



TOWN OF PALM BEACH

Town Manager's Office

REPORT OF THE BUSINESS AND ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE MEETING HELD ON JULY 8, 2021

I. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

The Business and Administrative Meeting was called to order on Thursday, July 8, 2021, at 9:30 a.m. via Zoom. On roll call, all committee members were found to be present.

II. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Chair Crampton led the Pledge of Allegiance.

III. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Motion was made by Member Lindsay and seconded by Chair Crampton to approve the agenda. On roll call, the Motion passed unanimously.

IV. REGULAR AGENDA

Chair Crampton provided an overview of agenda items being presented and indicated any approved actions will be forwarded to Town Council as recommendations for their approval.

A. Proposed Rate Increase for Paid Parking Spaces *Jay Boodheshwar, Deputy Town Manager*

Jay Boodheshwar, Deputy Town Manager, provided an overview of the proposed paid parking rates increase. The proposed rate increase includes placard fees for nonresidential parking spaces that are available to anyone, and hourly parking in various locations in Town. Mr. Boodheshwar noted that paid parking and placard fees have not been increased since 2019. Midtown Beach and Phipps Ocean Park fees have not increased since 2011.

As indicated by Mr. Boodheshwar, placard parking is a highly sought after program. Interest has increased and the program is in high demand. Most of the newly allocated placards have been sold out. There is great demand for parking spaces in the Midtown area. There was a discussion to expand the 400 Block of Peruvian. Mr. Boodheshwar noted this was to be heard at the Town Council meeting in July.

Mr. Boodheshwar stated the placard parking rate increased 20%, the last time rates were raised.

Staff is proposing a fee increase of 20%. The placards are sold in 1, 4, 6 and 12 month increments. It was noted that most placard card holders purchase the 12 month option.

Member Lindsay asked who purchases the majority of the placards. Mr. Boodheshwar responded, the majority are businesses or individual employees. Some contractors purchase these placards, as well.

Member Lindsay inquired as to the hours and days of the week the placards could be used. Mr. Boodheshwar stated the placard has a variety of underlying regulations, either time limit or paid parking. The holder of a placard can ignore the time limitation and/or ignore paying at the meter.

Member Lindsay stated it is a pretty good deal. Mr. Boodheshwar agreed. It was noted, the reason is to take pressure off juggling the cars every two hours. The Town wants to avoid people moving their cars every hour or two to avoid a ticket. Mr. Boodheshwar stated this creates less of a negative impact on the community. Noted this is a supply and demand question today.

Chair Crampton inquired if the rates being discussed are included in the proposed budget.

Amy Wood, Assistant Finance Director responded, the rates were done with the existing rate structure, this would add to the surplus funds.

Chair Crampton inquired about the amount of the additional revenue the Town would realize. Mr. Boodheshwar responded, he did not have a breakdown, however the total increase would be approximately \$400,000. Chair Crampton requested a breakdown of the revenue this would provide. Mr. Boodheshwar stated the information would be provided to Council.

Public Comment

Warren Belmar, 130 Sunrise Avenue, asked if there was a limit to the size of the vehicle that may be parked in front of homes in the area where placards are being considered. Mr. Boodheshwar responded, he believed the size was limited to passenger vehicles, such as cars, minivans, SUV's and pickup trucks. Mr. Belmar thought they were speaking of the workers and asked if pickup trucks were considered passenger vehicles. Mr. Boodheshwar responded in the affirmative.

Motion was made by Member Lindsay to approve the proposed placard price increase as outlined in the backup and take to Council. Seconded by Chair Crampton. On roll call, the Motion passed unanimously

A. Kiosk Pricing/Paid Parking/Park Mobile Revenue *Jay Boodheshwar, Deputy Town Manager*

Jay Boodheshwar, Deputy Town Manager provided an overview of the paid parking areas. Hourly rates were discussed for the various parking areas. The Town realized the trend was to pay by kiosk or pay by ParkMobile. Mr. Boodheshwar provided spreadsheets to show the trend revenues

on a monthly and yearly basis. The revenues were inclusive of paid parking.

It was noted, the projected budget for this year was \$225,000 for placard parking. This amount has already been exceeded, and \$243,300 has been realized. Last year approximately \$266,000 in revenue was collected. There was a total revenue projection of \$1.1M that has already been exceeded for paid parking, with approximately \$1.4M already received. Mr. Boodheshwar provided a breakdown of the locations and the percentage of paid parking revenues being generated. He indicated there was a trend that people were moving away from the physical kiosk device to either a telephone or a smartphone app based solution. The ParkMobile solution was implemented in 2015/2016, and the total revenue that year was 10% collected via ParkMobile. In fiscal year 2020/2021, YTD 44% of parking revenue was collected via ParkMobile.

Mr. Boodheshwar noted he expected to see continued growth in use of ParkMobile. In the future, he could envision no kiosks in the Town.

Mr. Boodheshwar showed the current and proposed rates to be reviewed by the BAC.

Member Lindsay inquired if the City of West Palm Beach had gone totally ParkMobile. Mr. Boodheshwar responded, West Palm Beach still has physical meters in certain areas.

Member Lindsay expressed interest in what the experts would say the percentage would be before an agency could just flip the switch and there are no options but to use virtual/telephone applications. She was concerned about the revenue comparison made between Midtown and Phipps Ocean Park. Noted Phipps Ocean Park is a beautiful re-nourished beach with lots of parking yet it represents only 8% of the revenue generated, compared to the 50% from Midtown. She understood there is more demand at Midtown Beach than in the Phipps Park area. Member Lindsay suggested reducing the rate at Phipps Ocean Park.

Chair Crampton indicated he would prefer to consider a recommendation of raising rates in those areas where there is an overflow or close to being an overflow of parking. Chair Crampton was not sure about increasing rates at Sunrise, Phipps Ocean Park or North County. Noted he was not inclined to have a blanket increase.

Member Lindsay indicated Floridians tend to go to the beach more in the summer, so we may want to consider Summer/Winter rates. Midtown is the most urgent area. She inquired about the issues at the Publix parking lot, Catholic Church and Greens. Wanted to know if we are pushing people into the private lots.

Mr. Boodheshwar stated the Town is not monitoring how private lots are being affected by the rates and regulation changes. He understands that some people will try to park in free parking and private lots. Mr. Boodheshwar stated this conversation should not be about the revenue, this conversation should be about the goals of the Town. The conversation is about the demand and the traffic which is created in the Midtown area and creates an adverse impact on the community. What can be done with the rates to promote the use of an area that is less dense and less traffic? Mr. Boodheshwar noted when the rates are set those rates are set to not incentivize people to not use those areas. People want to park close to the beach. Mr. Boodheshwar noted the BAC made

the recommendation to raise the rate from \$3 per hour to \$5 per hour on 100 block of Royal Palm to match what was happening on Ocean Boulevard. The decision was made to keep the rate at \$3 per hour, to encourage people between Wells and Sunrise to use those spaces instead of the spaces in that area. There is an inconsistency in the Midtown area, whereas South Ocean Boulevard and the 100 blocks of adjacent east/west streets are at \$5 but the 100 block of Royal Palm Way is at \$3 per hour. Staff recommends to raise the rates on South Ocean Boulevard, and apply the same rate on Royal Palm Way for consistency.

Chair Crampton stated that the 100 block streets and Royal Palm Way are together along with Midtown and should be consistent. This is where there is the most pressure for parking.

Member Lindsay agreed and wanted to add Sunrise and North County to be consistent with rates. Member Lindsay noted what she did not want to do was to incentivize people, like what was done with the Residential Permit Parking (RPP). Continued to say if any rates are to be decreased it would be at Phipps Ocean Park.

Public Comment

Warren Belmar, 130 Sunrise Avenue noted this was a very important issue. He stated, unfortunately this discussion was taking place when most residents are out of Town. Inquired of the cost of a parking ticket. Ben Alma, Support Services Manager responded the cost was \$60 per ticket.

Mr. Belmar commented, this was part of the impact to the Town residents and to the Town businesses, who rely on people being able to park in front or near their stores, shops, and having to worry about running out either from lunch or from shopping because of the limitation on time. He believed the focus should be more on the impact on Town residents and local Town businesses that the Town should try to save. Requested information regarding how many parking tickets in the past year and the revenue over the past year. Mr. Boodheshwar indicate that information is not available for this conversation.

Mr. Belmar stated he heard this is not a revenue raising issue. If it is targeted to raise \$400,000 at a time when the Town is experiencing beneficially large anticipated increase in revenue, why are the rates being raised. Why not decrease the revenue from the parking rates. Mr. Belmar stated he has not heard what the driving force for any of this is, except for treating everything equally and in a time of rising revenues. The discussion the Council will be having with respect to what the real estate will be and how large it surges with the surplus that is going to generate. He noted there is a very significant part coming from parking revenue and certainly during the summer months when all the residents who are in Town parking for the most part are the ones who are being charged, coupled with the rates for parking tickets is something that he believes the Town should take into account and all this ties into another issue. The Town is turning into what some might consider a paid parking lot and then enforcing it rigorously? Mr. Belmar asked what has become of the ambience of the Town for the residents. Noted there is no free parking spaces left near Town Hall for people to come and attend a meeting of the Town Council. He suggested to slow down and urged the Town Council not to make a decision when the residents are not in Town.

Chair Crampton thanked Mr. Belmar for his comments and responded all needed to look at the situation as not just the parking fees. Chair Crampton continued with some examples. The Town is creating a centralized valet service, dealt with subsurface and surface lots and making those available. Chair Crampton indicated the Town is not solely revenue driven, there is a fact that everyone must deal with, which is there are more people coming to the Town and they are coming from outside of the Town.

Member Lindsay agreed with Chair Crampton and inquired as to how many placards on Sunrise Avenue and the 100 block were sold to residents. Mr. Boodheshwar indicated there were 25 placards allocated and all 25 were sold. Mr. Boodheshwar did not know if they were residents who purchased the placards.

Member Lindsay stated people park in one space and go to different businesses. Noted part of the issue is the beach parking, which has expanded and been pushed north. Suggested leaving Sunrise Avenue and the 100 block at \$5 and raise Midtown, this would be more incentive for people to go park in this area. Stated the area is already overcrowded and there is more police enforcement and more calls with more activity. There is a constant increase of pressure on the traffic and parking from the growth in the county. Member Lindsay noted we need to be careful and thoughtful of the residents who remain in the Town during the summer months.

Motion was made by Chair Crampton and seconded by Member Lindsay to send to Town Council for review and approval of the revised rate schedule, which increases most rates but lowers the hourly rate at Phipps Ocean Park. On roll call, the Motion passed unanimously

- B. Review Draft Ordinance to Amend Chapter 134, Article I to Permit Supplemental Off-Site Shared Parking in Surface Lots and Parking Garages not Directly Adjacent to Residential Properties

Paul Castro, Zoning Administrator

- i. Proposed Amendment to the Town Code, Relative to Supplemental Off-Street Parking

Paul Castro, Zoning Administrator, noted April 8, 2020, the Town Council directed staff to draft a zoning text amendment which would allow commercial property owners to share their parking lots. The intent was to encourage optimal use of these parking lot facilities in order to help alleviate traffic and parking problems that have occurred in season throughout the Town. What was done was hours were limited. Because of this concern, the lot would only be used during daylight hours from 8 a.m. to 6 p.m. The parking would still have the same requirements or conditions, which could not be used for the supplemental parking to create a more intense use or a new use which would require or generate more parking based upon the code. Mr. Castro stated the Ordinance modified the definition for supplemental parking to include surface enclosed, partially enclosed or roof top parking facilities. In addition, staff believed this would sunset by March 13, 2023. This is a trial period. The permitted uses within the commercial districts for supplemental parking are allowed by special exceptions. This would be allowed by permitted use. Mr. Castro stated, what this does is open up all parking lots in CTS, CWA and COPI for supplemental offsite parking. This

does not open up the 100 block of Royal Palm Way that is CB, which is supplemental parking and was never permitted in that district. There were concerns the Palm House on the south side of Royal Palm Way was using the Wachovia parking lot for their events, because it was such an intense use, also in the CPC district where the supplemental parking was not permitted before. Mr. Castro noted the sunset provision was still in the code, it was moved to the end of the session.

Chair Crampton agreed with the sunset clause and was glad to see the language was clear regarding intensification. There was no desire to allow an increase use of property given the opening that is provided by the statute. Noted the hours of 8 a.m. to 6 p.m. was reasonable. Chair Crampton was not clear on the definition of next to residences.

Mr. Castro responded almost every parking lot within the Town abuts residential uses.

Member Lindsay made some comments regarding inconsistencies in the wording, which concerns her. She believes the Town Attorney needs to make sure the language is consistent, what is allowed, and the intent.

Mr. Castro responded, the way the Town of Palm Beach Code reads today, states the businesses can only have supplemental parking, but only if they have all the required parking first. None of the existing businesses in the Town have all of the required parking, which is required in the code. There needed to be an exception provided in the code. Mr. Castro explained the way in which it was intended to read is that you can have supplemental offsite parking for an existing use, without having the required parking onsite first. Mr. Castro stated what staff was trying to say was the business does not have to have all of the onsite parking to do supplemental offsite parking. As a permitted use, however, there is a provision in the code, as well, which says the business cannot expand or intensify the use using supplemental parking. If the business wanted to expand, it would not be supplemental parking it would be required parking. He explained the difference between supplemental and offsite parking.

Mr. Boodheshwar stated the way in which the code is presently written gives individuals the ability to do business with someone who owns a lot and wants to sell spaces. There may be situations where an entity wants to buy some spaces for their employees. The code needs to be modified to allow the entity to go and rent out spaces. Instead of individual transactions there would be only one transaction.

Mr. Castro agreed, and stated without having Council approval. Today the business is required to get special exception approval, if not they are non-compliant.

Chair Crampton stated the Town wanted to make that a matter of right. Mr. Castro responded, the Town is making all supplemental offsite parking a matter of right. But, he stated, there with a caveat, if there was a need to intensify use or create a new use that is required more parking the business would need to come before Council to receive approval.

Member Lindsay stated the language needed to be tweaked.

Public Comment: None

Motion was made by Chairman Crampton to make a recommendation to have the Town Attorney review the language and clean up any ambiguity and expand the ordinance to include offsite lots. Motion seconded by Member Lindsay. On roll call, the Motion passed unanimously.

- C. Discussion regarding. (1) Hours of Enforcement, (2) Maximum Hours Permitted in Paid Parking Areas, (3) Seasonal Parking Regulations, (4) Completion of Evening Hours Parking Study

Jay Boodheshwar, Deputy Town Manager

Mr. Boodheshwar stated this item was included to begin a conversation regarding the work plan for the committee. He suggested that they continue the conversation regarding commercial areas although at some point it will also include residential parking. Mr. Boodheshwar suggested the following items for further discussion: Hours of enforcement in paid and time limited free parking areas, Maximum time permitted for purchase in paid parking areas, Discussion of implementation of seasonal parking regulations, Completion of evening hours parking study. Mr. Boodheshwar provided a spreadsheet with the parking enforcement and time limits information Mr. Boodheshwar stated the hours of parking enforcement varied throughout the Town. He noted some streets are “enforced” 24/7, while others are limited to Monday – Saturday for partial hours each day. The Parking Enforcement Unit works seven days a week, year-round. Three (3) full-time (FTE) employees are approved for this unit (we currently have 1 vacancy), which is supported by four (4) contracted positions (we currently have 2 vacancies). Parking Enforcement works from 7:00 a.m. to 10:00 p.m. everyday. Parking Enforcement also serves as school crossing guards, averaging 153 hours per year to fulfill those duties. In addition, they averaged 499 hours directing traffic and 114 providing escorts. Mr. Boodheshwar stated there was a limit to the maximum number of hours which could be purchased in a paid parking area. The hours to be purchased vary from 2 hours up to 12 hours.

Member Lindsay stated she would like to begin the conversation, but she does not feel comfortable in making a recommendation. Stated she supports staff and understands there should be time limits. She encouraged consistency at the beach in the Midtown area. Noted, there has always been free one and two hour parking on Chilean and on the 200 block. She would like to see a more defined program.

Chair Crampton agreed. Commented some of focus should be on beach parking and time limits, homeowner’s issues and neighborhood behavior. Phipps Park is isolated, but if the Town was going to allow 24 hour parking, there needs to be a conversation.

Mr. Boodheshwar noted this conversation is helpful. There should be consistency within the block.

Member Lindsay indicated the enforcement should be consistent.

Chair Crampton stated staff has been given some direction on how to proceed with the time as well

as the enforcement which is the key. There needed to be signage as well.

Mr. Boodheshwar responded staff will produce a report for presentation at a future meeting with a set of recommendations which will address hours of enforcement and address maximum times to be purchased.

Public Comment

Warren Belmar, 130 Sunrise Avenue, agreed with Chair Crampton to identify the problem before trying to impose a solution, if we are trying to normalize the rate and the hours. Please look at the Sunrise Avenue hours, he believes it is the only place in Town that goes from 6 a.m. to 10 p.m. Requested to harmonize this area as well.

Member Lindsay responded there was an issue with the Airbnb Hotel and the Palm Beach Hotel and the parking which takes place there. Many of the people will park for free all night.

Mr. Belmar stated he looks out the window, he does not see what was stated. He does not see people parking on the street who have rented the Airbnb as a bad thing. But, if this is something the Town was trying to discourage, he understood. Commented by doing this the Town is impacting all of the residents on that street, there are at least 240 units. Noted if the reasoning behind having the time set from 6 a.m. to 10 p.m. is to disadvantage people staying at the hotel, he said he was not in agreement as being the motivation for impacting everyone else.

Member Lindsay stated this was an issue which was raised. The residents did not have any available parking.

Chair Crampton stated the issues have been explored.

Mr. Boodheshwar indicated the next item for discussion was related to seasonal parking regulations and Parking Utilization Study. Staff intends to conduct a Parking Utilization Study during the evening hours of the off-season and peak season to assist in potential changes to the enforcement days and hours of existing regulations. Staff would like the BAC's input relative to the parameters of said study, including which months should be included and what time periods. Looking for two data points for time. Suggested 7 p.m. and the other 9 p.m., the off-peak in September then waiting until January or February to the peak season study.

Member Lindsay stated there is a different clientele in the evening versus during the day.

Mr. Boodheshwar responded he will work with staff to put together a program and prepare information over a couple of months, and submit to the BAC.

Mr. Boodheshwar stated the last issue was, should the Town of Palm Beach consider seasonal parking regulations. He explained during the off-season the Town has one type of regulation and during the peak season, when there is higher demand the Town would have another type of

regulation. Mr. Boodheshwar stated this does exist in other communities that has a seasonal nature.

Chair Crampton and Member Lindsay were in agreement to explore seasonal regulations.

Mr. Boodheshwar noted all items which were recommended will be advanced to the August 10, 2021 Town Council meeting.

B. ANY OTHER MATTERS - *None*

C. ADJOURNMENT

The Business and Administrative Committee Meeting was adjourned at 11:33a.m. by Motion made by Member Lindsay and seconded by Chair Crampton. On roll call, the Motion passed unanimously.

Lewis S.W. Crampton, Chair

Queenester Nieves, CMC, Town Clerk

Date