clerk

Town of Palm Beach 360 S. County Rd. Palm Beach, FL 33480 561-838-5416

www.townofpalmbeach.com

From: Bret Baier
 Sent: Monday, October 3, 2022 3:24 PM

To: Kelly Churney < KChurney@TownofPalmBeach.com>; community@carriagehousepb.com; Amy

Baier <amy.baier@gmail.com>

Subject: Carriage House Outdoor Seating Request

******Note: This email was sent from a source external to the Town of Palm Beach. Links or attachments should not be accessed unless expected from a trusted source. Additionally, all requests for information or changes to Town records should be verified for authenticity.******

Attention: Kelly Churney 360 South County Road P.O. Box 2029 Palm Beach, FL 33480

RE: Carriage House Outdoor Seating Request

Dear Mayor and Town Council members, my wife Amy and I would like to lend our support to the Carriage House's application for outdoor dining. As you know, since the Covid pandemic, outdoor seating has become crucial. Right now, Carriage House is not able to offer meals in their internal courtyard due to their Declaration of Use Agreement, which was agreed to and signed before COVID. This has become something that people really expect -especially if Covid numbers go back up. Amy and I believe outdoor dining should be allowed at the Carriage House as it is with our restaurants and club in Palm Beach. I do not believe it to be a nuisance to the neighborhood because the courtyard is internal to the building and screened by walls, buildings, and landscaping that will keep any potential noise at bay. The Carriage House is really improving the neighborhood in the preservation and restoration that has already taken place. There is no interference with public sidewalks for outdoor seating. We choose to sit outside whenever we can post pandemic.. and we hope to continue to.

Thank you for your consideration. I think this decision will not only make Carriage House better and healthier, but will be good for Palm Beach in the long run.

After buying a home on the island, we are very excited about the years ahead in Palm Beach.

All the best,

Bret and Amy Baier

Bret Baier Chief Political Anchor Anchor and Executive Editor, "Special Report with Bret Baier" Fox News Channel

Subject: FW: Carriage House Outdoor Seating Request **Date:** Monday, October 03, 2022 12:03:09 PM

Kelly Churney
Deputy Town Clerk

Town of Palm Beach 360 S. County Rd. Palm Beach, FL 33480 561-838-5416 www.townofpalmbeach.com

From: Diego Urrutia <diego.urrutia@gmail.com>

Sent: Monday, October 3, 2022 11:53 AM

To: Kelly Churney < KChurney@TownofPalmBeach.com>

Cc: community@carriagehousepb.com

Subject: RE: Carriage House Outdoor Seating Request

******Note: This email was sent from a source external to the Town of Palm Beach. Links or attachments should not be accessed unless expected from a trusted source. Additionally, all requests for information or changes to Town records should be verified for authenticity.******

Dear Mayor and Town Council members,

First of all, thank you for all you do. Having recently joined the Carriage House, I would like to lend my support to the Club's application for outdoor dining. As we are all aware, since the pandemic, outdoor seating has become a necessity. At this time, Carriage House is not able to offer meals in their internal courtyard due to their Declaration of Use Agreement, which was agreed to and signed before the unfortunate COVID pandemic.

Given the specific location of the interior facing courtyard (entirely surrounded by the Carriage House buildings), I believe outdoor dining should be allowed, since it would certainly not create a noise issue. I believe allowing the Carriage House to use its outdoor patio for dining purposes would be a win for Palm Beachers looking to experience a wonderful meal in a safe and contained environment. Thank you for your consideration. Sincerely,

Diego Urrutia (617)-320-6666

Subject: FW: Palm Beach Town Council - Carriage House Outdoor Seating Request - Letter in Support

Date: Monday, October 03, 2022 1:21:10 PM

Importance: High

Kelly Churney
Deputy Town Clerk

Town of Palm Beach 360 S. County Rd. Palm Beach, FL 33480 561-838-5416 www.townofpalmbeach.com

From: Vanos, Simone <simone.vanos@franklintempleton.com> On Behalf Of Johnson, Greg

Sent: Monday, October 3, 2022 1:00 PM

To: Kelly Churney < KChurney@TownofPalmBeach.com>

Cc: community@carriagehousepb.com

Subject: Palm Beach Town Council - Carriage House Outdoor Seating Request - Letter in Support

Importance: High

******Note: This email was sent from a source external to the Town of Palm Beach. Links or attachments should not be accessed unless expected from a trusted source. Additionally, all requests for information or changes to Town records should be verified for authenticity.******

Dear Mayor and Town Council Members:

I would like to lend my support to the Club's application for outdoor dining. As we are all aware, since the pandemic, outdoor seating has become crucial. At this time, Carriage House is not able to offer meals in their internal courtyard due to their Declaration of Use Agreement, which was agreed to and signed before COVID. I believe outdoor dining should be allowed at the Carriage House as it is with other restaurants and clubs in town. This is a new reality we all must consider. I also do not believe it to be a nuisance to the neighborhood because the courtyard is internal to the building and screened by walls, buildings and landscaping that will keep any potential noise level at bay.

Further, Carriage House is Town-serving: Great efforts have been taken to meticulously preserve and restore the original features of the 264 Mizner building. This restoration forms part of a wider plan to continue to regenerate the surrounding areas of South County Road and Phipps Plaza to create longevity for the community and a new role in Palm Beach's architecture history for the next century.

Sincerely,

Greg Johnson
Resident
Palm Beach, FL
greg.johnson@franklintempleton.com

This message may contain information that is legally privileged or confidential. If you received this transmission in error, please notify the sender by reply email, and delete the message and any attachments. This transmission is believed to be defect free; however, no responsibility is accepted by the sender for damage arising from its receipt.

All email and instant messages (including attachments) sent to or from Franklin Templeton Investments (FTI) personnel may be retained, monitored and/or reviewed by FTI and its agents, or other authorized parties as disclosed in Franklin Templeton's Privacy Notice, without further notice or consent. Refer to our country/region specific Privacy & Cookies Notice, which you can read here http://www.franklintempletonglobal.com/privacy to learn more. Depending on your location, other privacy laws and regulations may also apply to you.

From: Antonette Fabrizi

To: Antonette Fabrizi

Subject: TO FILE - ALREADY SENT TO TC FW: Carriage House

Date: Monday, October 03, 2022 10:48:17 AM

Thank you,

Antonette Fabrizi Administrative Specialist Planning, Zoning & Building Department

Town of Palm Beach 360 South County Road Palm Beach, FL 33480 Direct: 561-227-6408

----Original Message-----

From: Kelly Churney < KChurney@TownofPalmBeach.com>

Sent: Tuesday, September 20, 2022 8:36 AM

To: Antonette Fabrizi <afabrizi@TownOfPalmBeach.com>

Subject: FW: Carriage House

FYI

Kelly Churney Deputy Town Clerk

Town of Palm Beach 360 S. County Rd. Palm Beach, FL 33480 561-838-5416 www.townofpalmbeach.com

----Original Message----

From: Deborah Jones <djones@TownOfPalmBeach.com> On Behalf Of Town Council

Sent: Tuesday, September 20, 2022 8:35 AM

To: Danielle Hickox Moore < DMoore@TownofPalmBeach.com>; Margaret Zeidman

- <MZeidman@TownofPalmBeach.com>; Bobbie Lindsay <BLindsay@TownofPalmBeach.com>; Julie Araskog
- <lcrampton@TownOfPalmBeach.com>

Cc: Pat Gayle-Gordon < PGayle-Gordon @TownofPalmBeach.com>; Kelly Churney

<KChurney@TownofPalmBeach.com>; Wayne Bergman <wbergman@TownOfPalmBeach.com>; James Murphy

<jmurphy@TownOfPalmBeach.com>

Subject: FW: Carriage House

Good morning,

Please see the letter below pertaining to Carriage House.

Sincerely, Deb

----Original Message-----

From: Shelton Robert <rshelton@sheltonandcareylaw.com>

Sent: Monday, September 19, 2022 2:40 PM

To: Town Council < TCouncil @ Town of Palm Beach.com >

Subject: Carriage House

******Note: This email was sent from a source external to the Town of Palm Beach. Links or attachments should not be accessed unless expected from a trusted source. Additionally, all requests for information or changes to Town records should be verified for authenticity.*****

Dear Council Members:

Other deeply involved and affected neighbors have previously written in some detail reasons for their concerns about the recent application and expansion of activities of the Carriage house.

I have been a seasonal resident and owner of an apartment in 215 Phipps Plaza for better than 30 years.

I will limit myself to five succinct points.

- 1. I, along with hundreds of others participated in the lengthy negotiations/hearngs with the owners of Carriage House. There were several meetings. Many points raised- and decisions, compromises reached. It would be a huge breach of faith to violate the agreement that there be no changes for two years.
- 2. It is also notable that the application proceedings, again contrary to the agreement have commenced before the season begins.
- 3. This "creep" is completely predictable. I noted some months back the landscaping going into the interior court yard.

The first towering, transplanted Palm tree died. The second soon on the way.

4. Given the history of and the peaceful tranquility of this unique park, it would be a loss to the community it becomes even more a crowded, noisy entertainment hub. It was created by the generosity of our forebear neighbors who generously contributed their front yards for this "oasis" on the Island. It would be to some extent a "desecration" of their intentions to now expand even more its use.

Sincerely,

Rober A Shelton

Subject: FW: Support ForCarriage House Dining **Date:** Wednesday, October 05, 2022 8:28:33 AM

Kelly Churney
Deputy Town Clerk

Town of Palm Beach

360 S. County Rd. Palm Beach, FL 33480 561-838-5416

www.townofpalmbeach.com

From: Russell Ball <RBall@windriverholdings.com> Sent: Wednesday, October 5, 2022 8:22 AM

To: Kelly Churney < KChurney@TownofPalmBeach.com>

Cc: community@carriagehousepb.com **Subject:** Support ForCarriage House Dining

******Note: This email was sent from a source external to the Town of Palm Beach. Links or attachments should not be accessed unless expected from a trusted source. Additionally, all requests for information or changes to Town records should be verified for authenticity.******

Dear Ms. Churney,

I highly support outdoor dining for carriage house.

Regards,

Russell Ball

RE: Carriage House Outdoor Seating Request

Dear Mayor and Town Council members: I would like to lend my support to the Club's application for outdoor dining. As we are all aware, since the pandemic, outdoor seating has become crucial. At this time, Carriage House is not able to offer meals in their internal courtyard due to their Declaration of Use Agreement, which was agreed to and signed before COVID. I believe outdoor dining should be allowed at the Carriage House as it is with other restaurants and clubs in town. This is a new reality we all must consider. I also do not believe it to be a nuisance to the neighborhood because the courtyard is internal to the building and screened by walls, buildings and landscaping that will keep any potential noise level at bay.

Sent from my iPad

From: John Cay
To: Kelly Churney

Subject: Carriage House Outdoor Dining

Date: Thursday, September 29, 2022 6:47:54 PM

*******Note: This email was sent from a source external to the Town of Palm Beach. Links or attachments should not be accessed unless expected from a trusted source. Additionally, all requests for information or changes to Town records should be verified for authenticity.******

Mr Churney

I am writing on behalf of the Carriage House application for outdoor dining in the courtyard next to the club. Your support of this proposal will bring a healthy environment for many people to enjoy dining and will have no measurable negative impact on the neighborhood.

Thank you for the consideration you are giving this application.

Regards John

John E. Cay, III 425 Worth Avenue Palm Beach, Florida 33480

Cell: (404) 915-6465 Johncayiii@gmail.co From: Payson Coleman
To: Kelly Churney

Cc:community@carriagehousepb.comSubject:Carriage House Outdoor Seating RequestDate:Friday, September 30, 2022 8:44:41 AM

******Note: This email was sent from a source external to the Town of Palm Beach. Links or attachments should not be accessed unless expected from a trusted source. Additionally, all requests for information or changes to Town records should be verified for authenticity.******

Dear Mayor and Town Council members:

I would like to add my support to the Club's application for outdoor dining. As we are all aware, since the pandemic, outdoor seating at restaurants has become common in Palm Beach. I understand that Carriage House is not able to offer meals in their internal courtyard because of a pre-COVID agreement they made in the permitting process. I think outdoor dining should be allowed at the Carriage House as it is at other restaurants and clubs in town. I also do not believe it would be a problem for the neighborhood because the courtyard is internal and screened by walls, buildings and landscaping that will keep any potential noise level at a minimum. Please act favorably on this request.

Sincerely yours, Payson Coleman 555 Island Drive Palm Beach From: Wayne Bergman
To: Antonette Fabrizi

Cc: James Murphy; Jennifer Hofmeister-Drew

Subject: FW: Carriage House Club special exception request—outdoor dining and music—OPPOSED!

Date: Wednesday, October 05, 2022 10:42:23 AM

Antonette – please forward to the Mayor & TC. Thanks.

Wayne Bergman, MCP, LEED® AP Director

Town of Palm Beach Planning, Zoning, Building 360 S. County Road Palm Beach, FL 33480 Office: 561-227-6426

www.townofpalmbeach.com

From: David Daniel <ddaniel@optonline.net>
Sent: Wednesday, October 05, 2022 10:17 AM

To: Danielle Hickox Moore < DMoore@TownofPalmBeach.com>; Town Council

<TCouncil@TownofPalmBeach.com>; Kirk Blouin <KBlouin@TownofPalmBeach.com>; Wayne

Bergman < wbergman@TownOfPalmBeach.com>
Cc: Jeanne Daniel < jbdaniel@optonline.net>

Subject: Carriage House Club special exception request—outdoor dining and music—OPPOSED!

*******Note: This email was sent from a source external to the Town of Palm Beach. Links or attachments should not be accessed unless expected from a trusted source. Additionally, all requests for information or changes to Town records should be verified for authenticity.******

Dear Mayor, Town Council, and Town Staff,

My wife Jeanne and I are Palm Beach residents. We live at 322 Seaspray Avenue in a Landmarked 1919 bungalow which we restored and for which we were given the Polly Earl Award in 2017. We love the historic nature of our neighborhood. Peaceful, safe, residential, family and friends. We also appreciate the proximity to commercial properties along South County Road. We are advocates for preservation and supporters of the Preservation Foundation of Palm Beach.

We also support responsible development and the reimagining of historic properties for modern uses. Improving our South County Road neighborhood and having vacant buildings occupied is a worthy endeavour. We were not opposed to the Carriage House project as long as it was responsibly done and the appropriate restrictions were put in place...which they were.

We do not, however, support the slow, steady, somewhat stealthy yet anticipated efforts to expand the Carriage House Club, especially their recent request to add outdoor dining and music. Our

neighborhood and Phipps Plaza are no place for that. For all the reasons well articulated in our friend and neighbor Grier Pressly's letter to you of October 4th we are strongly opposed to the Club's request and ask that you not grant it.

Thank you.

David and Jeanne Daniel 322 Seaspray Avenue From: Wayne Bergman
To: Antonette Fabrizi

Cc:James Murphy; Jennifer Hofmeister-DrewSubject:FW: Outdoor dining at Carriage HouseDate:Wednesday, October 05, 2022 7:25:34 AM

Antonette – please forward to the Mayor & TC. Thanks.

Wayne Bergman, MCP, LEED® AP Director

Town of Palm Beach Planning, Zoning, Building 360 S. County Road Palm Beach, FL 33480 Office: 561-227-6426

www.townofpalmbeach.com

From: Robin S. Esterson <robin@esterson.com>

Sent: Tuesday, October 04, 2022 7:56 PM

To: Town Council <TCouncil@TownofPalmBeach.com>; Danielle Hickox Moore <DMoore@TownofPalmBeach.com>; Kirk Blouin <KBlouin@TownofPalmBeach.com>; Wayne

Bergman < wbergman@TownOfPalmBeach.com>

Subject: Outdoor dining at Carriage House

******Note: This email was sent from a source external to the Town of Palm Beach. Links or attachments should not be accessed unless expected from a trusted source. Additionally, all requests for information or changes to Town records should be verified for authenticity.******

Dear Mayor and Town Council Members -

We are writing this letter as concerned neighbors. We live on Seaspray Avenue on the south side of the street with an unobstructed view of Phipps Plaza.

Our understanding is that the Carriage House, in direct violation of a heavily negotiated Declaration of Use Agreement, has applied for permission to to seat up 62 people outside AND has requested to have outdoor music playing until 12:30am.

As full time residents of Palm Beach Island, prompt and robust real estate taxpayers, and active members in our community - we are vehemently opposed to allowing this "special exemption request" as it would directly and meaningfully adversely impact the quality of life, right to peaceful enjoyment, and value of our and our neighbors' properties. Additionally, we have school-aged children who study and sleep in rooms directly facing Phipps Plaza. Forcing our children to move to the other side of the house or elsewhere so that members of an exclusive social club can enjoy music late into the night is an unacceptable consequence of the Club's requested exemption.

To be clear, this is not a case of residents moving next to an airport and then lobbying to shut down the airport. The Carriage House is a new neighbor and went through a lengthy negotiation with members of our neighborhood to establish the parameters under which it would operate. Outside seating and music were not part of this negotiated agreement.

For all the reasons stated above, we urge you to deny this request and require that the club operate under the previously agreed provisions.

Kindest regards,

Pamela Hickory and Robin Esterson

Robin S. Esterson robin@esterson.com c. ±1.917.992.6577

From: Bruce Gendelman

To: Kelly Churney

Cc: community@carriagehousepb.com; Lori Gendelman

Subject: Support for Carriage House outdoor dining

Pate: Friday, September 30, 2022 8:53:35 AM

Importance: High

*******Note: This email was sent from a source external to the Town of Palm Beach. Links or attachments should not be accessed unless expected from a trusted source. Additionally, all requests for information or changes to Town records should be verified for authenticity.******

Dear Mayor and Town Council members:

My wife Lori and I have lived in Palm Beach for about 22 years. In our view one of the most important developments in terms of the quality of life has been the option of having "al fresco" dining. We are so lucky to have exceptional weather in South Florida and due to Covid we have now all learned that outdoor dining is often the preferred choice for dining.

We strongly would like to lend our support to OUR Club's application for outdoor dining.

As you are aware at this time, Carriage House is not able to offer meals in their internal courtyard due to the Declaration of Use Agreement, between the Town and the Carriage House - which was agreed to and signed before COVID. As I have often said in business and in other matters "we reserve the right to learn and do things better."

We believe outdoor dining should be allowed at the Carriage House as it is with other well-situated restaurants and clubs in town.

Very importantly – In no way will this become a nuisance to the neighborhood because the courtyard is internal to the building and screened by walls, buildings and landscaping that will keep any potential noise level at bay.

As we are sure you are aware the Carriage House has been an amazing addition to the Town in part because:

- Town-serving: Great efforts have been taken to meticulously preserve and restore the original features of the 264 Mizner building. This restoration forms part of a wider plan to continue to regenerate the surrounding areas of South County Road and Phipps Plaza to create longevity for the community and a new role in Palm Beach's architecture history for the next century.
- Cultural contribution: Following a successful first season, the Club provides a cultural contribution to the town of Palm Beach and a place for generations of friends and families with both new and generational ties to Palm Beach to enjoy.
- Community focused: To protect the welfare of the public and neighbors, the Club has ensured that there is no impact to the community through minimizing staff impact, traffic, and noise levels. There is no interference with public sidewalks for outdoor seating. The courtyard is internal and has been designed to keep noise levels at bay.

Bruce & Lori Gendelman

561-301-3076

Office <u>262-478-1000 ext 11</u> Cell <u>561-301-3076</u>

www.gendelman.com

Henry R. Kravis

September 30, 2022

Ms. Kelly Churney Deputy Town Clerk Town of Palm Beach 360 South County Road P.O. Box 2029 Palm Beach, FL 33480

Re: Carriage House Outdoor Seating Request

Dear Mayor and Town Council Members,

I would like to lend my support to the Carriage House Club's application for outdoor dining. As we are all aware, since the pandemic, outdoor seating has become crucial. At this time, Carriage House is not able to offer meals in their internal courtyard due to their Declaration of Use Agreement, which was agreed to, and signed before COVID. I believe outdoor dining should be allowed at the Carriage House, as it is with other restaurants and clubs in town. This is a new reality we all must consider.

I also do not believe it to be a nuisance to the neighborhood as the courtyard is internal to the building and screened by walls, buildings and landscaping which will keep any potential noise level at bay.

Sincerely Yours,

Ma Kravis

Henry R. Kravis

Subject: FW: Carriage House Outdoor Seating Request **Date:** Wednesday, October 05, 2022 8:14:01 AM

Kelly Churney
Deputy Town Clerk

Town of Palm Beach 360 S. County Rd. Palm Beach, FL 33480 561-838-5416

www.townofpalmbeach.com

From: Marina Rubio Ruiz <marina.rubio.ruiz@gmail.com>

Sent: Tuesday, October 4, 2022 8:38 PM

To: Kelly Churney < KChurney@TownofPalmBeach.com> **Subject:** Carriage House Outdoor Seating Request

******Note: This email was sent from a source external to the Town of Palm Beach. Links or attachments should not be accessed unless expected from a trusted source. Additionally, all requests for information or changes to Town records should be verified for authenticity.******

Dear Mayor and Town Council members: We recently purchased our beautiful landmarked home at 218 Phipps Plaza. We would like to lend our support to the Club's application for outdoor dining. As we are all well aware, since the pandemic, outdoor seating has become crucial. At this time, Carriage House is not able to offer meals in their internal courtyard due to their Declaration of Use Agreement, which was agreed to before COVID. We believe outdoor dining should be allowed at the Carriage House as it is with other restaurants and clubs in town. This is a new reality we all must consider. We also do not believe it to be a nuisance to our neighborhood because the courtyard is internal to the building and screened by walls, buildings and landscaping that will keep any potential noise level at bay.

Please feel free to call me if you wish to further discuss.

Kind regards,

Bruce and Marina Leeds 561-997-4396

From: Dominick Maggio
To: Kelly Churney

Cc: <u>community@carriagehousepb.com</u>

Subject: RE: Carriage House Outdoor Seating Request **Date:** Thursday, September 29, 2022 8:14:36 PM

******Note: This email was sent from a source external to the Town of Palm Beach. Links or attachments should not be accessed unless expected from a trusted source. Additionally, all requests for information or changes to Town records should be verified for authenticity.******

Dear Mayor and Town Council Members -

We would like to lend our support to the Club's application for outdoor dining. In a post pandemic world we believe outdoor dining is a crucial feature of dining establishments and should be allowed at Carriage House in a similar manner to how it is allowed in other dining establishments on our island. We were very sad and frustrated to not be able to make use of the Club's courtyard for outdoor activities this past season. The club's courtyard is also an internal area that should never be a nuisance to anyone else in the area. We know the club has taken incredible precautions to ensure that it is a wonderful cultural contribution to the community and helps foster an atmosphere that makes people happy to be on the Island. We hope you will allow them to make use of their courtyard in a timely manner.

Respectfully,

Dominick and Sara Maggio 201 La Puerta Way, Palm Beach, FL 33480 dommaggio@gmail.com 347-886-6888 cell

Subject: FW: Carriage House Outdoor Seating Request **Date:** Tuesday, October 04, 2022 11:23:55 AM

Kelly Churney
Deputy Town Clerk

Town of Palm Beach 360 S. County Rd. Palm Beach, FL 33480 561-838-5416 www.townofpalmbeach.com

From: Herbert May herbmay3@gmail.com Sent: Tuesday, October 4, 2022 11:18 AM

To: Kelly Churney < KChurney@TownofPalmBeach.com>

Cc: community@carriagehousepb.com

Subject: Carriage House Outdoor Seating Request

*******Note: This email was sent from a source external to the Town of Palm Beach. Links or attachments should not be accessed unless expected from a trusted source. Additionally, all requests for information or changes to Town records should be verified for authenticity.******

Dear Mayor and Town Council members,

I would like to lend my support to the Club's application for outdoor dining. As we are all aware, since the pandemic, outdoor seating has become crucial. At this time, Carriage House is not able to offer meals in their internal courtyard due to their Declaration of Use Agreement, which was agreed to and signed before COVID. I believe outdoor dining should be allowed at the Carriage House as it is with other restaurants and clubs in town. This is a new reality we all must consider. I also do not believe it to be a nuisance to the neighborhood because the courtyard is internal to the building and screened by walls, buildings and landscaping that will keep any potential noise level at bay.

Further points of assistance:

• **Town-serving:** Great efforts have been taken to meticulously preserve and restore the original features of the 264 Mizner building. This restoration forms part of a wider plan to continue to regenerate the surrounding areas of South County Road and Phipps Plaza to create longevity for the community and a new role in Palm Beach's architecture history for the next century.

- **Cultural contribution:** Following a successful first season, the Club provides a cultural contribution to the town of Palm Beach and a place for generations of friends and families with both new and generational ties to Palm Beach to enjoy.
- **Community focused:** To protect the welfare of the public and neighbors, the Club has ensured that there is no impact to the community through minimizing staff impact, traffic, and noise levels. There is no interference with public sidewalks for outdoor seating. The courtyard is internal and has been designed to keep noise levels at bay.
- **The 'new normal':** Outdoor seating has become the new normal in town since the pandemic began.

Please feel free to reach out

to <u>community@carriagehousepb.com</u> or <u>dugald@carriagehousepb.com</u> with any questions or comments.

Kind regards,

Herbert A. May III

Herb May 223 Belmonte Rd West Palm Beach, FL. 33405

Cell: 410.598.3265 Herbmay3@gmail.com

SYMPATICO REAL ESTATE, INC.

222 Lakeview Avenue PH 5
West Palm Beach, Fl. 33401
Phone: 561-681-0221 561-832-6070
Fax: 561-681-0222



kchurney@townofpalmbeach.com
CC: community@carriagehousepb.com

RE: Carriage House Outdoor Seating Request

Dear Mayor and Town Council members:

As a member of the Carriage House, and an owner of various properties throughout the Island of Palm Beach, I would like to lend my support to the Club's application for outdoor dining. As we are all aware, since the pandemic, outdoor seating has become vital to service our visitors and/or citizens of Palm Beach. At this time, Carriage House is not able to offer meals in their internal courtyard due to their Declaration of Use Agreement, which was agreed to and signed before COVID restrictions. I believe outdoor dining should be allowed at the Carriage House as it has been approved with other restaurants and clubs in town. Unfortunately, these are circumstances that will continue to be our reality. Based on the foregoing and the location of the Carriage House's courtyard, I do not believe it will be a nuisance to the neighborhood because the courtyard is surrounded by walls, buildings and landscaping that will keep any potential noise level within the municipal code.

Thanking you in advance for your consideration and looking forward to continued success of all business within the Town of Palm Beach.

Best Regards,

Thomas Morrison

Phone: 561-681-0221 Fax: 561-681-0222

Subject: FW: Carriage House Outdoor Seating Request **Date:** Tuesday, October 04, 2022 4:34:39 PM

Kelly Churney
Deputy Town Clerk

Town of Palm Beach

360 S. County Rd. Palm Beach, FL 33480 561-838-5416

www.townofpalmbeach.com

From: Todd Peter <toddpeter@gmail.com> Sent: Tuesday, October 4, 2022 4:27 PM

To: Kelly Churney < KChurney@TownofPalmBeach.com>

Cc: community@carriagehousepb.com

Subject: Carriage House Outdoor Seating Request

******Note: This email was sent from a source external to the Town of Palm Beach. Links or attachments should not be accessed unless expected from a trusted source. Additionally, all requests for information or changes to Town records should be verified for authenticity.******

Dear Mayor and Town Council members:

I would like to lend my support to the Club's application for outdoor dining. As we are all aware, since the pandemic, outdoor seating has become crucial. At this time, Carriage House is not able to offer meals in their internal courtyard due to their Declaration of Use Agreement, which was agreed to and signed before COVID. I believe outdoor dining should be allowed at the Carriage House as it is with other restaurants and clubs in town. This is a new reality we all must consider. I also do not believe it to be a nuisance to the neighborhood because the courtyard is internal to the building and screened by walls, buildings and landscaping that will keep any potential noise level at bay.

Thank you,

Todd Peter 236 Fairview Road

Subject: FW: Carriage House Outdoor Seating Request **Date:** Wednesday, October 05, 2022 8:15:35 AM

Kelly Churney
Deputy Town Clerk

Town of Palm Beach 360 S. County Rd. Palm Beach, FL 33480 561-838-5416 www.townofpalmbeach.com

From: John Phelan < JPhelan@msdcapital.com>

Sent: Tuesday, October 4, 2022 5:34 PM

To: Kelly Churney < KChurney@TownofPalmBeach.com>

Cc: community@carriagehousepb.com; Amy Phelan <amy@phelanfl.com>

Subject: Carriage House Outdoor Seating Request

******Note: This email was sent from a source external to the Town of Palm Beach. Links or attachments should not be accessed unless expected from a trusted source. Additionally, all requests for information or changes to Town records should be verified for authenticity.******

Dear Mayor and Town Council members:

We would like to lend our support to the Carriage House Club's application for outdoor dining. Since the pandemic, outdoor seating has become a critical component to dining establishments both in Palm Beach and across the country. At this time, Carriage House is not able to offer meals in their internal courtyard due to their Declaration of Use Agreement, which was agreed to and signed before COVID. Because the courtyard is internal to the building and screened by walls, buildings and landscaping that will keep any potential noise level at bay. Moreover, given this is a private club with a prestigious group of local community members we do not believe that Carriage House will have any of the issues that other restaurants with outside seating in town have had. Amy and I believe outdoor dining should be allowed at the Carriage House as it is with other restaurants and clubs in town and strongly urge the Council to approve this. We would be more than happy to answer any questions you may have.

All the best,

John & Amy Phelan

JOHN PHELAN

Co-Founder & Chairman Emeritus

MSD Capital, L.P. 222 Lakeview Avenue, Suite 1600 West Palm Beach, FL 33401-6161 T 561.612.5055

1 Vanderbilt Ave, 26th Floor New York, NY 10017-5407 T 561.612.5055 E JPhelan@msdcapital.com W www.msdcapital.com

Please consider the environment before printing this e-mail. If you need to print it, please consider printing it double-sided. Thank you.

From: Sophie Rios on behalf of Town Council

To: Antonette Fabrizi

Subject: FW: Carriage House Club special exception request/outdoor dining and music OPPOSED

Date: Tuesday, October 04, 2022 4:52:58 PM

Attachments: <u>image001.png</u>

Antonette,

This is public comment regarding the Carriage House.

Thanks,

Sophie Rios Administrative Assistant



Town of Palm Beach 360 South County Road Palm Beach, FL 33480 561-227-6300

Town Manager's Office www.TownOfPalmBeach.com

From: Grier Pressly <grier@pprplaw.com> **Sent:** Tuesday, October 04, 2022 4:32 PM

To: Danielle Hickox Moore <DMoore@TownofPalmBeach.com>; Town Council

<TCouncil@TownofPalmBeach.com>; Kirk Blouin <KBlouin@TownofPalmBeach.com>; Wayne Bergman@TownOfPalmBeach.com>

Cc: kspressly@gmail.com; Barbie Tilman <barbietilman@hotmail.com>

Subject: Carriage House Club special exception request/outdoor dining and music OPPOSED

*******Note: This email was sent from a source external to the Town of Palm Beach. Links or attachments should not be accessed unless expected from a trusted source. Additionally, all requests for information or changes to Town records should be verified for authenticity.******

Dear Mayor, Town Council, and Town Staff:

Our family owns several homes on the Sea Streets, both on Seaspray and Seaview. We were also heavily involved in the Carriage House Club — Neighbor negotiation of the 2019 Declaration of Use Agreement ("DOUA") which sought to address a large number of serious concerns that the Club's neighbors have with respect to the operations of such a large and active private club located on the doorstep of our historic neighborhood. We write today in staunch opposition to the Club's premature, untimely "special exception request" for outdoor dining and music.

The Club's request for outdoor dining and music is both procedurally and substantively deficient. At the time that the Council will consider the Club's application next week, there will be no COVID-related regulations (indoor seating capacity or social distancing restrictions, etc.) in force in town. As a result, there are no extenuating circumstances that would support the Club's clear breach of the DOUA in bringing this application outside of the time parameters agreed to in the DOUA. This application should not be considered out of season (many neighbors are still away) and within the negotiated 2-year moratorium, both of which are clear breaches of the DOUA under Art. IV, para. 31. Likewise, there are no extenuating circumstances that would support the Club's request to substantively amend the DOUA to permit outdoor dining and music, a feature of the DOUA that the Club's neighbors fought for forcefully during the negotiations with the Club. The fact that Club ownership/management or a few Club members would like the availability of outdoor dining at a time when there are no pandemic-era restrictions in force is not a valid basis for the town to fail to enforce the DOUA. The Club and its members have known of the DOUA's clear prohibition on outdoor dining since 2019. There is zero hardship in this application and the Club's COVID-based argument is nothing but an opportunistic distraction. The town should hold the Club to its promises and protect the Club's resident neighbors.

Furthermore, I urge you to reject the Club's anticipated argument that its request for outdoor seating is in the same category as the requests for outdoor seating recently granted to a number of town restaurants under the town's new Outdoor Café Program. It clearly is not. To use a cliché, we are talking apples and oranges. The Council certainly has a sufficient and well justified basis to treat the Club's request for outdoor seating differently from the other establishments in town that have recently had their outdoor dining requests approved. The Club's special exception request is <u>far different from the recent Outdoor Café Program permits granted to other dining establishments in town for the following reasons, among others:</u>

1)To our knowledge, none of the other dining establishments approved for outdoor dining are subject to a recent DOUA negotiated at great length and expense by residential neighbors that includes a specific 2-year moratorium for revisions to the DOUA. As previously addressed, the timing of this request (within the moratorium and outside of the agreed upon January-May time period) is itself a disqualifier. See Art. IV, para. 31.

2)None of the other dining establishments recently approved for outdoor dining abut a residential community with the historic value to the town like Phipps Plaza. If Phipps Plaza becomes an undesirable location for residents to live as a result of the operational disruptions and inconveniences caused by the Club the town will have forever lost one of its treasures. The Sea Streets are similarly situated and share the same concerns of continuing Club "creep." The town must protect its historic treasures.

3)Outdoor dining strikes at the heart of the DOUA and the neighbors' concerns: The town recognized the importance of "preserving the peace and tranquility of the surrounding neighborhood" (Art. IV, para. 16) in approving the Club, and the Club endorsed that objective in signing the DOUA. The impact of outdoor dining to the neighborhood, particularly to the Phipps residents, will be greater than the other areas of town in which outdoor dining permits have been granted. That is the reason why the neighbors fought so hard for the DOUA to prohibit any outdoor Club activity whatsoever. The Council will recall robust discussion during the DOUA negotiations about the high quality construction materials and specially-designed doors used to keep the noise of the Club within its walls so as not to impact the surrounding neighborhood. See Art. IV, para. 7 and 8. Outdoor dining and music are diametrically adverse to those concerns. The neighbors were so concerned about outdoor noise that the DOUA even addressed use of the courtyard space for momentary employee loitering (see Art. IV, para. 30). Now, that very same courtyard is being proposed for dining for 62 people, and music, at all hours of operation. We understand that Henry's did not seek permanent outdoor dining under the Outdoor Café Program, and if true, that would make perfect sense because of its proximity to the high value residences located above and around Henry's. Henry's is being a good neighbor to its nearby residents.

4)The Club is requesting an amendment to its DOUA in the form of outdoor dining when it hasn't been open a single day for operation during high season. Unlike the dining establishments that have had outdoor dining approved, the Club has zero track record of operating within its existing DOUA during high season. That was the whole purpose of the negotiated moratorium.

5)The town's Outdoor Café permit, as its name would suggest, must certainly have been designed for town restaurants in the more commercial areas of town, not for an invitation-only private club located in the middle of an historic residential district that is operating under a recent, closely crafted DOUA.

6)The Club's hours of operations: The Club, open until 12:30 a.m. Thursday-Saturday, and midnight the rest of the week, will be operating <u>long after</u> the other dining establishments approved for outdoor dining will have closed their kitchens and doors. Furthermore, as quoted in a recent Town & County article

(https://www.townandcountrymag.com/leisure/a39481348/carriage-house-palm-beach-opening/), a primary feature of the Club is "after-dinner drinks".

7)The Club's request for 62 outdoor seats dwarfs the number of seats approved for the other dining establishments from what we have read in the PB Daily News. This is 40% of the Club's dinner dining capacity under the DOUA (153 seats) and nearly 100% of the Club's lunch time capacity (67 seats)! See Art. IV, para. 20. Furthermore, if the Club is granted approval for outdoor dining, the potential for egregious abuse of the seating limitations under the DOUA is

self-evident and who is going to enforce it every day and night during season?

8)Outdoor music? Seriously??

Thank you for your consideration of our concerns, concerns that are shared by numerous of our fellow neighbors.

Respectfully,

Grier Pressly (242 Seaspray Ave.) Katie Pressly (133 Seaspray Ave.) Barbara Pressly Tilman (136 Seaview Ave.)

J. Grier Pressly, Esq.
PRESSLY, PRESSLY, RANDOLPH & PRESSLY, P.A.
Plaza Center
251 Royal Palm Way, Suite 300
Palm Beach, FL 33480

Telephone: (561)659-4040 Facsimile: (561)655-6006 E-mail: grier@pprplaw.com From: Betsy Shiverick
To: Kelly Churney

 Cc:
 community@carriagehousepb.com

 Subject:
 Carriage House Outdoor Seating Request

 Date:
 Thursday, September 29, 2022 7:00:51 PM

******Note: This email was sent from a source external to the Town of Palm Beach. Links or attachments should not be accessed unless expected from a trusted source. Additionally, all requests for information or changes to Town records should be verified for authenticity.******

Dear Mayor and Town Council members: I would like to lend my support to the Club's application for outdoor dining. As we are all aware, since the pandemic, outdoor seating has become crucial. At this time, Carriage House is not able to offer meals in their internal courtyard due to their Declaration of Use Agreement, which was agreed to and signed before COVID. I believe outdoor dining should be allowed at the Carriage House as it is with other restaurants and clubs in town. This is a new reality we all must consider. I also do not believe it to be a nuisance to the neighborhood because the courtyard is internal to the building and screened by walls, buildings and landscaping that will keep any potential noise level at bay.

Many thanks for your consideration, Betsy

Betsy Shiverick (914) 720-7357

From: Kelly Churney

To: Antonette Fabrizi

Subject: FW: Carriage House

Date: Wednesday, October 05, 2022 10:49:35 AM

Kelly Churney
Deputy Town Clerk

Town of Palm Beach 360 S. County Rd. Palm Beach, FL 33480 561-838-5416 www.townofpalmbeach.com

From: David Solimine <dsolimine@koreins.com> **Sent:** Wednesday, October 5, 2022 10:49 AM

To: Kelly Churney < KChurney@TownofPalmBeach.com>

Cc: CC: <community@carriagehousepb.com>

Subject: Carriage House

*******Note: This email was sent from a source external to the Town of Palm Beach. Links or attachments should not be accessed unless expected from a trusted source. Additionally, all requests for information or changes to Town records should be verified for authenticity.******

Dear Mayor and Town Council Members,

I fully support the Carriage House's application to offer outdoor seating for the upcoming season. As fortunate as I am that my family has not been impacted by the pandemic, there are many families that must be vigilant due to compromised health. This outdoor seating will allow our health compromised members to enjoy this historical building and dining without worry for their safety and the safety of others. Many restaurants in Palm Beach offer outdoor seating and I would say we have all come to accept that this is our "new normal." I implore you to consider the club's application and approve outdoor dining in the courtyard.

Thank you for your consideration.

Regards, David Solimine From: Lee Styslinger III

To: Kelly Churney

Subject: Carriage House Outdoor Seating Request

Date: Thursday, September 29, 2022 7:19:51 PM

******Note: This email was sent from a source external to the Town of Palm Beach. Links or attachments should not be accessed unless expected from a trusted source. Additionally, all requests for information or changes to Town records should be verified for authenticity.******

Dear Mayor and Town Council members:

I would like to lend my support to the Club's application for outdoor dining. As we are all aware, since the pandemic, outdoor seating has become crucial. At this time, Carriage House is not able to offer meals in their internal courtyard due to their Declaration of Use Agreement, which was agreed to and signed before COVID. I believe outdoor dining should be allowed at the Carriage House as it is with other restaurants and clubs in town. This is a new reality we all must consider. I also do not believe it to be a nuisance to the neighborhood because the courtyard is internal to the building and screened by walls, buildings and landscaping that will keep any potential noise level at bay.

Further points of assistance:

- Town-serving: Great efforts have been taken to meticulously preserve and restore the original features of the 264 Mizner building. This restoration forms part of a wider plan to continue to regenerate the surrounding areas of South County Road and Phipps Plaza to create longevity for the community and a new role in Palm Beach's architecture history for the next century.
- Cultural contribution: Following a successful first season, the Club provides a cultural contribution to the town of Palm Beach and a place for generations of friends and families with both new and generational ties to Palm Beach to enjoy.
- Community focused: To protect the welfare of the public and neighbors, the Club has ensured that there is no impact to the community through minimizing staff impact, traffic, and noise levels. There is no interference with public sidewalks for outdoor seating. The courtyard is internal and has been designed to keep noise levels at bay.
- The 'new normal': Outdoor seating has become the new normal in town since the pandemic began. Please feel free to reach out to community@carriagehousepb.com or dugald@carriagehousepb.com with any questions or comments.

Warmest personal regards,

Lee Styslinger, III

From: <u>Steve Tananbaum</u>
To: <u>Kelly Churney</u>

Cc: "community@carriagehousepb.com"

Subject: Carriage House Outdoor Seating Request

Date: Friday, September 30, 2022 9:16:06 AM

******Note: This email was sent from a source external to the Town of Palm Beach. Links or attachments should not be accessed unless expected from a trusted source. Additionally, all requests for information or changes to Town records should be verified for authenticity.******

Dear Mayor and Town Council members:

I would like to lend my support to the Club's application for outdoor dining. As we are all aware, since the pandemic, outdoor seating has become crucial, and certainly is the new norm. At this time, Carriage House is not able to offer meals in their internal courtyard due to their Declaration of Use Agreement, which was agreed to and signed before COVID. I believe outdoor dining should be allowed at the Carriage House as it is with other restaurants and clubs in town. This is a new reality we all must consider. I also do not believe it to be a nuisance to the neighborhood because the courtyard is internal to the building and screened by walls, buildings and landscaping that will keep any potential noise level at bay.

Thank you for your consideration.

All the best, Steve

Steven A. Tananbaum

Managing Partner & CIO



300 Park Avenue | New York, NY 10022

Office: +1 212 847 3501 stananbaum@goldentree.com www.goldentree.com

The information transmitted is intended only for the person or entity to which it is addressed and may contain confidential and/or privileged material. Any review, retransmission, dissemination or other use of, or taking of any action in reliance upon, this information by persons or entities other than the intended recipient is prohibited. If you have received this message in error, please contact the sender and delete this message.

From: Andrew Wilkins
To: Kelly Churney

Subject: Letter of Support for the Carriage House **Date:** Thursday, September 29, 2022 9:05:45 PM

******Note: This email was sent from a source external to the Town of Palm Beach. Links or attachments should not be accessed unless expected from a trusted source. Additionally, all requests for information or changes to Town records should be verified for authenticity.******

Dear Kelly,

Thank you so much for your service to the town of Palm Beach and for taking the time to consider this letter. I am writing in regards to support Carriage House's request for outdoor dining. While outdoor dining is a staple of Palm Beach in so many beautiful restaurants and venues, the pandemic caused us all to consider further distances for our dining options. Having had Covid twice and manage companies where we continuously battle the disease, I believe this option not only is fun for members, but helps with guests that still fear indoor dining. Thank you for your consideration as I know this is a very touchy subject for many people.

My best,

Andy Wilkins

Managing Partner

Atlantic Street Capital

515 North Flagler Drive; Suite 700

West Palm Beach, FL 33401

(o) (561) 614-6265

(f) (561) 331-8830

(c) (917) 696-5596

(e) andy@atlanticstreetcapital.com

This e-mail, including any attachments, may contain confidential information of Atlantic Street Capital. This information is only for the use of the intended recipient. If you are not the intended recipient of this e-mail, please do not review, retain, disclose, copy, or distribute any part of it, please notify the sender immediately by reply e-mail and erase the material from your system. There are risks in communicating by e-mail and we do not accept liability for any delay, interception, errors, or their consequences. Past performance records are not indicative of future results. This e-mail and any attachments are not an offer to sell any interests in any funds. Any such offer will be made only by means of an Offering Memorandum and only in jurisdictions permitted by law. Any attachment herein is provided for information purposes only as of the date hereof.