

## TOWN OF PALM BEACH planning, zoning and building department

## MINUTES OF THE REGULAR ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMISSION MEETING HELD ON WEDNESDAY, JULY 24, 2019

Please be advised that in keeping with a recent directive from the Town Council, the minutes of all Town Boards and Commissions will be "abbreviated" in style. Persons interested in listening to the meeting, after the fact, may access the audio of that item via the Town's website at <u>www.townofpalmbeach.com</u>.

## I. CALL TO ORDER

Vice Chair Small called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m.

## II. ROLL CALL

Robert J. Vila, Chairman Michael B. Small, Vice Chairman Robert N. Garrison, Member Alexander C. Ives, Member Maisie Grace, Member John David Corey, Member Nikita Zukov, Member Betsy Shiverick, Alternate Member Katherine Catlin, Alternate Member Dan Floersheimer, Alternate Member

ABSENT (unexcused) PRESENT PRESENT PRESENT PRESENT ABSENT (unexcused) PRESENT PRESENT ABSENT (unexcused) PRESENT

Please note: It was noted that Ms. Shiverick and Mr. Floersheimer would be voting in the absence of Messrs. Vila and Corey.

Staff Members present were: Josh Martin, Director of Planning, Zoning and Building Kelly Churney, Secretary to the Architectural Review Commission

- III. <u>PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE</u> Vice Chair Small led the Pledge of Allegiance.
- IV. <u>APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES FROM THE JUNE 26, 2019 MEETING</u> Motion made by Mr. Garrison and seconded by Mr. Ives to approve the minutes from the June 26, 2019 meeting. Motion carried unanimously.

## V. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Mr. Small asked the Commission to defer project B-038-2019, 445 N. Lake Way and B-039-2019, 341 Eden Rd. to the August 28, 2019 meeting. He also requested that A-022-2019, 321 Brazilian Avenue be removed from the agenda, as it was staff approved by the Director of Planning, Zoning and Building.

Motion made by Mr. Garrison and seconded by Mr. Ives to approve the agenda as amended. Motion carried unanimously.

- VI. <u>ADMINSTRATION OF THE OATH TO PERSONS WHO WISH TO TESTIFY</u> Ms. Churney administered the oath at this time and throughout the meeting as necessary.
- VII. <u>COMMUNICATIONS FROM CITIZENS REGARDING NON-AGENDA ITEMS</u> (3 MINUTE LIMIT PLEASE) There were no public comments heard at this time.

### VIII. COMMENTS FROM THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION MEMBERS

Mr. Small thanked the Staff for ARCOM tour in which the Commission participated. He also thanked Mr. Martin for the Process Improvement Initiative Workshop at the Sailfish Club.

Mr. Garrison concurred and thought the tour was helpful. He reflected on a project where the side yard was reduced at the request of the Commission and as a result, the garage space was now ineffective. He also spoke on the issue of elevating homes to meet the FEMA requirements. Mr. Garrison also discussed how the raising of the structures could have a negative effect on the street as well as the adjacent neighbors.

Ms. Grace expressed a concern that some discussion details were being left out of the minutes. Mr. Martin addressed Ms. Grace's concern. Ms. Churney stated that if she were made aware of the missing details, she would be happy to add them before the approval of the minutes.

### IX. **PROJECT REVIEW**

### A. <u>DEMOLITIONS AND TIME EXTENSIONS</u>

B-047-2019 Demolition Address: 133 Gulfstream Rd. Applicant: Anero LLC Professional: Jeffrey Silberstein/Silberstein Architecture Project Description: Demolition of existing dwelling and swimming pool/spa.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Mr. Silberstein presented the demolition report for the existing home and requested the demolition of the existing dwelling, landscape and hardscape.

Ms. Shiverick stated that the street was beginning to change in a positive way. She requested that the new architecture be in keeping with the new homes on the street.

Motion made by Mr. Zukov and seconded by Mr. Ives that the proposed demolition of 133 Gulfstream Road has met the conditions listed in Sec. 18-206 of the Town's Code of Ordinances, and to approve the project as presented with the caveat to sod and irrigate the property within 30 days and all elements on the property are to be maintained prior to demolition, with the items remaining after demolition to be maintained until new construction commences. Motion carried 6-1 with Mr. Garrison opposed.

Mr. Small asked if the owner would dedicate and record a utility easement or enter into an agreement ensuring said easement, if necessary, to facilitate utility undergrounding in the area. Mr. Silberstein agreed to the easement.

This application was approved with the condition that prior to the issuance of a building permit, the applicant shall either dedicate and record a utility easement, or enter into an agreement ensuring said easement, if necessary to facilitate utility undergrounding in the area.

### B-046-2019 Demolition

Address: 1473 N. Lake Way Applicant: Nicholas Coleman Professional: MHK Architecture & Planning Project Description: Demolition of existing one story house and existing hardscape.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Caroline Forrest, MHK Architecture & Planning, presented the proposed demolition of the existing residence and reviewed the demolition report for the property.

Don Skowron, Don Skowron Incorporated, reviewed the plans for the landscape and hardscape relating to the proposed demolition.

Mr. Floersheimer inquired about the proposed perimeter planting. Mr. Skowron responded.

Ms. Shiverick inquired about the plan for the proposed lot. Ms. Forrest responded and discussed the potential outcomes for the property.

Mr. Floersheimer asked if the owner would be obtaining a unity of title. Ms. Forrest explained the owner's intent for the properties.

Mr. Small asked the professionals if they were aware of the constructionscreening requirement during demolition as well as inquired if the property had their utilities undergrounded. Ms. Forrest stated there was an existing easement for FPL.

Allison Brown, 1465 Laurie Lane, requested an eradication of rodents prior to demolition, expressed concern for the maintenance of the lot after the demolition and was glad to hear about the use of the lot after demolition.

Motion made by Mr. Garrison and seconded by Mr. Zukov that the proposed demolition of 1473 N. Lake Way has met the conditions listed in Sec. 18-206 of the Town's Code of Ordinances, and to approve the project as presented with the following caveats: sod and irrigate the property within 30 days and all elements on the property are to be maintained prior to demolition, with the items remaining after demolition to be maintained until new construction commences. Motion carried unanimously.

Mr. Garrison raised the concern about lots that Ms. Brown referenced. Mr. Martin stated he would investigate the concerns.

#### B-053-2019 Demolition

Address: 220 Brazilian Ave. Applicant: PBROC Limited Partnership Professional: Andres Paradelo/Paradelo Burgess Design Studio Project Description: Seeking approval to demolish the existing structure, any existing hardscape surfaces, and all existing vegetation.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Mr. Paradelo reviewed the plans for the landscape and hardscape relating to the proposed demolition as well as the construction-screening plan.

Mr. Small asked if the owner would dedicate and record a utility easement or enter into an agreement ensuring said easement, if necessary, to facilitate utility undergrounding in the area. Mr. Paradelo agreed to the easement.

Ms. Grace asked about the proposed fencing during the demolition. Mr. Paradelo further explained the plan.

Mr. Ives expressed a concern for the proposed demolition.

Robert Andrew Roddy, owner of adjacent landmarked property at 332 S. County Rd., asked for a substantial debris fence on the east side of the property for protection during demolition.

Mr. Small asked the professional if he would be willing to install a 10-foot black fence on the east side of his property as well maintain the vegetation on the east side during demolition. Mr. Paradelo agreed to the conditions.

Motion made by Mr. Garrison that the proposed demolition of 220 Brazilian Avenue has met the conditions listed in Sec. 18-206 of the Town's Code of Ordinances, and to approve the project as presented with the following caveats: a 10-foot fabric screen is installed on the entire east side of the property, the landscaping to be removed, sod and irrigate the property within 30 days and all elements on the property are to be maintained prior to demolition, with the items remaining after demolition to be maintained until new construction commences.

Ms. Grace inquired if other screening would be installed on the other side of the property. Mr. Paradelo stated that there would be other screening on the property boarders.

Dragana Connaughton, 226 Brazilian Avenue, expressed concern for the west side of the property. She requested that screening be installed and expressed concern for the landscaping on the west side of the property.

Motion amended by Mr. Garrison and seconded by Mr. Zukov that the proposed demolition of 220 Brazilian Avenue has met the conditions listed in Sec. 18-206 of the Town's Code of Ordinances, and to approve the project as presented with the following caveats: a 10-foot fabric screen is installed on the entire east and west sides of the property, the landscaping is to be removed on the east side, the landscaping will remain on the west side, sod and irrigate the property within 30 days and all elements on the property are to be maintained prior to demolition, with the items remaining after demolition to be maintained until new construction commences. Motion carried 6-1 with Mr. Ives opposed. This application was approved with the condition that prior to the issuance of a building permit, the applicant shall either dedicate and record a utility easement, or enter into an agreement ensuring said easement, if necessary to facilitate utility undergrounding in the area.

#### B-054-2019 Time Extension

Address: 261 Nightingale Trail Applicant: Jeffrey A. Cole Trust Professional: Ralph Cantin Architect, Inc. Project Description: Time extension for B-061-2019, 261 Nightingale Trail – new one-story home, landscape and hardscape.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Mr. Small stated he thought that the plans he reviewed seemed to have changed since the prior approval. He asked the professional if anything had changed since the prior approval. Mr. Cantin stated the plans presented was what had been approved by the Commission.

Motion made by Mr. Garrison and seconded by Mr. Ives that the proposed project at 261 Nightingale Trail has met the conditions listed in Sec. 18-205 of the Town's Code of Ordinances, and to approve the project as presented. Motion carried unanimously.

## **B.** <u>MAJOR PROJECTS – OLD BUSINESS</u>

B-036-2019 New Construction

cabana and pool.

\*ARCOM TO MAKE RECOMMENDATIONS RELATIVE TO SPECIAL EXCEPTION WITH SITE PLAN REVIEW AND VARIANCE(S)\* - Done 5/29/19 Address: 205 Via Tortuga Applicant: Dan and Karen Swanson Professional: Jonathan C. Moore/Smith and Moore Architects, Inc. Project Description: New two-story French Style home with four car garage, pool

A motion carried at the May meeting to approve the architectural portion of the project with the following conditions: the changes shown for the main entrance and windows, using natural stone rather than cast stone, using a lighter shade color for the roof, to readdress the number of lanterns proposed for the new residence. The motion also included a deferral of the landscape and hardscape plans with the conditions that the professionals readdress the number of lanterns, to return with details for the gate design and with the stone material. A motion carried at the June meeting to approve the landscape and hardscape as presented with the caveat that the applicant would return to the next meeting with a sample of the stone proposed for the trim on the residence as well as the material for the sundeck.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Mr. Swanson spoke about his investigation into stone material for the new proposed residence.

Mr. Small asked Mr. Swanson to review the locations of the stone on the proposed residence. Mr. Swanson reviewed the home and pointed out the locations of where stone would be used.

Mr. Swanson reviewed several samples of the stone material and presented them to the Commission. Mr. Swanson advocated for the use of cast stone or to be allowed to paint the cast stone versus using the natural stone.

Mr. Small inquired about the material for the sundeck. Mr. Swanson presented the natural material proposed for the pool deck.

Ms. Grace stated that natural stone was a quality material and thought it would be more appropriate for the proposed home. She discussed the reasons she preferred the natural stone.

Ms. Shiverick stated she agreed with Ms. Grace. Ms. Shiverick thought the natural stone looked better and was more befitting of the proposed home.

Mr. Garrison stated he would support using a cast stone with more character or a natural stone but would oppose painting of any stone.

Mr. Zukov agreed with Mr. Garrison and stated the cast stone on the new recreation building as well as the new Testa's site would be acceptable. However, he added that painting the stone would not be acceptable.

Mr. Small agreed with Messrs. Zukov and Garrison. Mr. Small stated he would also support a cast stone similar to the material on the new commercial project on Royal Poinciana Way.

Motion made by Ms. Grace and Ms. Shiverick that the proposed project at 205 Via Tortuga has met the conditions listed in Sec. 18-205 of the Town's Code of Ordinances, and to approve the project with the use of a natural stone for the home and the sundeck material presented. Motion carried 4-3 with Messrs. Zukov, Garrison and Small opposed.

Mr. Garrison asked if the applicant would be returning to the Commission to present the natural stone.

A discussion ensued about whether the applicant should return to the Commission.

A second motion made by Ms. Grace to allow the natural stone material to be staff approved. Motion failed for a lack of the second.

A second motion made by Mr. Ives and seconded by Ms. Shiverick that the owner will return to the August 28, 2019 meeting with a sample of the natural stone to be used on the residence. Motion carried unanimously.

Mr. Swanson asked about the future use of cast stone in Palm Beach. Ms. Grace stated it would depend on the project.

A discussion continued about the natural stone.

### B-038-2019 New Construction

Address: 445 N. Lake Way Applicant: Green Buttonwood, LLC (Julie McDermott) Professional: Harold Smith/Smith and Moore Architects, Inc. Project Description: Construction of a new two-story Georgian style residence with pool. Final hardscape and landscape.

A motion carried at the June meeting to approve the project as presented with the caveat that the professional return in one month after restudying the second floor of the carriage house, the gates and the lanterns.

# Please note: The item was deferred to the August 28, 2019 meeting with the approval of the agenda, Item V.

### B-039-2019 New Construction

Address: 341 Eden Rd. Applicant: Mike Belisle Professional: Patrick Segraves/SKA Architect + Planner Project Description: New construction of two-story Prairie style home to be approximately 6,200 sq. ft. Final landscaping/hardscaping to be included.

A motion carried at the June meeting to defer the project to the July 24, 2019 meeting to allow the professionals to restudy the design.

# Please note: The item was deferred to the August 28, 2019 meeting with the approval of the agenda, Item V.

#### B-040-2019 Demolition/New Construction

\*ARCOM TO MAKE RECOMMENDATIONS RELATIVE TO VARIANCE(S)\* - Done 6/26/19 Address: 307 Chilean Ave. Applicant: Justin Besikof Professional: Patrick Segraves/SKA Architect + Planner Project Description: Demolition of existing two-story building. New two-story Contemporary Classic style home to be approximately 3,800 square feet. Home will consist of four bedrooms, five and one half bathrooms, living room, tv lounge, dining room, kitchen, family room, laundry, loggia(s) and one car garage. Final landscape/hardscape will be provided.

A motion carried at the June meeting that implementation of the proposed variance will not cause negative architectural impact to the subject property. A second motion carried to defer the project to the July 24, 2019 meeting to allow the professionals to restudy the design.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Mr. Segraves read the demolition report for the existing two-story building in the record. He then presented the proposed demolition for the existing two-story building.

Matt Jackman, Nievera Williams Design, presented the proposed demolition for the landscape and hardscape material.

Mr. Martin stated that with the approval of the proposed demolition, the four-unit residential building would become a single-family residence.

Mr. Small asked if the owner would dedicate and record a utility easement or enter into an agreement ensuring said easement, if necessary, to facilitate utility undergrounding in the area. Mr. Segraves agreed to the easement.

Motion made by Mr. Floersheimer and seconded by Mr. Garrison that the proposed demolition of 307 Chilean Avenue has met the conditions listed in Sec. 18-206 of the Town's Code of Ordinances, and to approve the demolition as presented with the caveat to sod and irrigate the property within 30 days and all elements on the property are to be maintained prior to demolition, with the items remaining after demolition to be maintained until new construction commences. Motion carried 4-3 with Mses. Shiverick, Grace and Mr. Ives opposed. This application was approved with the condition that prior to the issuance of a building permit, the applicant shall either dedicate and record a utility easement, or enter into an agreement ensuring said easement, if necessary to facilitate utility undergrounding in the area.

Mr. Segraves presented the proposed architectural modifications for the new residence.

Daniel Clavijo, SKA Architect + Planner, presented the proposed colors for the new residence.

Mr. Zukov asked why the surrounds on the windows had become thinner. Mr. Clavijo explained the design of the surround and the reason for the reduction.

Ms. Grace thought the style of the home needed to be funkier. She also thought the new design should mimic the existing residence in a more cottage style. She suggested making changes to allow the proposed home to have an individualistic style.

Mr. Garrison expressed concern for fill needed for the lot. He asked about the elevations of the homes on the adjacent lots.

Mr. Segraves discussed the elevation of the neighboring lots and stated that he spoke to the neighbor on the east that would have a lower lot. Mr. Jackman explained the landscape and hardscape plan for the east side of the lot.

Ms. Shiverick expressed concern for the multi-family home that would be demolished, especially since the existing home had a lot of character. She agreed with Ms. Grace that the house needed a more individualistic style.

Mr. Ives stated he was not in favor of the demolition but respected the new owner's wishes. He thought the proposed home was respectable.

Ms. Grace wished that the professional would change the design so that it appeared more charming.

Mr. Jackman presented the proposed modifications for the landscape and hardscape plans.

### Motion made by Mr. Ives and seconded by Mr. Zukov that the proposed project at 307 Chilean Avenue has met the conditions listed in Sec. 18-205 of the Town's Code of Ordinances, and to approve the project as presented. Motion carried 5-2 with Mr. Garrison and Ms. Grace opposed.

Mr. Segraves expressed concern for the lack of materials submitted in the previously approved demolition applications. Mr. Martin stated he would follow up with Mr. Segraves on his concern.

Mr. Martin commented on the streetscape shown during the 307 Chilean Avenue presentation. He stated that, in his opinion, the Town's current zoning code does not aim to preserve Palm Beach.

### B-042-2019 Modifications

Address: 430 N. Lake Way Applicant: Frances Levy Professional: Mario Nievera/Nievera Williams Design Project Description: Addition of driveway gate.

A motion carried at the June meeting to defer the project to the July 24, 2019 meeting to allow the professionals to restudy the design.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Jedidiah Hall, Nievera Williams Design, presented the modifications to the proposed vehicular gate.

Mr. Floersheimer was not in favor of the new gate design.

Ms. Grace stated she preferred the open gate design.

# Motion made by Ms. Grace and seconded by Mr. Zukov that the proposed project at 430 N. Lake Way has met the conditions listed in Sec. 18-205 of the

Town's Code of Ordinances, and to approve the project as presented. Motion carried 5-2, with Ms. Shiverick and Mr. Floersheimer opposed.

*Please note: A short break was taken at 10:31 a.m. The meeting resumed at 10:43 a.m.* 

## C. MAJOR PROJECTS – NEW BUSINESS

<u>B-027-2019 Demolition/New Construction</u> Address: 1485 Via Manana Applicant: Jason and Josephine Kalisman Professional: Daniel Kahan/Smith and Moore Architects Project Description: Demolition of existing residence. New two-story residence, which will serve as a guesthouse and pavilion for the main house at 1480 North Ocean Boulevard. Final landscape and hardscape.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Mr. Small stated that an additional presentation was received from Daniel Kahan. He raised the question to Mr. Martin whether the Commission should consider the project with the new information. A short discussion ensued about whether the project should be deferred or considered.

Julie Araskog, 1490 Via Manana, felt the east façade changes were not minor and that the project should be deferred. She also stated she had reached out to the neighbors to try to work with the neighbors did not get a return phone call.

Mr. Ives thought the changes were minor and that they should be considered during the presentation.

Mr. Floersheimer agreed with Mr. Ives and thought the changes were minor.

Mr. Garrison agreed but thought the Commission should proceed on the side of caution. He thought the demolition should be heard and the architecture should be deferred. Mr. Zukov agreed with Mr. Garrison.

Ms. Grace stated she would proceed to hear the demolition and provide feedback on the architecture but questioned the general process of hearing last minute changes at the meeting.

Mr. Floersheimer thought it would be helpful for the Commission to see the architectural plans and to obtain feedback from the affected neighbor.

Ms. Araskog reiterated her objections.

A short discussion ensued about how much of the project should be presented and considered.

Mr. Kahan presented the demolition report for the existing residence and the request to demolish the existing residence.

Mr. Small asked if the owner would dedicate and record a utility easement or enter into an agreement ensuring said easement, if necessary, to facilitate utility undergrounding in the area. Mr. Kahan agreed to the easement.

Mr. Kahan then presented the landscape and hardscape plans for the proposed demolition.

Ms. Grace asked about the landscaping to remain after the demolition, particularly on the west side. Mr. Kahan responded and stated the landscaping on the west side would not be able to be saved.

Mr. Small inquired about the access for the demolition. Mr. Kahan stated he believed the access would be on Manana Lane.

Mr. Floersheimer stated that the undergrounding had been completed in the area and the easement request was unnecessary.

Ms. Araskog expressed concern for the trees on the cul-de-sac and requested that the trucks enter the lot from Manana Lane. She also requested that tall landscape screening, 10-feet, to be installed prior to demolition. She requested a condition to state that trucks would not be allowed on the on the cul-de-sac.

Mr. Ives asked Mr. Kahan if he accepted all of the requests by Ms. Araskog. Mr. Kahan agreed to all conditions.

Motion made by Mr. Ives and seconded by Mr. Zukov that the proposed demolition of 1485 Via Manana has met the conditions listed in Sec. 18-206 of the Town's Code of Ordinances, and to approve the demolition request as presented with the following caveats: a 10-foot fabric screen is installed on the entire sides of the property, there will be no trucks on the cul-de-sac, to protect the trees on the cul-de-sac, sod and irrigate the property within 30 days and all elements on the property are to be maintained prior to demolition, with the items remaining after demolition to be maintained until new construction commences. Motion carries unanimously.

Mr. Kahan inquired if he could present his project without any of the changes that he handed to the Commissioners. Mr. Small stated he could do that and the Commission would be able to vote on the project. Mr. Kahan stated he would like to proceed with the presentation, disregarding any new changes.

Mr. Kahan presented the architectural plans proposed for the new residence.

Ms. Grace thought the house was attractive and liked the way it interacted from the interior courtyard. She questioned its appearance from the cul-de-sac. Ms. Grace inquired if there was a unity of title for the two lots. Mr. Kahan stated that there was not a unity of title. Ms. Grace expressed concern for the look of the home as a stand-alone home, especially for the view on the cul-de-sac. Mr. Kahan responded. Ms. Grace requested more windows and design on the façade that faces the cul-de-sac. Mr. Kahan responded.

Mr. Ives stated he was not concern that the lots were not combined. Mr. Ives thought the design was nice and well executed.

Mr. Garrison thought the interior lot line should be addressed with landscaping as separate properties. He expressed concern that there was no sense of entry from the courtyard. Mr. Garrison asked the professional to address the interior lot separation. Mr. Kahan replied and discussed the items that would need to be addressed should be property be sold.

Ms. Shiverick thought the design was complimentary and looked like a fun home for a family. She asked if the materials were the same or similar to the primary home. Mr. Kahan responded and confirmed the materials were similar. Ms. Shiverick was in favor of the details of the home. Ms. Shiverick added that she did not have a problem with the proposed door on the cul-de-sac.

Ms. Grace asked the Commission to consider if the two properties were too similar in their design. She related the lots to a previous project that the Commission considered on Seabreeze Avenue.

Mr. Small stated if he looked at this home as a stand-alone home, he did not feel the west façade was acceptable.

Ms. Araskog entered three items into the record. She expressed her concerns for the proposed project. She requested that the Commission defer the project to allow the neighbors to work with the professional.

Mr. Ives questioned how the proposed home could be too similar and dissimilar at the same time. He thought the home was nicely sited on the lot.

Mr. Garrison agreed with Mr. Small's comment regarding the single-family house versus two homes with a unity of title.

Ms. Grace thought the home needed a nicer entry on the west façade.

Mr. Floersheimer thought the architecture as a single family home was a successful. He stated he did not have a problem with the proposed front entry.

Ms. Shiverick thought that with some slight modifications to appease some neighbors, the home would be successful.

Motion made by Ms. Grace and seconded by Ms. Shiverick to defer the project for one month, to the August 28, 2019 meeting, to address some of the concerns raised by the Commissioners. Motion carried unanimously.

### **B-048-2019 Demolition/New Construction**

Address: 208 El Pueblo Way Applicant: Mr. & Mrs. Lawrie Professional: MP Design & Architecture Project Description: Demolition of existing residence. Proposed new two-story residence and guesthouse. New pool, hardscape & landscape.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Michael Perry, MP Design & Architecture, presented the demolition report and plans for the existing residence.

Mr. Small asked if the owner would dedicate and record a utility easement or enter into an agreement ensuring said easement, if necessary, to facilitate utility undergrounding in the area. Mr. Perry agreed to the easement.

Matt Jackman, Nievera Williams Design, presented the proposed demolition for the landscape and hardscape material.

Mr. Floersheimer inquired about the existing masonry wall. Mr. Jackman responded and stated the wall was not on the applicant's property.

Motion made by Mr. Garrison and seconded by Mr. Ives that the proposed demolition of 208 El Pueblo Way has met the conditions listed in Sec. 18-206 of the Town's Code of Ordinances, and to approve the demolition request as presented with the caveat to sod and irrigate the property within 30 days and all elements on the property are to be maintained prior to demolition, with the items remaining after demolition to be maintained until new construction commences. Motion carried unanimously. This application was approved with the condition that prior to the issuance of a building permit, the applicant shall either dedicate and record a utility easement, or enter into an agreement ensuring said easement, if necessary to facilitate utility undergrounding in the area.

Mr. Perry presented the architectural plans proposed for the new residence.

Mr. Garrison thought the house was stately and presented well on the site. He expressed a concern for the door that faces the driveway. Mr. Perry presented an alternate drawing on the overhead projector.

Mr. Perry stated he would work with the neighbor who expressed concerns in a letter received by the Town.

Ms. Grace expressed a concern for the long mass of the home. She asked the professional if he could make changes to ameliorate the mass of the home. She expressed concern for the dark shutters proposed and stated they looked stark. She also thought the home should be reconfigured to appear smaller and to fit into the area. Mr. Perry responded.

Ms. Shiverick thought the house was stately. Ms. Shiverick recommended using single outlookers versus the double proposed. She also recommended removing the cross pickets in the railings and reconsidering the color choices for the home.

Mr. Floersheimer asked about the request to increase the number of curb cuts. Mr. Martin stated that Public Works would make sure the curb cuts were compliant; however, the Commission would be responsible for the aesthetic design. Mr. Perry spoke about the design of the driveways proposed. Mr. Floersheimer thought the design dominated the streetscape and asked the professional if there was anything that could be changed to mitigate the height of the proposed home. Mr. Perry responded.

Ms. Grace stated she thought the height should be reduced.

Mr. Jackman presented the landscape and hardscape plans proposed for the new residence. Mr. Jackman presented an alternate design on the overhead projector.

Mr. Garrison was in favor of the landscape plan. He inquired if the professional was meeting the 25% native requirement. Mr. Jackman responded.

Mr. Floersheimer inquired if the professional would consider changing the Seagrape on the northwest corner to a Gumbo Limbo tree. Mr. Jackman agreed to the change.

Second motion made by Mr. Garrison and seconded by Mr. Zukov that the proposed project at 208 El Pueblo Way has met the conditions listed in Sec. 18-205 of the Town's Code of Ordinances, and to approve the project with the following caveats: the professional returns to the August 28, 2019 meeting with a different color palate, the revised elevations to reflect the changes to the door and windows, the revised elevations with the single outlookers, and the removal of the cross pickets in the railings. Motion carried unanimously.

*Please note: A short break was taken at 12:21 p.m. The meeting was resumed at 12:27 p.m.* 

<u>B-049-2019 Demolition/New Construction</u> Address: 214 Plantation Rd. Applicant: GW Purucker JV – Contract Purchaser Professional: MP Design & Architecture Project Description: Demolition of existing residence. Proposed new two-story residence. New pool, hardscape & landscape.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Michael Perry, MP Design & Architecture, presented the demolition report and plans for the existing residence.

Daniel Sugg, Sugg Design Studio, presented the proposed demolition for the landscape and hardscape material.

Mr. Small asked if the owner would dedicate and record a utility easement or enter into an agreement ensuring said easement, if necessary, to facilitate utility undergrounding in the area. Mr. Perry agreed to the easement.

Mr. Garrison asked the professional if he would agree to install a 10-foot screening fence to help with the dust and debris during the demolition. Mr. Perry agreed to the condition.

Motion made by Mr. Garrison and seconded by Mr. Zukov that the proposed demolition of 214 Plantation Way has met the conditions listed in Sec. 18-206 of the Town's Code of Ordinances, and to approve the demolition request as presented with the caveat to sod and irrigate the property within 30 days and all elements on the property are to be maintained prior to demolition, with the items remaining after demolition to be maintained until new construction commences and that a 10 foot construction screening fence is installed during the demolition. Motion carried unanimously. This application was approved with the condition that prior to the issuance of a building permit, the applicant shall either dedicate and record a utility easement, or enter into an agreement ensuring said easement, if necessary to facilitate utility undergrounding in the area.

Mr. Perry presented the architectural plans proposed for the new residence.

Ms. Grace was in favor of the color and the garage design. She expressed concern for the color proposed for the front door. Mr. Perry discussed the material to be used for the front door. Ms. Grace questioned the front entrance arch and columns as well as the different window designs and requested more uniformity in the fenestration.

Mr. Ives was generally in favor of the design. Mr. Ives questioned the roof design in one of the sections. Mr. Perry stated he spoke with Mr. Garrison about the design as well as the roofing professionals to make sure the design would work. Mr. Garrison presented a suggestion for the driveway, which would possibly eliminate a curb cut on the curve. Mr. Perry stated he would agree to restudy the suggestion. Mr. Garrison was in favor of the design.

Ms. Shiverick thought the house was charming. She was in favor of Mr. Garrison's suggestion to eliminate the curb cut. Ms. Shiverick suggested a different column at the front entrance. Mr. Perry agreed. Ms. Shiverick made a suggestion for the two square windows on the front façade. Mr. Perry stated he could make the windows longer and add the Bahama shutters to the windows.

Mr. Floersheimer questioned the proportions of the first and second floors. Mr. Perry responded. Mr. Floersheimer questioned the overall height of the home compared to the neighbor's home. Mr. Perry responded and provided the roof height.

Ms. Grace inquired about the small, circular window on the front façade. Mr. Perry responded and stated he could delete the window.

Ms. Shiverick suggested using a white door on the front entrance. Mr. Perry agreed to the white door.

Mr. Sugg presented the landscape and hardscape plans proposed for the new residence.

Ms. Grace inquired if the 25% native requirement was being met in the landscaping. Mr. Sugg presented an alternative plan on the overhead projector of to show the native plant material.

Mr. Floersheimer was in favor of the landscape and lighting plan presented.

Motion made by Ms. Grace and seconded by Mr. Garrison that the proposed project at 214 Plantation Road has met the conditions listed in Sec. 18-205 of the Town's Code of Ordinances and to approve the project with the following items returning to the August 28, 2019 meeting for approval: change the front door color to white, delete the circular window on the front façade, change the front entry columns, and change the second floor, square windows to elongated windows with Bahama shutters, and to reexamine the driveway configuration. Motion carried unanimously.

### **D.** <u>MINOR PROJECTS – OLD BUSINESS</u>

A-022-2019 Modifications

Address: 321 Brazilian Ave. Applicant: Yelvington Susan TR (Susan Yelvington) Professional: Stephen Roy/Roy and Posey Project Description: Exterior modifications to include: change in roof material, paint colors, window and door colors, soffit and outlookers, door and window surround modifications & light fixture replacement.

Please note: The item was removed from the agenda with the approval of the agenda, Item V.

### E. <u>MINOR PROJECTS – NEW BUSINESS</u>

<u>A-021-2019 Additions/Modifications</u> Address: 217 Bahama Lane Applicant: Sara McCann Professional: Roger Janssen/Dailey Janssen Architects, P.A. Project Description: A 5-foot addition off the east wall, adding approximately 200 s.f. providing more storage in master bedroom and 2<sup>nd</sup> bedroom and enlarging master bathroom. New landscaping including a new driveway, hardscape, landscape and pool.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Mr. Janssen presented the architectural plans for a proposed addition to the existing residence.

Mr. Jackman presented the proposed modifications to the existing landscape and hardscape. Mr. Jackman presented the planting plan that was omitted from the presentation. He placed the plan on the overhead projector.

Mr. Small asked if the owner would dedicate and record a utility easement or enter into an agreement ensuring said easement, if necessary, to facilitate utility undergrounding in the area. Mr. Janssen agreed to the easement.

Ms. Grace inquired about the change in the fenestration. Mr. Janssen stated the fenestration changes were staff approved. Ms. Grace questioned why the changes were not considered as a whole. A short discussion ensued about the changes.

Ms. Grace requested to see all of the proposed changes in one presentation.

Mr. Small questioned the change to the front door. Mr. Janssen stated that the door change was staff approved.

Motion by Ms. Grace and seconded by Ms. Shiverick to defer the proposed changes to the August 28, 2019 meeting. Motion carried 5-2, with Messrs. Garrison and Ives opposed.

<u>A-024-2019 Modifications</u> Address: 251 Worth Ave. Applicant: Jane Holzer Professional: Jeffrey Peterson Project Description: Non-illuminated letters and wall plaques.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Emily Lopez presented the modification to the existing store signs.

Mr. Small thought the existing sign was nice but the proposed was too brash.

Mr. Floersheimer questioned the need for three signs.

Mr. Ives asked for the size of the two signs on the side. Ms. Lopez responded with the size. Mr. Ives thought the sign on the top was fine but the signs on the side were too aggressive in size.

Ms. Grace thought the proposal was too strong.

Ms. Shiverick asked if the sign on the top was illuminated. Ms. Lopez said the sign was not illuminated. Ms. Shiverick thought the top sign was sufficient.

Mr. Garrison thought the two side plaques were too much.

Ms. Lopez asked the Commission how they felt if the plaques proposed for the sides were removed but the lettering remained.

The consensus of the Commission was that the side plaques was too much signage.

Motion made by Ms. Grace and seconded by Mr. Ives that the proposed project at 251 Worth Avenue has met the conditions listed in Sec. 18-205 of the Town's Code of Ordinances and to approve the single sign proposed over the front entrance with the elimination of the two side plaques. Motion carried 6-1, with Mr. Small opposed.

### A-025-2019 Modifications

Address: 266 Atlantic Ave. Applicant: Shari Wilson Professional: Hollyce Hoover/Goldin Solar Project Description: Installation of a roof mounted PV solar system.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Raphael Saladrigas, Studio SR, stated that he had realigned the solar panels after they submitted the plans, in the hopes that he could mitigate any views of the panels from the street. Mr. Small asked the Commission if they wanted to defer the project to the next meeting due to the confusion. The Commission decided to hear the project.

Mr. Saladrigas presented the new location for the proposed solar panels.

Mr. Ives complimented the project and thought the reorganization of the solar panels was successful. He stated he would support project.

Mr. Floersheimer did not believe the solar panels would change the look to the roof. He expressed concern for the west facing panels and questioned if they would be efficient.

Melissa Bolton, Goldin Solar, stated they preferred a southern facing location but thought the west facing would work.

Mr. Garrison asked about the maintenance program for the solar panels near the ocean. Ms. Bolton responded. Mr. Garrison stated he thought the motion should include a requirement of the owner to obtain the maintenance program.

Mr. Small thought the home stood out in its surroundings. He thought the proposed project would exacerbate the dissimilarity of the home and added that he could not support the project.

Ms. Grace asked about the late submittal of the proposed locations for the solar panels. Mr. Saladrigas responded. Ms. Grace inquired about the panels that would be seen from the street. Mr. Saladrigas responded.

Ms. Shiverick asked about the color of the proposed panels. Mr. Saladrigas responded.

Motion made by Mr. Ives and seconded by Ms. Shiverick that the proposed project at 266 Atlantic Avenue has met the conditions listed in Sec. 18-205 of the Town's Code of Ordinances and to approve the project as presented. Motion carried 4-3, with Messrs. Small, Garrison and Zukov opposed.

## X. <u>ADDITION COMMUNICATION FROM CITIZENS (3 MINUTE LIMIT</u> <u>PLEASE)</u>

There were no comments heard at this time.

## XI. <u>COMMENTS OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION AND DIRECTOR OF</u> <u>PLANNING, ZONING AND BUILDING DEPARTMENT</u>

A discussion ensued about the late submittals.

Ms. Grace questioned the checklist and whether staff reviewed it after it was submitted. Mr. Martin stated he would look into this issue.

## XII. <u>ADJOURNMENT</u>

Motion made by Ms. Grace and seconded by Mr. Floersheimer to adjourn the meeting at 1:34 p.m. Motion carried unanimously.

The next meeting will be held on Wednesday, August 28, 2019 at 9:00 a.m. in the Town Council Chambers, 2nd floor, Town Hall, 360 S County Rd.

Respectfully Submitted,

Michael B. Small, Vice Chairman ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION

kmc