

TOWN OF PALM BEACH

Planning, Zoning & Building Department

August 29, 2018

.___B AUG 29 PH4125 TWN CLERK

RECEIVED

Ms. Kathleen Dominguez, Town Clerk Town of Palm Beach 360 South County Road Palm Beach, FL 33480

NOTICE OF APPEAL

RE: ARCOM Application A-029-2018 New Town of Palm Beach Recreation Center 340 Seaview Avenue Palm Beach, FL 33480

Dear Ms. Dominguez:

The Town of Palm Beach, through its consultants (Stephen Boruff Architects + Planners, Inc.), submitted an Architectural Commission (ARCOM) application for the new recreation center to "modify previously approved application, including stucco in lieu of cast stone at Main Building and Tennis Pavilion, hardscape material revision." This application was reviewed by ARCOM at its August 22, 2018 meeting. ARCOM voiced strong objection to the removal of the cast stone on the project, and replacing it with stucco. Some members of the Commission also favored keeping the other items that were requested to be eliminated from the project (entry arch, playground pavilion, and change to hitting wall layout); however, the Commission was amenable to these items being removed, but requested that they be done in the future if funding became available. Attached are the ARCOM minutes for this project that provide more details regarding the Commissioner's comments, and the exact motion made by ARCOM.

Pursuant to Sec. 18-177 of the Town's Code of Ordinances that addresses appeals of rulings made by ARCOM, Planning, Zoning & Building staff are appealing ARCOM's ruling regarding the proposed changes for the recreation center so that Town Council can discuss these changes in light of ARCOM's decision at the next Town Council meeting (September 13, 2018). Should you require additional information or have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me at 561.227-6414 or jlindgren@townofpalmbeach.com.

Sincerely, Jor C. Yunda =

John Lindgren, AICP Planning Administrator 360 South County Road Palm Beach, FL 33480

cc: Kirk Blouin, Town Manager
Jay Boodheshwar, Deputy Town Manager
Josh Martin, AICP, Planning, Zoning & Building Director
Paul Castro, AICP, Zoning Administrator
Rod Gardiner, Assistant Director of Recreation
Paul Brazil, Public Works Director
John Randolph, Town Attorney

A. <u>MAJOR PROJECTS – NEW BUSINESS</u> A-029-2018 Modifications

Address: 340 Seaview Ave. Applicant: Town of Palm Beach Professional: Stephen Boruff Architects + Planners, Inc. Project Description: Request to modify previously approved application including: stucco in lieu of cast stone at Main Building and Tennis Pavilion, hardscape material revision.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Mr. Castro explained that the project was more expensive than what had been budgeted and that the Town Council removed certain elements to meet budget constraints. Mr. Castro stated that they were hoping to bring some of the eliminated items back in the second phase of the project, should an additional donor step forward.

Mr. Garrison asked what decisions could be made by the Commission. Mr. Castro responded and explained the recommendations needed from the Commission.

Ms. Grace asked about the items being removed from the project. Mr. Castro stated that the Council had removed some of the items due to budget constraints but would like the flexibility to keep the items approved should someone make a donation.

A discussion ensued about the items being removed from the project. Mr. Lindgren stated that the items removed would need a staff approval to be built, should the Town receive the money to fund the items. Therefore, he thought that the Commission should offer their opinion on the items in question.

A discussion ensued about the items being removed from the project.

Ms. Shiverick asked about the budget shortfall. Mr. Freijomel stated that the removal of the three accessory structures would save \$326,000 and the cast stone changes would save \$347,000. The total savings would be \$673,000.

Nelo Freijomel, Stephen Boruff Architects + Planners, Inc., presented the architectural modifications to the previously approved plans. He showed the Commission the three accessory structures to be eliminated as well as the locations where the cast stone would be eliminated. Mr. Freijomel presented material samples to the Commission.

Ms. Grace stated she thought the cast stone was important for the quality and the look of the design. She was never in favor of the entry arch so she was in favor of

its permanent elimination. She thought the playground pavilion was unnecessary as well.

Mr. Garrison stated he was opposed to removing cast stone. He stated he could not support removing the cast stone from the building, which was only 1% of the total cost of the project.

Mr. Ives agreed with Mr. Garrison's opinion of the cast stone. Mr. Ives thought the Town should be meeting the highest standard in design rather than the lowest standard. Mr. Ives stated he was disappointed that the Town could not find the money for a building that could potentially be standing for many decades.

Mr. Small agreed with Messrs. Ives and Garrison. Mr. Small expressed disappointment that the Town charged the Commission to uphold the beauty and charm of Palm Beach while they were not meeting these standards. He stated that he was opposed to removing the cast stone and hoped that the other items proposed for removal would be returned.

Ms. Catlin stated that the cast stone was a finish that should not be sacrificed. She stated she agreed with Ms. Grace and could accept the removal of the shade structures.

Mr. Corey thought the cast stone extremely important. He also was in favor of the entry gate and thought it should remain. He stated he would accept moving the shade structures for the playground into the second phase of the project.

Ms. Grace recommended eliminating the gymnasium or moving it to a second phase in order to obtain a higher quality product.

Mr. Vila agreed with Mr. Small's comments and opinions on Town buildings. He believed that eliminating the features was a negative action and he recommended opposing the proposal.

Motion by Mr. Garrison and seconded by Ms. Shiverick to oppose the removal of cast stone on all building structures, it is acceptable to modify the hardscape and that the other items proposed for removal would still carry an approval with the hope that they are returned to the project if the money is donated.

Mr. Vila called for public comment. There were no comments heard at this time.

Motion carried unanimously.