

Appendix 1

Timeline of Events – Palm Beach Hotel Garbage Collection, Chester Purves, Services Division Manger

January 11, 2013: Staff met with Dr. Nassar regarding damage sustained to her fence when the collection crews transported the dumpster from the trash room (directly behind her property) at the Hotel to the garbage truck on Park Avenue. At this time, Dr. Nassar expressed her displeasure with the commercial garbage collection occurring on a residential street and the disruption it caused. Chester Purves concluded the meeting by agreeing to take steps to prevent future damage to her property and to minimize the disruption.

Staff looked into alternative service access locations from all four sides of the hotel property and was unable to find one that would accommodate all of the service criteria needed to successfully service the two (2) cubic yard dumpster for the hotel. Since the service location could not be changed, we implemented improvements to the current location and process. Those improvements and changes included widening and repaving the alley surface, installing a curb, and requiring that two (2) employees must transport the dumpster from the trash room to the truck and back.

These changes to procedures and the site conditions improved the noise disruption and eliminated all future incidents relating to damage to Dr. Nassar's property. At this point, it appeared the issue of damage was eliminated and disruption was minimized. No further action at that time.

December 12, 2018: On this date, Patrick Ohannessian, a resident of Park Avenue directly across from the Hotel access alley, contacted the Public Works Director to discuss his displeasure of the collection process and its disruption and safety issues it is causing. Chester Purves was asked to look into Patrick's concerns.

January 11, 2019: Staff reviewed the concerns, and implemented changes to procedures, collection times, and repairs to the equipment that was allowing garbage spillage. Parallel to these concerns, Mr. Ohannessian requested that the garbage generated by the Hotel should be collected from Sunrise Avenue. Mr. Ohannessian was told that this was looked into previously and the alley was the only viable access, however, staff would look into it again.

January 15, 2019: Staff met with the Hotel property manager, Mr. Perez, to review the site layout and look for potential access locations for garbage collection service. Since our previous investigation into service access in 2013, a service gate and fence was installed on the southeast corner of the property. This installation now provided sufficient access to the service garbage collection for the Hotel. Mr. Perez agreed to present this new service location to the HOA president and others who would ultimately make a decision. Several requests to Mr. Perez for an update on the Board decision were sent and on March 14, 2019 Mr. Perez agreed to meet only to let me know that he was not in the position to make decisions. We would need to get on a Board Meeting agenda in April or May.

March 25, 2019: A certified letter was sent to Mr. Perez requiring compliance with the Public Works Director's request to make the necessary provisions to collect the garbage from Sunrise Avenue. Michael Arendt, Community Association Board of Directors President, was copied on this correspondence. On April 1, 2019, Mr. Arendt contacted the Public Works Director acknowledging the letter and agreeing to work toward a solution.

April 19, 2019: A meeting was held between Public Works and Hotel representatives. A site visit was conducted and discussions regarding an alternative to service locations and procedures were discussed. At this point, it was agreed upon that Sunday service from Park Avenue would be stopped. The Association attorney reached out requesting a meeting to review the meeting topics and to develop a plan.

April 29, 2019: A meeting was set up between Public Works and Mr. Neil Schiller, attorney representing the Hotel. The following below, in italics, is a copy of the email sent to Mr. Schiller outlining our meeting:

Neil- thanks again for the meeting at our office Monday. I discussed your proposal that we spoke about on the phone with Mr. Brazil and he is receptive to the idea of the curbside residential garbage collection on Park Avenue as a trial. The following are bullet points identifying the component of the waste collection process for the Palm Beach Hotel.

- PBH has identified the residential waste stream and will be disposing of it separately from the commercial waste. Garbage will be placed in individual wheeled containers designed for semi-automated collection. Recycling will be placed in the blue and yellow containers provided by the town.*
- Residential garbage will be collected Monday, Tuesday, Thursday and Friday. Recycling collection will take place on Wednesday. PBH staff will place the containers curbside, on Park Avenue for town staff to collect. After service has been performed, PBH staff will retrieve the containers from the right of way.*
- Commercial garbage will be collected 7 days per week. Town staff will retrieve the dumpster from the walkway on the northeast corner of the property and wheel it to the truck utilizing the loading zone on Sunrise Avenue. After service is performed, staff will return the dumpster back to the location. Commercial recycling will take place on Tuesday for the yellow containers and Wednesday for the blue containers. Service procedures and locations for commercial recycling will follow the same as commercial garbage.*

The implementation date for this procedural change will take effect on May 6th, 2019.

May 8, 2019: Chester Purves was contacted by Mr. Ohannessian and advised that the terms of the trial process that was negotiated between the Town and the Hotel was not acceptable and he requested to meet. A meeting date never materialized and, at this point, the topic went dormant.

August 23, 2019: Mr. Ohannessian contacted the Deputy Town Manager and requested to meet on site to hear the concerns of those in the neighbor. In attendance at the meeting was Dr. Nasser, Mr. Ohannessian, Jay Boodeshwar, Chester Purves, and an unknown resident. We discussed the history of the concern dating back to 2013, the steps made to improve the situation, and Mr. Ohannessian's main objective of eliminating the Hotels service from Park Avenue.

September 11, 2019: The Public Works Director updated Jay Boodheshwar on his standing that the service location for commercial garbage is on Sunrise Avenue and residential on Park Avenue, as discussed in the April 29, 2019 meeting.

September 16, 2019: The Services Division Manager instructed Town collection crews to return emptied containers to the entrance to the trash room. This was done to assist the Hotel staff getting the cans out of sight as early as possible to appease the neighbors.

September 17, 2019: I emailed Mr. Ohannessian and advised him of the changes made to the process and reiterated that the compromise made was fair for both the Hotel and the residents of Park Avenue. Shortly after that, Mr. Ohannessian began contacting Town Council members and the Mayor to dispute the Director's recommendation of the collection point.