

### TOWN OF PALM BEACH PLANNING, ZONING AND BUILDING DEPARTMENT

### MINUTES OF THE REGULAR ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION MEETING HELD ON WEDNESDAY, SEPTEMBER 26, 2018

Please be advised that in keeping with a recent directive from the Town Council, the minutes of all Town Boards and Commissions will be "abbreviated" in style. Persons interested in listening to the meeting, after the fact, may access the audio of that item via the Town's website at www.townofpalmbeach.com.

### I. CALL TO ORDER

Mr. Vila called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m.

### II. ROLL CALL

Robert J. Vila, Chairman	PRESENT
Michael B. Small, Vice Chairman	PRESENT
Robert N. Garrison, Member	ABSENT (unexcused)
Alexander C. Ives, Member	PRESENT
Maisie Grace, Member	PRESENT
John David Corey, Member	PRESENT
Nikita Zukov, Member	PRESENT
Betsy Shiverick, Alternate Member	PRESENT
Katherine Catlin, Alternate Member	PRESENT
Dan Floersheimer, Alternate Member	ABSENT (unexcused)

Staff Members present were: John Lindgren, Planning Administrator Josh Martin, Director of Planning, Zoning and Building John Randolph, Town Attorney Kelly Churney, Secretary to the Architectural Review Commission

*Please note: Ms. Churney noted that Ms. Shiverick would be voting in the absence of Mr. Garrison.* 

### III. **PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE** Chairman Vila led the Pledge of Allegiance.

IV. <u>APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES FROM THE AUGUST 22, 2018 MEETING</u> Motion made by Mr. Small and seconded by Mr. Ives to approve the minutes from the August 22, 2018 meeting. Motion carried unanimously.

### V. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Mr. Small requested to amend the agenda with the withdraw the project A-030-2018, 304 Indian Rd and the deferral of the project B-093-2018, 977 S. Ocean Blvd to the October 24, 2018 meeting.

Mr. Lindgren stated that the project A-019-2018, 208 Sandpiper Dr. had requested a deferral to the October 24, 2018 meeting.

### Motion made by Mr. Small and seconded by Mr. Ives to approve the agenda as amended. Motion carried unanimously.

VI. <u>ADMINSTRATION OF THE OATH TO PERSONS WHO WISH TO TESTIFY</u> Ms. Churney administered the oath at this time and throughout the meeting as necessary.

#### VII. <u>COMMUNICATIONS FROM CITIZENS REGARDING NON-AGENDA ITEMS</u> (3 MINUTE LIMIT PLEASE) There are a second at this time.

There were no comments heard at this time.

### VIII. <u>PROJECT REVIEW</u> A. <u>DEMOLITIONS AND TIME EXTENSIONS</u>

<u>B-097-2018 Demolition</u> Address: 1616 S. Ocean Blvd. Applicant: Land Trust Source Corporation, Trustee of Trust No. 1616 SOB (Mark Warda, President) Professional: M. Mark Marsh/Bridges, Marsh & Associates Project Description: Demolition of existing two-story residence, guesthouse, pool and associated hardscape

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Mr. Small expressed his concern with the lack of maintenance on many properties before and after demolition. He requested that the Commission place conditions on the demolition approvals that the property will be maintained, including the landscape, hardscape and remaining structures, until the demolition occurs and after demolition, any items remaining should continue to be maintained. The Commission agreed.

Mr. Lindgren asked the Commissioners to contact him or Code Enforcement if they see a property in disrepair.

Mr. Marsh presented the proposed plans for the demolition of the existing residence and guesthouse.

Dustin Mizell, Environment Design Group, presented the proposed plans for the demolition of the existing landscape and hardscape.

Mr. Vila asked about the condition of the existing dock. Mr. Marsh responded.

Motion made by Mr. Corey and seconded by Mr. Small to approve the demolition as presented with the caveat to remove all exotic and invasive plant species, to sod and irrigate the property within 30 days and that the comments by Mr. Small regarding the maintenance before and after demolition are incorporated into the motion. Motion carried unanimously.

#### B-098-2018 Demolition

Address: 241 Tangier Ave. Applicant: Dark Stardust Holdings, LLC (Patricia B. Dean, Trustee) Professional: Adam Mills/Adam Mills Designs Project Description: Demolition of the main house, guesthouse, pool cabana, pool and pool deck. New sod is to be installed where aforementioned components previously existed and perimeter landscape material to be installed.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Mr. Mills presented the proposed demolition for the existing buildings, landscape and hardscape.

Mr. Ives suggested that the Town should incentive owners to renovate and restore older homes rather than demolish them. Ms. Catlin agreed with Mr. Ives.

Ms. Catlin asked the landscape architect how the hardscape and gardens would be protected during demolition. Mr. Mills responded.

Ms. Shiverick expressed concern that the proposal was to preserve the driveway rather than to preserve the home.

Ms. Grace asked staff about the amount of time the owner would have to begin building a new home after the demolition occurred. Mr. Lindgren stated that there was no limit.

Mr. Vila asked if the Commission could qualify the approval of a demolition by requiring that a replacement home be of the same size and scale as the previous home. Mr. Lindgren weighed in on this question.

Joanie Goodman, 911 N. Ocean Blvd., agreed with Mr. Ives and expressed concern about the proposed demolition.

Mr. Martin suggested that staff investigate a code amendment to promote similar replacement of a new home after demolition as well as any structure, more than 50 years of age proposed for demolition, to have a heightened level of review with an application for demolition.

Mr. Corey thanked Mr. Martin for his comments. Mr. Corey expressed concern about the driveway proposed to remain. He recommended keeping the perimeter landscaping and sodding and irrigating the remainder of the lot. Mr. Lindgren stated that Mr. Corey could make that recommendation in the motion.

Mr. Vila asked how the Commission could be reassured that the gardens would be maintained if the house had fallen in to disrepair. Mr. Mills responded.

Mr. Small agreed with Mr. Corey. Mr. Small made a recommendation for the criteria in which the Commission uses to review demolition applications.

Ms. Catlin asked if the owners would consider a plan to soften the proposed demolition plan. Mr. Mills responded.

Mr. Grace suggested to demolish all of the landscape, hardscape and buildings and sod and irrigate the entire lot.

Mr. Corey suggested options for the Commission to consider as a motion.

### Motion made by Mr. Ives and seconded by Mr. Corey to defer the project to allow the architect to restudy the landscape plan for demolition. Motion carried unanimously.

<u>B-099-2018 Demolition</u> Address: 256 Mockingbird Trail Applicant: Dr. Curtis Emmer Professional: Jacqueline Albarran/SKA Architect + Planner Project Description: Demolition of existing house, patios, pool and driveway. Existing perimeter landscaping remains. New irrigated lawn as per code.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Ms. Albarran presented the proposed demolition for the existing buildings, landscape and hardscape.

Mr. Vila asked about the method for protecting the perimeter landscaping. Ms. Albarran responded.

Mr. Corey asked about the existing sea grape tree on the corner of the property. Ms. Albarran responded.

Motion made by Mr. Small and seconded by Mr. Zukov to approve the demolition as presented with the caveat to remove all exotic and invasive plant species, to sod and irrigate the property within 30 days and that the comments by Mr. Small regarding the maintenance before and after demolition are incorporated into the motion. Motion carried unanimously.

### **B.** <u>MAJOR PROJECTS – OLD BUSINESS</u>

B-008-2018 Demolition/New Construction

Address: 232 Seabreeze Ave.

Applicant: Jim & Robin Carey

Professional: MP Design and Architecture

Project Description: Demolition of existing 2 story single family dwelling, 2 story garage, storage shed and pool. New construction of a 2 story single family contemporary home with concrete tile and standing seam zinc coated copper roof, new pool, site walls and landscaping.

Project History:

- January 2018 Approved demolition & deferred project to March 2018 for a complete redesign.
- March 2018 Presented and deferred to April 2018 based on Commissioners comments.
- April 2018 Deferred to May 2018 at the request of architect.
- May 2018 Approved modified landscape and hardscape plan. Deferred architectural portion to June 2018 at request of architect.
- June 2018 Deferred to July 2018 at request of architect.
- July 2018 \**Change in Architect*\* Deferred to August 2018 based on Commissioners Comments. Amended landscape demolition to include the approval of site wall.
- August 2018 Approved architectural plans as submitted with the caveat that the colors for the home would be reconsidered at the September 2018 meeting.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Mr. Perry presented the proposed colors for the new home. He showed an alternate color pattern on the overhead projector. He presented color and material samples to the Commissioner.

Ms. Grace expressed concern about the existing design of the home and thought the home lacked charm, even with the newly proposed colors.

Mr. Corey agreed with Ms. Grace and thought the house did not fit within the street. He stated that he thought the home lacked charm and whimsy.

Ms. Grace asked staff how the project was heard at the end of the last meeting, without providing any notice to the public. Mr. Lindgren stated that the Commission voted to hear the project at the end of the meeting. Mr. Randolph weighed in on the issue.

Mr. Vila called for public comment at this time. There were no comments heard.

Mr. Small questioned the motions made at the previous meeting. Mr. Lindgren read the portion of the minutes that included the project from the previous meeting.

Ms. Shiverick was not in favor of the newly proposed colors. She did not feel the new colors added any warmth to the design.

Motion made by Mr. Ives and seconded by Mr. Zukov to approve the first option of colors presented, which included the Parma blue windows and the Cerused Oak door. Motion failed 2-5 with Messrs. Small, Corey, Vila and Mses. Grace and Shiverick opposed.

A seconded motion made by Mr. Corey and seconded by Ms. Grace to defer the project for one month for a restudy of the colors. Motion carried 6-1, with Mr. Ives opposed.

B-034-2018 New Construction \*ARCOM TO MAKE RECOMMENDATIONS RELATIVE TO VARIANCE(S)\* - Done 4/25/18 Address: 901 N. Ocean Blvd. Applicant: PBB Island Properties, LLC Professional: Roger Janssen/Dailey Janssen Architects Project Description: Construction of a two-story residence, hardscape, landscape and pool.

Project History

- March 2018 Presented and deferred to April 2018 based on Commissioners comments.
- April 2018 Motion carried that implementation of the proposed variance will not cause negative architectural impact to the subject property. Deferred to May 2018 to restudy both main and guesthouse.
- May 2018 Presented and deferred to June 2018 based on Commissioners comments.
- June 2018 Deferred to July 2018 at the request of the architect.
- July 2018 Deferred to August 2018 at the request of the architect.
- August 2018 Deferred to September 2018 at the verbal request of the attorney.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Mr. Janssen presented the architectural modifications proposed for the new residence. Mr. Janssen showed additional renderings on the overhead projector. He presented material samples to the Commissioners.

Mr. Vila called for public comment at this time. There were no comments heard.

Mr. Zukov stated he believed that the new modifications addressed the Commissioners comments from the May meeting.

### Motion made by Mr. Zukov to approve the project as presented. The motion failed for lack of a second.

Mr. Corey expressed concern that there was not a model or 3-D rendering to allow the Commissioners to see how the house would sit on the lot. Mr. Lindgren reviewed the policy on the required model for a project.

Ms. Catlin stated she was in favor of the siting and style of the home. She recommended softening the west elevation of the guesthouse as well as removing a foot from the first floor of the main home.

Ms. Grace was in favor of the new home design but recommended removing some of the overall height of the home. She questioned some of the fenestration configurations on the east elevation as well as the half-octagonal design on the second floor.

Ms. Shiverick was in favor of the new home design. She questioned whether the half-octagonal design on the second floor fit with the Bermuda style design.

Mr. Ives thought that many of the items raised at the May meeting were addressed. He also questioned the half-octagonal design on the second floor as well as the entrance on the west elevation.

Mr. Janssen addressed the comments raised by the Commissioners.

Mr. Corey recommended reducing the height of the ceiling in the main body of the house. He questioned the east loggia and the Palladian window on the first floor.

Mr. Vila asked the architect his opinion on how a reduction in height would affect the arches in the design. Mr. Janssen stated it would affect the arches and he believed it would be a disservice to the design.

Mr. Zukov spoke in favor of the octagonal structures in the design.

Joanie Goodman, 911 N. Ocean Blvd., spoke in favor of the proposed home design.

Joe Peterson, Peterson Design Professionals, presented the landscape and hardscape modifications proposed for the new residence.

Mr. Vila asked about the landscaping proposed for the front of the residence. Mr. Peterson responded. Mr. Vila stated that since this site was very prominent, he suggested that the landscaping should be important as well.

Mr. Ives asked about the height of the landscaping at the front of the west elevation. Mr. Peterson responded.

Mr. Corey was in favor of the proposed landscaping plan. He asked about the buffer proposed for the north property. Mr. Peterson responded.

Mr. Vila thought the proposed design had met most of the Commissioners comments. He thought the project was going to be respectful to the site. Mr. Vila thought the landscaping could use more color in the design.

## Motion made by Mr. Zukov and seconded by Mr. Small to approve the project as presented with the caveat that to enlarge the entrance by one foot. Motion carried 5-2, with Messrs. Ives and Corey opposed.

*Please note: A short break was taken at 10:36 a.m. The meeting resumed at 10:53 a.m.* 

#### B-030-2018 New Construction

Address: 905 N. Ocean Blvd. Applicant: Patrick and Lillian Carney Professional: LeBerge & Ménard Inc.

Project Description: Construction of a new 17,727 sq. ft. two story main house with a basement and a 1,284 sq. ft. single story guesthouse in the Neo-Classical style of architecture. Final hardscape, landscape and drainage plan to be presented as well.

Project History

- March 2018 Presented and deferred to April 2018 for a restudy of the project.
- April 2018 Deferred to May 2018 at the request of the attorney.
- May 2018 Presented and deferred to June 2018 for a restudy of the project.
- June 2018 Presented and deferred to July 2018 to allow the architect to incorporate the comments from the Commissioners into the design.
- July 2018 The project was denied.
- August 2018 The attorney from the project requested that the Commission reconsider their motion and the project due to the reduction in lot coverage. The Commission voted to reconsider the project at the September 26, 2018 meeting.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Frank Lynch, attorney for the owner, spoke about the recent efforts to work with the neighbors and the major changes that had been made in the proposed design.

Daniel Ménard, LeBerge & Ménard Inc., presented the proposed architectural modifications proposed for the new residence.

Mr. Vila asked about the eave bracket design. Mr. Ménard responded.

Mr. Zukov stated he believed the new design met all of the Commissioners' concerns that had been raised at the previous meetings.

Mr. Corey agreed with Mr. Zukov. Mr. Corey stated that a 3-D rendering would be nice to see.

Ms. Shiverick questioned the Chippendale railing design proposed and recommended using slats instead. She suggest moving the clapboard to the top half of the home rather than the bottom. Ms. Shiverick asked to see the color samples. Mr. Ménard presented the color samples to the Commissioners.

Ms. Catlin appreciated the new design, the siting on the lot and thought the new design was more suited to the north end of the island.

Mr. Small agreed with Ms. Catlin and was in support of the new design.

Mr. Ives stated he was in favor of the project and thought it would work well on the site.

Ms. Grace agreed with the other Commissioners. She expressed concern about the execution of the design style in the size of the home proposed. Ms. Grace also expressed concern for the five repetitive roofs at the front of the home.

Mr. Vila expressed appreciation for the owners and neighbors working together on an acceptable design. Mr. Vila asked if the architect had considered gable roofs. Mr. Ménard stated he had considered them. Mr. Vila recommended changing the railings at the suggestion of Ms. Shiverick. He added that the eave brackets were a too small and should be larger.

Matt Jackman, Nievera Williams Design, presented the modifications to the landscape and hardscape designs for the new residence. He presented alternate modifications to the design on the overhead projector.

Ms. Shiverick asked about the step design on the west elevation, next to the driveway. Mr. Jackman explained the design. She recommended changing the gate to a slat design rather than the Chippendale style presented.

Mr. Corey agreed with Ms. Shiverick on the proposed gate design. He expressed concern about the pavers proposed.

Mr. Vila asked about the landscaping proposed on the west elevation. Mr. Jackman showed the rendering and explained the design.

### Motion made by Mr. Zukov and seconded by Mr. Small to approve the project as presented with the caveat that the clapboard is moved to the top of the home rather than the bottom.

Mr. Vila called for public comment at this time. There were no comments heard.

Greg Kino, attorney for Mr. and Mrs. Goodman, stated that his clients have no objections to the proposed project.

#### Motion carried unanimously.

<u>B-057-2018 Demolition/New Construction</u> Address: 251 Dunbar Rd. Applicant: 251 Dunbar, LLC Professional: Pat Segraves/SKA Architect + Planner Project Description: Demolition of existing one story house. New construction of two story classical style home to be approximately 6,000 sq. ft. Final landscape and hardscape to be included.

A motion carried at the June meeting to approve the demolition request. A second motion carried to defer the project to the July 25, 2018 meeting for restudy. A motion carried at the July meeting to defer the project to the August 22, 2018 meeting for a restudy based on the comments from the Commissioners. A motion carried at the August meeting to approve the project as presented with the caveat that the changes suggested by Mr. Corey are implemented (keeping the quoins on the front of the home, removing them from the rest of the home, moving the one story portion over to create a shadow line), lowering the arches in the loggia and that the landscape architect returns to the Commission at the September 26, 2018 meeting with a different option for the pavers.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Steve West, Parker Yannette Design Group, presented the modified motor court design. He also presented material samples for the motor court.

Mr. Corey stated that the proposed plan looked good.

### Motion made by Mr. Small and seconded by Mr. Zukov to approve the project as presented. Motion carried unanimously.

<u>B-060-2018 New Construction</u> Address: 211 Ocean Terrace Applicant: 1963 Trust 211 Ocean Terrace LLC Professional: Harold Smith/Smith and Moore Architects, Inc. Project Description: Construction of a two-story single family residence. Final hardscape and landscape.

A motion carried at the June meeting to defer the project to the July 2018 meeting for restudy. A motion carried at the July meeting to defer the project to the August meeting at the request of the architect. A motion carried at the August meeting to defer the project to the September 26, 2018 meeting at the request of the architect.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Mr. Smith presented the architectural modification for the new residence. Mr. Smith stated he lowered the windows and doors from the cornice at the second story at the suggestion of Ms. Catlin. Mr. Smith showed the Commission the elevation that reflected the lower windows and doors.

Ms. Grace was in favor of the current design versus the previous design. She inquired about the other surrounding homes and how they compared to the proposed design. Mr. Smith responded. She recommended changing the garage door color to white.

Mr. Corey stated he thought the home would work well on the street. He asked about the proposed roof material. Mr. Smith presented a sample of the roof tile to the Commissioners.

Ms. Shiverick thought the blue color proposed was a bit strong. She recommended adding some white to the blue as well as changing the garage door to white.

Mr. Vila was in favor of the design but suggested making the home a bit more tropical. He recommended using a lighter color roof and asked if the architect would consider a roof pitch of 4/12 rather than 6/12.

John Lang, Lang Design Group, presented the modifications for the landscape and hardscape design.

Mr. Vila asked for more explanation on the plant material for the east and west elevations. Mr. Lang responded.

Mr. Zukov asked about the proposed east elevation. Mr. Lang responded.

Mr. Vila called for public comment at this time. There were no comments heard.

### Motion made by Mr. Zukov and seconded by Mr. Small to approve the project as presented. Motion carried unanimously.

<u>B-071-2018 New Construction</u> Address: 624 Island Dr. Applicant: Five Girls Rule, LLC Professional: Harold Smith/Smith and Moore Architects, Inc. Project Description: Construction of a new two-story residence with pool. Final landscape and hardscape.

A motion carried at the July meeting to approve the project as presented with the caveat that the architect return to the August meeting with an alternate design of the front gate. A motion carried at the August meeting to defer the gate design to the September 26, 2018 meeting to address the comments of the Commission.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Mr. Smith presented the proposed modified entry gate design.

Ms. Shiverick questioned the lantern choice for the front entry gate. She also questioned the half hedge proposed for the front entrance. Mr. Smith responded and explained the design.

Ms. Catlin was in favor of the changes.

Mr. Vila agreed and was in favor of the changes proposed. He agreed with Mr. Shiverick about the lanterns proposed and made a recommendation for different lanterns.

Motion made by Ms. Grace and seconded by Mr. Zukov to approve the project as presented with the caveat that the architect choose new lanterns, which will be administrative approved by staff. Motion carried unanimously.

B-082-2018 Demolition/New Construction \*ARCOM TO MAKE RECOMMENDATIONS RELATIVE TO SITE PLAN REVIEW WITH VARIANCE(S)\* - Done 7/25/18 Address: 456 S. Ocean Blvd. Applicant: 456 S. Ocean LLC Professional: Roger Janssen/Dailey Janssen Architects Project Description: Demolition of existing restaurant with construction of Townhomes, landscape, hardscape and pools.

A motion carried at the July meeting to approve the demolition as requested. A second motion carried that implementation of the proposed variances will not

cause negative architectural impact to the subject property. A third motion carried to defer the project to the August meeting for a restudy of the project based on the comments from the Commission. A motion carried at the August meeting to defer the project to the September 26, 2018 meeting based on the comments from the Commissioners relating to unit 1, 3, the corner of unit 4 and the color for the gates and garage doors.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Mr. Janssen presented the proposed architectural modifications to the townhomes.

Ms. Grace thought the change in unit 4 was successful. She thought the fenestration in unit 1 looked busy. She added that she thought the fenestration overall on the eastern facade emphasized the horizontality of the structure. Mr. Janssen responded.

Mr. Corey was in favor of the changes. He stated he liked most of the changes in unit 4 but recommended a change to the doors on the south side. He thought units 2 and 3 were successful. He suggested that the glazing on unit 1 might be too much.

Mr. Zukov stated he liked the two windows on unit 3, on the east elevation, on the previous design rather than the newly proposed.

Ms. Shiverick was in favor of the changes. She recommended changing the gates and garage doors to cypress. Mr. Janssen responded.

Ms. Catlin was in favor of the changes.

Mr. Vila suggested that the fenestration was problematic on unit 1, north elevation. He stated he was favor of using as much pecky cypress as possible. He asked about the proposed material on all of the brackets near the arches. Mr. Janssen responded. He thought there was too much glazing overall. Mr. Janssen responded.

Chuck Yannette, Parker Yannette Design Group, presented the landscape and hardscape modifications for the new townhomes.

*Please note: Mr. Corey left the meeting at* 12:22 p.m. *Ms. Catlin voted in the absence of Mr. Corey.* 

Ms. Grace questioned the hedge proposed at the front of the property and expressed concern about the visibility of the fenestration on the east façade.

Mr. Vila thought the fenestration needed some restudy and thought the landscaping on the northeast corner could provide more landscaping for privacy.

Mr. Small agreed with Mr. Vila regarding the fenestration on the east façade. Mr. Vila added that he could not support the project unless a reduction was made to the fenestration on the east façade.

Mr. Vila expressed a concern for the color proposed for the townhomes.

### Motion made by Ms. Grace to defer the project for one month in accordance with the comments from the Commissioners.

Mr. Vila asked for public comments. There were no comments heard at this time.

## Motion amended by Ms. Grace to defer the project for one month in accordance with the comments from the Commissioners, with respect to the fenestration in units 1 and 3 as well as to increase the amount of landscaping.

Mr. Janssen reviewed what he believed the Commission would like him to restudy.

Ms. Shiverick stated she could support the fenestration and thought it was complimentary. Ms. Catlin stated she completely agreed with Ms. Shiverick.

### Motion by Ms. Grace failed for lack of a second.

A small discussion ensued about the proposed fenestration.

Mr. Small stated he thought the east elevation had too much fenestration.

Motion made Mr. Small and seconded by Ms. Grace to defer the project for one month, particularly to restudy the fenestration on the east elevation. Motion carried 5-2, with Mses. Shiverick and Catlin opposed.

*Please note: A lunch break was taken at 12:39 p.m. The meeting resumed at 1:46 p.m.* 

#### B-083-2018 New Construction

\*This project has to be approved in its entirety before it can be heard at by the Town Council to address the Site Plan Review application\* Address: 210 Miraflores Dr. Applicant: 210 Miraflores Drive, LLC

Professional: Pat Segraves/SKA Architect + Planner

Project Description: New construction of two-story island style home to be approximately 4,400 square feet. Final landscape and hardscape to be included.

SITE PLAN REVIEW INFORMATION: Special Exception and Site Plan Review to allow the construction of a 4,381 square foot, two-story, single family house on a non-conforming lot,

comprised of a portion of a platted lot, which is 90 feet in width in lieu of the 100 foot depth required in the R-B Zoning District.

A motion carried at the July meeting to defer the project for one month to the August meeting for a complete restudy. A motion carried at the August meeting to defer the project to the September 26, 2018 meeting at the request of the architect.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Pat Segraves presented the architectural modifications proposed for the new residence. Mr. Segraves showed the Commission a 3-D rendering of the proposed home on the overhead projector.

Ms. Grace stated she was in favor of the way the architect handled the change in the grade. She questioned whether the proposed design style fit into the streetscape. Mr. Segraves responded. She recommended removing a foot out of the overall height. Mr. Segraves showed an alternative elevation with 6 inches removed out of the overall height.

Ms. Catlin was in favor of the terracing at the front of the property. She thought that the proportions and lines were better than the previous design. She thought the proposed style worked well with one-story homes.

Mr. Ives thought that the design style needed some restudy.

Mr. Zukov was in favor of the design.

Mr. Small was in favor of the design and thought in enhanced the beauty of the neighborhood.

Mr. Vila called for public comment. There were no comments heard at this time.

Steve West, Parker Yannette Design Group, presented the landscape and hardscape modifications for the new residence.

Mr. Vila expressed concern about the number of palm trees with the Prairie style home. Mr. West responded.

Ms. Grace stated she thought the west elevation could have additional trees.

### Motion made by Ms. Grace to approve the project as presented with a reduction of 6 inches in the overall height.

Mr. Vila asked the architect if the reduction of height would affect his design. Mr. Segraves replied. Mr. Vila stated he could not support the reduction in height. Motion by Ms. Grace failed for lack of a second.

Motion made by Mr. Zukov and seconded by Mr. Small to approve the project as presented. Motion carried 5-2, with Mr. Ives and Ms. Grace opposed.

<u>B-084-2018 New Construction</u> Address: 119 Reef Rd Applicant: Mr. & Mrs. Monty Falb Professional: Pat Segraves/SKA Architect + Planner Project Description: New construction of a two-story island style home to be approximately 4,500 square feet. Final landscape and hardscape to be included.

A motion carried at the August meeting to defer the project to the September 26, 2018 meeting for restudy.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Daniel Clavijo, SKA Architect + Planner, presented the architectural modifications proposed for the new residence.

Steve West, Parker Yannette Design Group, presented the landscape and hardscape modifications for the new residence.

Mr. Zukov asked about the columns on the front elevation. Mr. Segraves responded. Mr. Zukov recommended moving the columns out from the building, at least by 4 inches.

Mr. Small asked about the timing of the landscape demolition. Mr. West responded. Mr. Small asked if the front hedge could remain during demolition. Mr. Segraves responded and stated it was possible.

Mr. Vila asked about the roof material. Mr. Segraves presented a sample of the roof material and stated the roof would be a light gray. Mr. Vila asked if the architect had color samples. Mr. Segraves presented color samples to the Commissioners.

Ms. Grace asked if the architect was considering other colors. Mr. Clavijo discussed alternate colors with the Commissioners.

Ms. Catlin stated she thought the shutters needed a different color. Mr. Segraves stated he would consider a blue-gray color.

Ms. Shiverick made suggestions for different colors for the shutters.

Mr. Vila asked about gutters on the home. Mr. Segraves responded. Mr. Vila called for public comment at this time. There were no comments heard.

Motion made by Ms. Grace and seconded by Mr. Small to approve the project as presented with the caveats that the columns on the front will be free standing and staff will administratively approve the colors of the home in coordination with Ms. Shiverick. Motion carried unanimously.

B-087-2018 Demolition/New Construction

Address: 255 Emerald Ln. Applicant: Prescott & Forbes, LLC Professional: Kevin Asbacher/Asbacher Architecture Project Description: Demolition of existing two-story residence. Construct a new two-story Island Colonial residence and swimming pool with final landscape and hardscape.

A motion carried at the August meeting to approve the demolition as requested. A second motion carried to defer the project to the September 26, 2018 meeting for a restudy based upon the comments from the Commissioners.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Mr. Asbacher presented the architectural modifications proposed for the new residence.

Mr. Ives thought the architect addressed most of the concerns of the Commissioners. Mr. Ives asked about the design around the front entrance. Mr. Asbacher responded. Mr. Ives recommended to use stone on the front entrance or to leave it unscored.

Ms. Grace was in favor of the design and thought it would look nice on the street. She recommended slightly reducing the width of the bay windows on the front of the home.

Mr. Zukov asked about the beam on the front porch design. Mr. Asbacher responded and stated he could look at lightening it up.

Mr. Vila asked about the column and eave details on the home. Mr. Asbacher responded and explained his design.

Matt Jackman, Nievera Williams Design, presented the landscape and hardscape design for the new residence.

Mr. Vila called for public comment. There were no comments heard at this time.

### Motion made by Ms. Shiverick and seconded by Mr. Ives to approve the project as presented. Motion carried 6-1, with Mr. Zukov opposed.

<u>B-090-2018 New Construction</u> Address: 101 Gulfstream Rd. Applicant: 456 S. Ocean, LLC Professional: Roger Janssen/Dailey Janssen Architects Project Description: Construction of a new two-story residence, landscape, hardscape, pool and spa.

A motion carried at the August meeting to approve the architectural plans as presented with the caveat to include the pilasters at the front door, a restudy of the front door and to include the window changes discussed while deferring the landscape and hardscape design for restudy, including the elimination of artificial turf.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Mr. Janssen presented the architectural modifications proposed for the new residence.

Mr. Vila questioned the proportions of the front entrance design. Mr. Janssen responded.

Mr. Shiverick asked about the proposed color of the home. Mr. Janssen responded.

Chuck Yannette, Parker Yannette Design Group, presented the landscape and hardscape modifications for the new residence.

Ms. Grace was in favor of the design but questioned the amount of Bougainvillea proposed on the front façade.

Mr. Vila was in favor of the proposed sea grapes but questioned their durability in the proposed location. Mr. Yannette responded.

Mr. Zukov questioned the dimensions of the columns on the front entrance. Mr. Janssen responded.

### Motion made by Mr. Small and seconded by Mr. Ives to approve the project as presented. Motion carried unanimously.

#### B-091-2018 New Construction

\*This project has to be approved in its entirety before it can be heard at by the Town Council to address the Site Plan Review application\* Address: 232 Cherry Ln. Applicant: Cherry Lane LLC Professional: LaBerge & Ménard Inc. Project Description: New 4,600 sq. ft. two story house, landscaping and hardscape.

A motion carried at the August meeting to defer the project to the September 26, 2018 meeting for restudy.

SITE PLAN REVIEW INFORMATION: A request for Site Plan Review to build a 4,620 square foot two-story home on an existing 10,000 square foot platted lot with a depth of 80.0' in lieu of 100' required.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Daniel Ménard, LaBerge & Ménard Inc., presented the proposed architectural modifications for the new residence.

Mr. Zukov asked why the design style had changed. Mr. Ménard responded.

Mr. Ives thought the proposed design met the Commissioners comments and was well executed. He expressed concern about the design of the garage.

Mr. Small suggested that the architect should reconsider French Chateau style and provided his reasons for the suggestion.

Ms. Catlin was in favor of the design style and thought the home was well designed.

Ms. Shiverick agreed with Mr. Small and thought the street was evolving. She was in favor of the design. She asked about the roof material. Mr. Ménard presented a roof tile sample. She recommended using gray slate as well as wrought iron for the metalwork.

Ms. Grace suggested using quality materials for the details. She questioned whether the Regency style fit into the area.

Mr. Vila was in favor of the design and added that there was a nice balance between formality and informality. He agreed that quality materials would add sophistication to the design.

Todd Maclean, Todd Maclean Outdoor Living, presented the landscape and hardscape design for the new residence. He presented hardscape material to the Commissioners.

Mr. Vila suggested that the Orchid tree would be too informal and recommended using the Queen's Crepe Myrtle. Mr. Maclean agreed.

Ms. Grace asked about the proximity of the rear neighbors and the proposed screening. Mr. Maclean responded.

Mr. Ives asked Mr. Maclean if he could reduce the interior width of the landscaping on the driveway. Mr. Maclean stated he could reduce the width to 12 feet.

Mr. Vila suggested that the front hedge remain at a lower height.

Mr. Vila called for public comment.

Harriet Golding, 222 Cherry Lane, expressed concern about the proposed home.

Frank Lynch, attorney for the owner, explained the zoning request.

## Motion made by Mr. Ives and seconded by Mr. Catlin to approve the project as presented with the caveat that the interior landscaped curb cut is reduced from 14' to 12'. Motion carried unanimously.

B-093-2018 Demolition/New Construction

\*ARCOM TO MAKE RECOMMENDATIONS RELATIVE TO SPECIAL EXCEPTION WITH SITE PLAN REVIEW AND VARIANCE(S)\* Address: 977 S. Ocean Blvd. Applicant: 195 Phesten Associates Palm Beach LLC/Contract Purchaser

Professional: Studio SR Architecture, Inc.

Project Description: Demolition of existing single story residence; proposed new two story modern residence in light stone cladding, natural veneer with associated landscape and hardscape.

A motion carried at the August meeting to defer the project to the September 26, 2018 meeting at the request of the architect.

SPECIAL EXCEPTION WITH SITE PLAN REVIEW AND VARIANCE(S) INFORMATION: 1) Special Exception with Site Plan Review to allow the construction of a 9,685 square foot twostory, single family residence on a non-conforming lot that is 77 feet in depth in lieu of the 150 foot minimum required In the R-A Zoning District and 13,662 square feet in area in lieu of the 20,000 square foot minimum area required in the R-A Zoning District. 2) A request for a variance to allow the proposed swimming pool to have a 5-foot rear yard setback in lieu of the 10-foot minimum required and a 30-foot front yard setback in lieu of the 35-foot minimum required in the R-A Zoning District. 3) A request for a variance to allow a building height plane setback to be 35 feet in lieu of the 50-foot minimum setback required.

### *Please note: This item was deferred to the October 24, 2018 meeting with the Item V. Approval of the Agenda.*

B-095-2018 Additions/Modifications \*ARCOM TO MAKE RECOMMENDATIONS RELATIVE TO VARIANCE(S)\* - Done 8/22/18 Address: 207 Pendleton Ave. Applicant: Betsy Sorrel/Contract Purchaser Professional: MP Design & Architecture Project Description: Demolition of interior. New windows in existing openings. Demolition of existing flat roof area to be replaced with new hip roof section. Erection of a new loggia and the extension of the existing one story kitchen.

A motion carried at the August meeting that implementation of the proposed variances will not cause negative architectural impact to the subject property. A second motion carried to approve the architectural plans as presented and to defer the landscape plans to the September 26, 2018 meeting for restudy based upon the comments from the Commission.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Matt Jackman, Nievera Williams Design, presented the landscape and hardscape modifications to the residence.

Mr. Vila was in favor of the design.

### Motion made by Mr. Ives and seconded by Mr. Small to approve the project as presented. Motion carried unanimously.

#### B-096-2018 Modifications

\*ARCOM TO MAKE RECOMMENDATIONS RELATIVE TO VARIANCE\* -Done 8/22/18 Address: 250 Kawama Ln. Applicant: Mr. & Mrs. Martin Meyers Professional: MHK Architecture & Planning Project Description: Interior remodel to existing regency style house. Addition of two windows on east elevation and modification of existing door.

A motion carried at the August meeting that implementation of the proposed variance will not cause negative architectural impact to the subject property.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Caroline Forrest, MHK Architecture & Planning, presented the architectural modifications to the existing residence.

Motion made by Mr. Ives and seconded by Mr. Small to approve the project as presented. Motion carried unanimously.

#### C. <u>MAJOR PROJECTS – NEW BUSINESS</u>

<u>B-089-2018 New Construction</u> \*ARCOM TO MAKE RECOMMENDATIONS RELATIVE TO VARIANCE(S)\* Address: 259 Park Ave. Applicant: Dr. Morgan and Dr. Susan Poncy Professional: Carlos A. Bonilla/Bonilla Torregroza Architecture, LLC Project Description: Demolition of existing residence. Construction of new residence with new landscape and parking space.

VARIANCE(S) INFORMATION: 1. A variance request to allow construction of a new 2,047 square foot, two story residence on a lot with a width of 37.50 feet in lieu of the 75 foot minimum required, a depth of 70 feet in lieu of the 100 foot minimum required and a lot area of 2,625 sq. ft. in lieu of the 10,000 sq. ft. minimum required. 2. A variance request to allow lot coverage to be 37.56% in lieu of the 30% maximum allowed. 3. A variance request to allow a front yard setback to be 18.9 feet in lieu of the 15-foot minimum required. 4. A variance request to allow a rear yard setback to be 6 feet in lieu of the 15-foot minimum required. 5. A variance request to allow a west side yard setback to be 5 feet in lieu of the 10-foot minimum required. 6. A variance request to allow an east side yard setback to be 6 feet in lieu of the 10-foot minimum required. 7. A variance request to allow a landscape open space of 37.9% in lieu of the 45% minimum required.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Maura Ziska, attorney of the owners, explained the zoning requests and advocated for a positive recommendation to the Town Council.

Mr. Vila asked about the existing grade of the current home. Mr. Bonilla responded.

Mr. Bonilla presented the proposed plans for the demolition of the existing home.

Steve West, Parker Yannette Design Group, presented the landscape and hardscape plans for the proposed demolition.

Motion made by Mr. Ives and seconded by Ms. Shiverick to approve the demolition as presented with the caveat to remove all exotic and invasive plant species, to sod and irrigate the property within 30 days and that the comments by Mr. Small regarding the maintenance before and after demolition are incorporated into the motion. Motion carried unanimously.

Mr. Bonilla presented the proposed architectural plans for the new residence.

Mr. Ives was in favor of the design. He questioned the shutters proposed. Mr. Bonilla responded.

Mr. Vila questioned the placement of the shutters. Mr. Bonilla responded and explained his design.

Ms. Grace was in favor of the home design. She questioned the windows proposed for the first floor.

Ms. Shiverick was in favor of the home as well as the initial blue door proposed. She also questioned the shingles on the top of the home and the lack of shingles on the bottom half of the home. Mr. Bonilla responded.

Ms. Catlin thought the design was a creative solution for the small lot. She asked if shutters would be added to the single window on the second floor. Mr. Bonilla responded and explained the louvered shutters.

Mr. Vila was in favor of the design. Mr. Vila expressed concern about the window material proposed for the new home. Mr. Bonilla responded. Mr. Vila suggested reducing the size of the lower brackets over the front door.

Steve West, Parker Yannette Design Group, presented the landscape and hardscape plans for the new residence. He presented hardscape materials to the Commissioners.

Mr. Vila asked about the landscaping proposed for the front elevation. Mr. West responded.

#### A second motion made by Mr. Ives and seconded by Ms. Shiverick that implementation of the proposed variances will not cause negative architectural impact to the subject property. Motion carried unanimously.

Sudarshan Rajan, 257 Park Ave., expressed concern about the side retaining wall proposed next to his driveway and his ability to get in and out of his automobile.

A large discussion ensued among the Commissioners, Ms. Ziska and Mr. Rajan about the driveways for both properties.

After the discussion, a consensus was made that the architectural plans and the landscape plans were acceptable but the driveway issue needed to be resolved with the neighbor and the architect.

# A third motion made by Mr. Ives and seconded by Mr. Zukov to approve the architectural plans as presented with the landscape and hardscape plans to be deferred for one month to allow the architect restudy the driveway design. Motion carried 5-2, with Mr. Small and Ms. Grace opposed.

<u>B-100-2018 Additions/Modifications</u> Address: 1050 N. Ocean Blvd. Applicant: Edmund H. Beebe Professional: Roger Janssen/Dailey Janssen Architects Project Description: Relocation of previously approved pool cabana.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Mr. Janssen presented the modified design for the pool and cabana for the new residence.

Mr. Small inquired about the part of the building that would be seen from the road. Mr. Jackman stated he would show the elevations to Commission.

Matt Jackman, Nievera Williams Design, presented the modified landscape and hardscape design for the new residence.

### Motion made by Mr. Small and seconded by Mr. Ives to approve the project as presented. Motion carried unanimously.

#### B-101-2018 Demolition/New Construction

\*ARCOM TO MAKE RECOMMENDATIONS RELATIVE TO VARANCE(S)\* Address: 265 Park Ave. Applicant: Ken Moreland-Pearce Professional: LeBerge & Ménard, Inc. Project Description: Demolition of existing cottage. New two-story west indies style home, white stucco, impact windows painted celadon green, gray standing seam metal roof, gray shutters, new landscaping.

VARIANCE(S) INFORMATION: 1. A variance request to allow construction of a new 2,000 square foot two-story residence on a lot with a width of 50 feet in lieu of the 75 foot minimum required, a depth of 70 feet in lieu of the 100 foot minimum required and a lot area of 3,500 sq. ft. in lieu of the 10,000 sq. ft. minimum required. 2. A variance request to allow a west, side yard setback to be 5 feet in lieu of the 10-foot minimum required

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Maura Ziska, attorney of the owners, explained the zoning requests and advocated for a positive recommendation to the Town Council.

Daniel Ménard, LeBerge & Ménard, Inc., presented the proposed plans for the demolition of the existing home.

Matt Jackman, Nievera Williams Design, presented the landscape and hardscape plans for the proposed demolition.

Ms. Grace asked about the width between the existing home and the home to the east. Mr. Ménard responded. Ms. Grace expressed concern about the proposed demolition and damage to the home to the east.

Mr. Lindgren commented on previous demolitions in tight spaces.

Motion made by Mr. Small and seconded by Ms. Catlin to approve the demolition as presented with the caveat to remove all exotic and invasive plant species, to sod and irrigate the property within 30 days and that the

comments by Mr. Small regarding the maintenance before and after
demolition are incorporated into the motion. Motion carried unanimously, 60. Please note: Mr. Ives was not in the room during this vote.

Mr. Ménard presented the proposed architectural plans for the new residence.

Mr. Vila asked about the roof material. Mr. Ménard responded.

Ms. Grace asked how the architect proposed to address the site flooding. Mr. Ménard stated that the landscape architect would address that question.

Ms. Catlin was in favor of the home design and thought it would fit into the neighborhood.

Ms. Shiverick asked about the garage design in relation to the front entrance. Mr. Ménard responded and stated that the rendering was incorrect and that the garage would be lower than what was shown.

A discussion ensued about the design of the garage door on the front elevation.

A second motion made by Mr. Zukov and seconded by Mr. Ives to approve the project with the exception of the garage door design, landscape and hardscape, which would return to the Commission for review in one month at the October 24, 2018 meeting. Motion carried unanimously.

A third motion made by Mr. Ives and seconded by Mr. Zukov that implementation of the proposed variances will not cause negative architectural impact to the subject property. Motion carried unanimously.

B-102-2018 Additions/Modifications

\*ARCOM TO MAKE RECOMMENDATIONS RELATIVE TO SITE PLAN REVIEW WITH VARANCE(S)\* Address: 150 Bradley Place, #805 Applicant: Daniel Abraham Professional: James A. "Blue" Minges/Blue Minges Architect Project Description: Request for site plan review for two retractable awnings totaling 560 square feet on the 8<sup>th</sup> floor of a 10 story building in the R-D(2) zoning district. Request for a special exception to allow proposed awnings above the third floor building which requires a special exception in the R-D(2) zoning district. Request for a special exception to reduce setbacks of awnings of 3x awnings height from the street within 279'-10 3/4" to existing property lines.

SITE PLAN REVIEW WITH VARIANCE(S) INFORMATION: A site plan modification request with variances to allow two (2) retractable awnings (14' by 20') totaling 560 square feet on the 8th floor of an existing 11 story building in the R-D(2) Zoning District. The following variances are being requested to allow the two (2) retractable awnings: 1. Allow a building height for the awnings to be 93.25 feet in lieu of the 35-foot maximum allowed. 2. Allow the addition of the awnings to the existing 8th floor in lieu of the 3 story maximum allowed. 3. Allow a front yard setback on Bradley

Place of 110.48 feet for the east awning in lieu of the 279.75 foot minimum required (height of proposed awning x number of street yards(3)). 4. Allow a street side yard setback on Sunset Avenue of 249 feet for the east awning in lieu of the 279.75 minimum required (height of proposed awning x number of street yards (3)). 5. Allow a side yard setback of 72 feet for the west awning in lieu of the 93.25 feet minimum required (height of the proposed awning).

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Maura Ziska, attorney of the owners, explained the zoning requests and advocated for a positive recommendation to the Town Council.

Mr. Small asked if there were other awnings on the building. Ms. Ziska responded.

Mr. Lindgren told the Commission that the building was a landmark and would have to seek approval from the Landmarks Preservation Commission. He asked the Commissioners to remove it from the agenda.

### Motion made by Mr. Small and seconded by Mr. Ives to withdraw the project from the agenda. Motion carried unanimously.

<u>B-104-2018 Demolition/New Construction</u> Address: 880 & 888 S. Ocean Blvd. Applicant: Mr. & Mrs. Alex Chesterman Professional: MP Design & Architecture Project Description: Demolition of existing residence at 888 S. Ocean Blvd. New two-story addition to existing two-story residence at 880 S. Ocean Blvd. (previously ARCOM approved), new two-story pool house, pool, landscape & hardscape.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Michael Perry, MP Design & Architecture, presented the proposed plans for the demolition of the existing home.

Matt Jackman, Nievera Williams Design, presented the landscape and hardscape plans for the proposed demolition.

Motion made by Mr. Zukov and seconded by Ms. Shiverick to approve the demolition as presented with the caveat to remove all exotic and invasive plant species, to sod and irrigate the property within 30 days and that the comments by Mr. Small regarding the maintenance before and after demolition are incorporated into the motion. Motion carried 5-2, with Messrs. Ives and Small opposed.

Mr. Perry presented the proposed architectural plans for the new cabana and addition to the existing home.

Matt Jackman, Nievera Williams Design, presented the landscape and hardscape plans for the unified residence.

Ms. Grace asked if the properties would be unified. Mr. Perry responded.

Mr. Small asked to see the elevations of the landscape plans for the curve on S. County and S. Ocean. Mr. Perry presented the elevations.

Mr. Vila asked if there was a gate proposed at the southwest corner of the property. Mr. Jackman stated that he believed a gate was needed and they would bring a design back to the Commission.

Mr. Vila asked for the ridge height of the site in which the pool house was proposed. Mr. Perry responded.

Mr. Zukov about the door proposed on the south rendered elevation. Mr. Perry responded and stated he would need to return to the Commission with a gate design that was in keeping with the existing residence. Mr. Jackman showed an alternate rendering with the location of the sliding gate and pedestrian gate for the south elevation.

Ms. Shiverick asked about the details on the pool house. Mr. Perry responded.

Motion made by Mr. Zukov and seconded by Ms. Catlin to approve the project as presented with the caveat that the architect would return in one month with a vehicular gate and pedestrian door design for the south elevation. Motion carried 5-2, with Ms. Shiverick and Mr. Ives opposed.

#### **D.** <u>MINOR PROJECTS – OLD BUSINESS</u>

<u>A-019-2018 Modifications</u> Address: 208 Sandpiper Dr. Applicant: 208 Sandpiper LLC Professional: Andres Paradelo/Paradelo Burgess Design Studio, LLC Project Description: Revisions to the previously approved hardscape/landscape plans, addition of decorative driveway columns, a decorative gate in the front yard/along Sandpiper Drive and a generator wall enclosure/gates.

A motion carried at the June meeting to defer the project to the July 25, 2018 meeting to allow the architect to bring more information to the Commission. A motion carried at the July meeting to defer the project to the August 22, 2018 meeting at the request of the architect. A motion carried at the August meeting to defer the project to the September 26, 2018 meeting at the request of the architect.

Please note: This item was deferred to the October 24, 2018 meeting with the Item V. Approval of the Agenda.

<u>A-030-2018 Modifications</u> Address: 304 Indian Rd. Applicant: Anna and Sean Miller Professional: Thomas M. Kirchhoff, AIA/Kirchhoff & Associates Architects Project Description: Add new site wall in front yard and relocate existing plantings to accommodate new wall. Relocate existing generator.

A motion carried at the August meeting to defer the project to the September 26, 2018 meeting at the request of the architect.

### Please note: This item was deferred to the October 24, 2018 meeting with the Item V. Approval of the Agenda.

#### E. MINOR PROJECTS – NEW BUSINESS

<u>A-031-2018 Modifications</u> Address: 325 Ridgeview Dr. Applicant: Cabin at Shooting Star, LLC Professional: Harold J. Smith/Smith and Moore Architects, Inc. Project Description: Window and door replacement, window and door opening modifications, roof replacement, balcony railing changes, loggia column replacement, canvas awning replacement, landscape and hardscape modifications.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Mr. Smith presented the proposed architectural modifications for the existing residence.

Mr. Vila asked about the existing roof. Mr. Smith responded.

Mr. Zukov asked a question about the balcony on the inspirational photo. Mr. Smith responded.

Claudia Visconti, SMI Landscape Architecture, presented the proposed landscape and hardscape modifications.

Mr. Vila asked about the about the fence replacement for safety issues with the swimming pool. Ms. Visconti responded.

Ms. Grace was in favor of both the architectural changes and the landscape changes.

Mr. Vila was in favor of the changes.

Ms. Catlin thought the changes enhanced the home.

### Motion made by Ms. Catlin and seconded by Ms. Shiverick to approve the project as presented. Motion carried unanimously.

<u>A-037-2018 Landscape/Hardscape Revisions</u> Address: 144 Seminole Ave. Applicant: Ebil Management Limited Professional: Nievera Williams Design Project Description: South property line landscape and hardscape revisions to the previously approved application. The applicant wishes to install landscape and hardscape in the easement with appropriate utility sign-off included in the application.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Matt Jackman, Nievera Williams Design, presented the modifications proposed for the landscape and hardscape.

Mr. Small asked for clarification on the proposed location of the chain link fence as well as the reason for the proposed project. Mr. Jackman responded.

Mr. Zukov expressed concern for the southern property owner's ability to maintain and repair their home. He thought the property owners should be civil enough to move the fence back one foot from the existing wooden fence, only in the area of the existing home. Mr. Vila agreed that Mr. Zukov's suggestion was logical.

Mr. Jackman stated that his clients did offer that solution to the owners of the home to the south and it was not acceptable.

Frank Lynch, attorney on behalf of Ebil Management Limited, explained the offer made to the owner of the home to the south.

A short discussion ensued about the easement on the property.

Maura Ziska, attorney on behalf on Mr. and Mrs. Flammarion at 137 Root Trail, discussed the existing easement and explained that the proposal was a severe hardship on her client. She discussed a solution to the hardship.

A short discussion ensued about what the owners of 144 Seminole offered to the Flammarions.

Ms. Grace thought that a solution should respect the Flammarions right to maintain their home.

Ms. Catlin asked if there was a precedent for the right to the property since the Flammarions have been using the property for several years. Ms. Ziska

responded. Ms. Catlin asked Mr. Lindgren if a fence was allowed on a property line. Mr. Lindgren responded. A discussion ensued about the fence on the property line.

Mr. Lynch provided legal arguments to Ms. Ziska's proposal.

Mr. Lindgren stated that according to Mr. Randolph, the Commission could not force a property owner to give up a portion of their property.

Mr. Lynch offered the solution to place the fence two feet north of his client's property line for a distance of 20 feet, which would allow the Flammarions access to their property, provided that the chain link fence could be installed on the property line. Mr. Lynch put a drawing of the offer on the overhead projector. Ms. Ziska was in agreement with the offer.

Mr. Jackman asked about the proposed hedge with the current offer. Ms. Ziska stated that hedge would be in front of the fence. Mr. Vila stated that the hedge would follow the fence line.

### Motion made by Ms. Grace and seconded by Mr. Zukov to approve the plans as presented, with a caveat that the portion of the fence that abuts 137 Root Trail would be administratively approved by staff, the applicant and the neighbor. Motion carried unanimously.

<u>A-040-2018 Landscape/Hardscape Revisions</u> Address: 245 Pendleton Ave. Applicant: Annie M. Cardelús Professional: Fernando Wong Outdoor Living Design Project Description: Refresh the landscape at front yard and back yard, develop a new driveway.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Che Wei Kuo, Fernando Wong Outdoor Living Design, presented the landscape and hardscape modifications.

Mr. Ives stated he was in favor of the landscape changes but questioned the additional curb cut.

Mr. Zukov asked about the driveway design. Mr. Kuo responded.

Ms. Catlin suggested using a different palm rather than the proposed Alexander palm. Mr. Kuo explained his design.

Ms. Grace asked if the curb cuts could be reduced since an additional curb cut was added.

Mr. Vila was in favor of the improvement.

### Motion made by Mr. Zukov and seconded by Ms. Shiverick to approve the project as presented. Motion carried unanimously.

#### A-041-2018 Additions/Modifications

Address: 258 Seminole Ave. Applicant: Sharon Talbot Professional: Jason P. Drobot/Brasseur & Drobot Architects, P.A. Project Description: The project consists of enclosing an existing 127 square foot porch located at the northeast corner of the existing two-story residence. The project also includes the addition of a French door and window on the east side elevation. An existing cantilevered roof shall be removed and a new wider one will take its place at a higher elevation in order to accommodate the new door.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Mr. Drobot presented the proposed modifications for the residence.

Mr. Zukov stated he could accept the change to the front entrance but questioned the side entrance changes proposed.

Ms. Grace stated she could accept the front entrance change but added that the doors were too elaborate and ornate.

Ms. Shiverick stated she could not support the design, as the ornate doors were too dissimilar to the rest of the homes on the street.

Ms. Catlin agreed and added she could not support the changes.

Mr. Ives suggested that the project should be deferred for restudy.

Mr. Vila stated he could not support the pilasters and columns proposed.

### Motion made by Mr. Small and seconded by Mr. Ives to defer the project for one month for a restudy. Motion carried unanimously.

#### A-042-2018 Additions/Modifications

Address: 272 Via Marila

Applicant: Nicholas and Caroline Rafferty

Professional: Roger Hansrote/ACI Consultants Inc.

Project Description: Remove and replace all existing exterior windows and doors with impact rated assemblies and add windows at various locations. Relocate front entrance door. Remove clapboard siding from second floor exterior walls and replace with stucco. Relocate generator to the west side yard. Modify roof over existing front entrance. Replace existing paver drive with Florida Cap Stone and reintroduce curb but to the east. Convert & expand existing front entrance into a small terrace. New front gates on east & west sides. Modify roof overhang on front elevation. Rework front yard landscaping. Modify existing pool and pool deck.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Richard Leja, ACI Consultants Inc., presented the proposed architectural changes to the existing home. He presented material samples to the Commissioners and showed an additional rendering on the overhead projector.

Ms. Grace thought the changes were nice and supported the design.

Mr. Ives asked about the proposed front door. Mr. Leja responded.

Ms. Shiverick asked about the overhang on the second story roof. Mr. Leja responded and explained the design. Ms. Shiverick suggested adding more overhang on the second story. Mr. Leja agreed and stated he could add 4 inches.

Claudia Visconti, SMI Landscape Architecture, presented the modifications to the landscape and hardscape design. She showed alternate renderings on the overhead projector.

Ms. Grace was in favor of the landscape design.

### Motion made by Ms. Grace and seconded by Ms. Catlin to approve the project as presented. Motion carried unanimously.

<u>A-043-2018 Modifications</u> Address: 216 Garden Rd. Applicant: William Mulroy Professional: Nievera Williams Design Project Description: Proposed front entry steps and site wall.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Matt Jackman, Nievera Williams Design, presented the proposed modifications to the hardscape.

Mr. Vila asked if the owner considered aluminum pickets. Mr. Jackman responded.

Motion made by Mr. Ives and seconded by Mr. Small to approve the project as presented with the caveat that the Commission would also approve aluminum pickets as well. Motion carried unanimously.

- IX. OTHER BUSINESS None.
- X. ADDITION COMMUNICATION FROM CITIZENS (3 MINUTE LIMIT PLEASE)

There were no comments heard at this time.

- XI. COMMENTS OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION AND DIRECTOR OF PLANNING, ZONING AND BUILDING DEPARTMENT There were no comments heard at this time.
- XII. ADJOURNMENT

Motion made by Mr. Small and seconded by Mr. Ives to adjourn the meeting at 6:42 p.m. Motion carried unanimously.

The next meeting will be held on Wednesday, October 24, 2018 at 9:00 a.m. in the Town Council Chambers, 2nd floor, Town Hall, 360 S County Rd.

Respectfully Submitted,

Robert J. Vila, Chairman ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION kmc