

TOWN OF PALM BEACH

PLANNING, ZONING AND BUILDING DEPARTMENT

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION MEETING HELD ON WEDNESDAY, MAY 23, 2018

Please be advised that in keeping with a recent directive from the Town Council, the minutes of all Town Boards and Commissions will be "abbreviated" in style. Persons interested in listening to the meeting, after the fact, may access the audio of that item via the Town's website at www.townofpalmbeach.com.

I. CALL TO ORDER

Mr. Vila called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m.

II. ROLL CALL

| Robert J. Vila, Chairman | PRESENT |
|---------------------------------|---------|
| Michael B. Small, Vice Chairman | PRESENT |
| Robert N. Garrison, Member | PRESENT |
| Alexander C. Ives, Member | PRESENT |

Maisie Grace, Member PRESENT (left at 5:10 p.m.)

John David Corey, Member PRESENT
Nikita Zukov, Member PRESENT
Betsy Shiverick, Alternate Member PRESENT
Katherine Catlin, Alternate Member PRESENT
Dan Floersheimer, Alternate Member PRESENT

Staff Members present were:

John Lindgren, Planning Administrator

Paul Castro, Acting Director of Planning, Zoning and Building

Kelly Churney, Secretary to the Architectural Review Commission

III. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Chairman Vila led the Pledge of Allegiance.

IV. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES FROM THE APRIL 25, 2018 MEETING

Motion made by Mr. Small and seconded by Mr. Garrison to approve the minutes from the April 25, 2018 meeting. Motion carried unanimously.

V. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Mr. Small requested to amend the agenda with the deferral of the following projects to the June 27, 2018 meeting: A-12-2018, 500 Island Dr.; B-012-2018, 313 ½ Worth Ave and the architectural portion of project B-008-2018, 232 Seabreeze Ave. He also requested to defer project B-003-2018, 2291 Ibis Isle Rd. E. to the October 24, 2018 meeting.

Motion made by Mr. Small and seconded by Mr. Garrison to approve the agenda as amended. Motion carried unanimously.

VI. <u>ADMINSTRATION OF THE OATH TO PERSONS WHO WISH TO TESTIFY</u> Ms. Churney administered the oath at this time and throughout the meeting as necessary.

VII. COMMUNICATIONS FROM CITIZENS REGARDING NON-AGENDA ITEMS (3 MINUTE LIMIT PLEASE)

There were no comments heard at this time.

VIII. PROJECT REVIEW

A. DEMOLITIONS AND TIME EXTENSIONS

B-048-2018 Demolition Address: 224 Angler Ave.

Applicant: Amanda and Alexander Coleman

Professional: Brian Vertesch, SMI Landscape Architecture

Project Description: Requesting demolition of existing single story residence and

removal of selected landscaping.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure of several members.

Mr. Vertesch presented the proposed demolition for the existing residence and landscaping.

Mr. Small asked about the timeline for the installation of the chain link fence and vinyl during the demolition. Mr. Vertesch responded.

Motion made by Mr. Small and seconded by Mr. Ives to approve the plans as presented with the caveats to remove all exotic and invasive plant species and to sod and irrigate the property within 30 days. Motion carried unanimously.

B. MAJOR PROJECTS – OLD BUSINESS

B-054-2017 New Construction Address: 446 N. Lake Way Applicant: Stephen A. Levin

Professional: Benjamin Schreier/Affiniti Architects

Project Description: New contemporary two story home and one story accessory garage totaling 13,093 gross s.f. and associated landscaping, hardscape and swimming pool.

Project History:

- June 2017 Presented and deferred to August 2017 (major restudy requested)
- August 2017 Deferred at the request of the Architect to September 2017
- September 2017 Presented and deferred to November 2017 (restudy)

- November 2017 Presented and deferred to January 2018 (major restudy requested) *change in architect*
- January 2018 Presented and deferred to February 2018 (based upon Commissioners comments)
- February 2018 Presented and deferred to March 2018 (restudy)
- March 2018 Presented and deferred to April 2018 (based upon Commissioners comments)
- April 2018 Presented and deferred to May 2018.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure of several members.

Mark Pulte, owner of the property, advocated for an approval from the Commission for the proposed design.

James Green, Attorney for the applicant, reviewed the history of the presentations to the Commission.

Daniel Ménard, LaBerge and Ménard, reviewed the architectural changes made to the current design of the home.

Mr. Zukov discussed his meeting with the architects and the changes he suggested.

Ms. Catlin stated that she experienced a virtual reality tour of the home and was in full support of the project. Mr. Small agreed.

Mr. Ives stated he still opposed the project.

Mr. Corey asked about the proposed roof. Mr. Ménard responded.

Mr. Vila commented on the length of time and presentations before the Commission and the ultimate evolution of the project.

Motion made by Mr. Small and seconded by Mr. Zukov to approve the project as presented. Motion carried 5-2 with Mr. Ives and Ms. Grace opposed.

B-003-2018 Demolition/New Construction

Address: 2291 Ibis Isle Rd. E. Applicant: Lynne Eriksen

Professional: Roger Hansrote/ACI

Project Description: Demolition of an existing one story, CBS, 2547 s.f. ranch

style single-family residence and swimming pool constructed in 1961.

Construction of a new 3576 s.f. AC area one story single family residence with a 523 s.f. garage, swimming pool and associated landscaping and hardscape.

A motion carried at the April meeting to defer the project for one-month to the May 23, 2018 meeting at the request of the architect.

Please note: This item was deferred to the October 24, 2018 meeting with the Item V. Approval of the Agenda.

B-008-2018 Demolition/New Construction

Address: 232 Seabreeze Ave. Applicant: Jim & Robin Carey

Professional: Jeremy K. Walter, AIA/Jeremy K. Walter Architects, LLC Project Description: Demolition of existing 2 story single family dwelling, 2 story garage, storage shed and pool. New construction of a 2 story single family contemporary home with concrete tile and standing seam zinc coated copper roof, new pool, site walls and landscaping.

At the January meeting, a motion carried to approve the demolition of the existing property as requested. A second motion carried to defer the project for two months to the March meeting for a complete redesign of the project. A motion carried at the March meeting to defer the project for one month to April 25, 2018 for restudy based on the comments from the Commission. A motion carried at the April meeting to defer the project for one month to the May 23, 2018 meeting.

Applicant requesting approval of revision to demolition landscape plan and a deferral of the new home until the June 27, 2018 meeting.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Mr. Walter presented a modification to the landscape and hardscape plan, specifically for the demolition of the western site wall.

Ms. Grace asked for clarification for the proposed landscaping for the western wall. Mr. Walter responded. Ms. Grace asked about the proposed height of the neighbor's wall. Mr. Walter responded.

Motion made by Mr. Small and seconded by Mr. Ives to approve the modification as presented. Motion carried with all in favor.

B-012-2018 Modifications

Address: 313 ½ Worth Ave.

Applicant: Via Bice Worth Avenue LLC

Professional: Jeffrey W. Smith/Smith Architectural Group

Project Description: Renovation of Via Bice to include new paving, new trellis, retractable awning, landscaping and lighting. Removal of awnings. Renovations

to Peruvian Ave façade to include new stone entry, new glass awning,

landscaping and lighting, replace awnings. New Doors.

SPECIAL EXCEPTION WITH SITE PLAN REVIEW INFORMATION: 1) Request for special exception approval to allow a two (2) story trellis 2)Request for site plan review to modify the Via Bice as follows: a) New mosaic pavers in the Via; b) New 2,240 square foot trellis with retractable awning above; c) New landscaping and lighting; d) New stone entry with awning on Peruvian Avenue; e) Removal of existing canvas awnings; f) New 37.5 square foot addition to existing bay window.

At the February meeting, a recommendation to the Town Council was given that the redesign was a positive step forward in the right direction. A motion carried at the March meeting to allow time for the project to be heard by the Town Council. A motion carried at the March meeting to defer the project at the request of the architect for one month to the April 25, 2018 meeting. A motion carried at the April meeting to defer the project for one month to the May 23, 2018 meeting.

Please note: This item was deferred to the June 27, 2018 meeting with the Item V. Approval of the Agenda.

B-030-2018 New Construction

Address: 905 N. Ocean Blvd.

Applicant: Patrick and Lillian Carney Professional: LeBerge & Ménard Inc.

Landscape Professional: Nievera Williams Design

Project Description: Construction of a new 17,727 sq. ft. two story main house with a basement and a 1,284 sq. ft. single story guesthouse in the Neo-Classical style of architecture. Final hardscape, landscape and drainage plan to be

presented as well.

A motion carried at the March meeting to defer the project for one month to the April 25, 2018 meeting for restudy. A motion carried at the April meeting to defer the project for one month to the May 23, 2018 meeting at the request of the attorney.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure of several members.

Patrick Carney, owner, reviewed the general modifications that have been made to the proposed home design since the last presentation to the Commission.

Mr. Ménard presented the architectural modifications for the proposed residence.

Greg Kino, attorney representing Joan and Murray Goodman, stated his clients believed that the proposed home was still too massive. He also discussed the proposed lot coverage in comparison to floor area ratio. Mr. Kino introduced Gene Pandula, Architect. Mr. Kino asked Mr. Pandula if he prepared the floor area ratio comparisons that were handed out to the Commissioners. Mr. Pandula provided confirmation.

Mr. Pandula provided a presentation of the floor area ratio comparisons to the proposed home as well as several surrounding homes. He discussed ways to reduce the mass of the proposed home.

Mr. Kino discussed the location of the proposed mechanical equipment. He suggested moving this equipment to the west side of the garage.

Keith Williams, Nievera Williams Design, presented the proposed landscape and hardscape plan for the project. He agreed to move the mechanical equipment to the west side of the garage.

Mr. Vila asked about the proposed landscaping for the north side of the home. Mr. Williams responded.

Mr. Small asked about a small ground fountain proposed. Mr. Williams provided some explanation for the fountain.

Mr. Corey asked about the roof plan for the wings of the home. Mr. Ménard responded. Mr. Corey asked about the proposed north garage and the volume above the garage. Mr. Ménard responded.

Mr. Ménard stated that the owner agreed to remove the dormers on the north garage wing that faces the neighbors' property.

Mr. Corey asked if the roof bulk in the main house could be reduced. Mr. Ménard agreed and stated he thought he could reduce the roof. Mr. Corey suggested a restudy of the fenestration on the east elevation.

Mr. Floersheimer asked about the elevation and grade for the proposed home. Mr. Ménard and Mr. Williams responded.

Ms. Catlin complimented the architect. She thought the house was too large for the lot. She thought the house mass needed to be reduced, particularly in the middle. Mr. Ménard responded. Ms. Catlin expressed a general concern about new homes that are designed from setback to setback.

Mr. Ives agreed with Mr. Corey and thought the roof pitch needed to be restudied. He also thought the design was becoming a bit bland in the attempt to meet neighbors' concerns. He suggested adding more identity to the architectural style.

Ms. Grace stated she preferred the first design style to the current proposed style. She stated she felt the new design was cold and expressed concern for fenestration on the east elevation.

Mr. Garrison was in favor of much of the current design and thought the home was sited appropriately.

Mr. Small discussed the dilemma of the zoning for the current lots versus the ARCOM ordinance. Mr. Small also spoke about the general crises of architecture becoming subservient to development. He stated he thought the house was too massive for the lot.

Mr. Floersheimer suggested building a skeleton of the proposed home to allow the neighbors to see how the home would present itself.

Mr. Vila agreed with Ms. Catlin and Mr. Small's comments. He provided general comments about building on subdivided lots. He added he thought the home was too massive.

Mr. Ménard responded to the criticism.

Motion made by Ms. Grace and seconded by Mr. Corey to defer the project for one month to the June 27, 2018 meeting for restudy. Motion carried with all in favor.

Please note: A short break was taken at 10:31 a.m. The meeting resumed at 10:49 a.m.

B-034-2018 New Construction

*ARCOM TO MAKE RECOMMENDATIONS RELATIVE TO

VARIANCE(S)* - Done 4/25/18 Address: 901 N. Ocean Blvd.

Applicant: PBB Island Properties, LLC

Professional: Roger Janssen/Dailey Janssen Architects

Project Description: Construction of a two-story residence, hardscape, landscape

and pool.

A motion carried at the March meeting to defer the project for one month to the April 25, 2018 meeting for restudy based on the comments from the Commissioners. A motion carried at the April meeting that implementation of the proposed variance will not cause negative architectural impact to the subject property. A second motion carried to defer the project to the May 23, 2018 meeting for a restudy of the main house and guesthouse.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure of several members.

Keith Beatty, owner, discussed his intentions for the proposed home.

Mr. Janssen presented the proposed architectural modification for the new residence. He presented alternate drawings on the overhead projector. He

discussed some alternate building materials for the residence. He also presented some comparable homes with similar or greater floor area ratios in the area.

John Dotterrer, attorney representing Joan and Murray Goodman, presented objections to the proposed home based on its mass, height and dissimilarity to other homes in the surrounding area. He showed images and a 3D video of the proposed home.

Mr. Dotterrer introduced Eric Varvel who created the 3D visuals presented. Mr. Varvel discussed the visuals that he created.

Maura Ziska, attorney for the owner, objected to the visuals presented by Mr. Dotterrer and Mr. Varvel.

Mr. Beatty expressed concern about the 3D visuals and stated they were inaccurate.

Mr. John Randolph, Town Attorney, told the Commission it was up to them to decide what is relevant from the information received.

Mr. Dotterrer asked Gene Pandula, Architect, to comment on the floor area ratio for the proposed home. Mr. Pandula spoke to the floor area ratio and its compatibility for the area. Mr. Dotterrer asked Mr. Pandula if he thought the proposed home was dissimilar to others in the area. Mr. Pandula confirmed he did.

Tatiana Van Zandt, 215 Mediterranean Rd., showed photos of other curves in Palm Beach and expressed her concern for the proposed home.

Susan Gary, 229 Onondaga Ave., expressed her concern for the proposed home.

Kathleen Bleznak, 960 N. Ocean Blvd., spoke in opposition of the proposed home.

Robin Weeks, 210 Jamaica Lane, spoke in opposition of the proposed home.

Susan Watts, 44 Cocoanut Row, spoke in opposition of the proposed home.

Bill Metzger, 277 Esplanade Way, spoke in opposition of the proposed home.

Ms. Grace asked Mr. Varvel about his presentation, specifically relating to the proposed site wall in the front of the property. Mr. Varvel provided explanations for his presentation.

Mr. Castro asked the Commission if they would like to see the location on Google Earth. Mr. Vila agreed.

Ms. Catlin complimented the architect on his designs. She thought the house was too large for the lot. She stated she was in favor of the style but suggested eliminating the six-car garage, reducing the height and the width of the home.

Mr. Ives expressed concern about the entrance water feature, the pergolas, the mass, scale and thought the home needed restudy.

Ms. Grace was in favor of some of the changes that had been made. She suggested moving more toward the design of the inspirational photo.

Mr. Corey agreed with Ms. Catlin. He suggested moving the home back from the ocean. He questioned the six-car garage.

Mr. Vila asked Mr. Janssen the height of the existing site wall. Mr. Janssen responded.

Mr. Corey stated he was in favor of the style of the home and liked the cedar shake roof. He recommended narrowing the windows on the octagonal portions of the home.

Mr. Floersheimer agreed with Ms. Catlin's assessment. He expressed concern about the roofline that would be seen beyond the site wall as well as the setback from the bulkhead.

Mr. Small thought his comments, which he made for 905 N. Ocean Blvd, were relevant to this project. He thought the proposed home should be looked at without landscaping.

Mr. Vila stated he had a problem with the size and scale of the home in its proposed location.

Mr. Floersheimer expressed concern about making a left when driving out of the property. Mr. Janssen responded.

Mr. Zukov recommended removing 3 feet of the dune from the seawall, which would lower the home by 3 feet. Mr. Janssen responded.

Mr. Corey recommended that in the future, the Commission should not make a recommendation on the zoning requests before the house design are approved.

Mr. Garrison suggested that that the basement may be part of the problem. He provided a few design recommendations.

Mr. Castro expressed concern about a proposed window in a staircase leading to the basement.

Motion made by Mr. Small and seconded by Mr. Corey to defer the project for one month to the June 27, 2018 meeting for restudy based on the comments from the Commission. Motion carried unanimously.

Please note: A lunch break was taken at 12:20 p.m. The meeting resumed at 1:23 p.m.

B-037-2018 New Construction

Address: 230 Esplanade Way

Applicant: Brendan & Samantha Carroll

Professional: Pat Segraves/SKA Architect + Planner

Project Description: New construction of two-story Island style home to be approximately 4,500 square feet. Final landscape and hardscape to be provided.

A motion carried at the April meeting to defer the project for one month to the May 23, 2018 meeting to restudy the first floor windows, height of the home, railings and the landscaping.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure of several members.

Daniel Clavijo, SKA Architect + Planner, presented the proposed architectural modifications for the new residence.

Ms. Grace expressed concern for the first floor windows on the south elevation. She also asked if it was possible to reduce the height of the second floor ceiling height. Mr. Clavijo responded.

Mr. Vila asked about the proposed roof pitch. Mr. Clavijo and Mr. Segraves responded.

Mr. Garrison asked about a proposed window in the staircase. Mr. Clavijo responded. Mr. Garrison asked about the proposed color of the rafter tails. Mr. Clavijo stated they would be painted white to match the house. Mr. Garrison suggested staining the wood to provide some character to the home.

Mr. Zukov suggested adding some character to the front door.

Mr. Corey liked the home. He thought the home was a little tall. He was not in favor of the changes to the windows and liked them better as double hung windows.

Ms. Shiverick asked to see the inspiration photo. Mr. Clavijo put the photo on the overhead projector. Ms. Shiverick suggested changing the front door to one similar to the door in the inspiration photo. Mr. Clavijo passed around a sample of the paint color for the windows.

Mr. Ives suggested a restudy, specifically with the fenestration.

Mr. Vila questioned the proposed windows, entrance design and the rear porch with the chimney.

Mr. Clavijo provided explanation on the window design.

Mr. Garrison he asked about the window design on the east elevation. Mr. Clavijo responded.

Don Skowron presented the proposed landscape and hardscape modifications for the residence.

Mr. Corey expressed concern for the proposed landscaping on the south elevation, especially for the neighbors. He suggested adding more landscaping on the south elevation.

Mr. Segraves stated he would change the windows to six over six as well as changing the roof pitch to a 6/12.

Anne Metzger, 277 Esplanade Way, suggested using tray ceilings on the second floor. She also suggested adding some character on the front door.

Motion made by Ms. Grace and seconded by Mr. Small to approve the project as amended with the caveats that the architect change the windows to 6 over 6 double hung windows, to change the roof pitch to a 6 over 12, consider tray ceilings for the second floor, to add panels to the front door, which would be administratively approved and to add the stain to the rafter tails. Motion carried 6-1 with Mr. Ives opposed.

B-045-2018 New Construction

ARCOM TO MAKE RECOMMENDATIONS RELATIVE TO SPECIAL EXCEPTION WITH SITE PLAN REVIEW AND VARIANCE(S)

Address: 916 S. Ocean Blvd.

Applicant: 916 South Ocean Boulevard, LLC

Professional: Roger Janssen/Dailey Janssen Architects

Project Description: Construction of a new two-story residence, pool cabana, beach cabana, pool and spa, landscape and hardscape.

SPECIAL EXCEPTION WITH SITE PLAN REVIEW AND VARIANCE INFORMATION: 1. 134-227 and 134-1474. Request for site plan approval and special exception to permit construction of a new 500 square foot beach cabana on the portion of the property lying east of S. Ocean Blvd. 2. 134-843(a)(7) and 134-843(a)(10). Request for a zero datum (point of measurement) for the construction of the proposed two story house of 21.5 feet National Geodetic Vertical Datum ("NGVD") in lieu of 17.4 feet NGVD allowed by Code. A building height plane variance and building height variance is requested in order to permit this new zero datum.

A motion carried at the April meeting to defer the project for one month to the May 23, 2018 meeting.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure of several members.

M. Timothy Hanlon, attorney for the owner, explained a change in a zoning request and advocated for a positive recommendation to the Town Council.

Patrick Mayfield, Dailey Janssen Architects, presented the proposed architectural modifications for the new residence. Mr. Mayfield presented samples of some of the proposed building materials.

Mr. Vila asked about the stucco finished. Mr. Mayfield responded.

Ms. Catlin asked about the height of the house. Mr. Mayfield responded. She questioned the look of the stone on the east elevation. Mr. Mayfield responded.

Mr. Vila considered the design style of the home with the proposed materials.

Mr. Corey agreed with Mr. Vila. Mr. Corey questioned the design style compatibility and stated he could not support the home in its current design.

Mr. Garrison questioned the stone on the front east elevation, the stone around the windows on the south elevation and the band under the windows.

Mr. Mayfield stated the owner at 910 S. Ocean Blvd. was not moving forward with the construction of the previously approved home.

Ms. Grace stated she was not in favor of the proposed stone around the entrance.

Mr. Vila summarized the Commissioners comments and suggested adding some irregularity in the stucco finish. He also suggested reducing the stone on the south side windows as well as eliminating the stone on the bay window on the east elevation.

A short discussion ensued about the detailing on the home.

Mr. Garrison suggested removing the bay windows and the band on the house to help the east elevation.

Mr. Corey asked about the second floor over the garage. Mr. Mayfield responded. Messrs. Corey and Vila suggested reducing the roof pitch.

Motion made by Mr. Corey and seconded by Mr. Garrison to defer the project for one month to the June 27, 2018 meeting for restudy based on the comments from the Commissioners.

Matt Jackman, Nievera Williams Design, presented the proposed modifications to the landscape and hardscape plans for the home.

Mr. Vila asked about the material for the proposed gate. Mr. Jackman responded.

Mr. Corey asked about the proposed gate material. Mr. Jackman responded. Mr. Corey suggested moving the Sea Grapes away from the home. He also suggested adding additional landscaping on the northwest corner.

Motion carried with all in favor.

C. MAJOR PROJECTS – NEW BUSINESS

B-047-2018 Landscape/Hardscape

Address: 535 N. County Rd.

Applicant: 535 North County Road LLC

Professional: Steve West/Parker Yannette Design Group

Project Description: Proposed hardscape and landscape plans to accompany previously approved home. Plans include a new driveway, two swimming pools,

two fountain features and associated hardscape and landscape.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure of several members.

Mr. West presented the proposed landscape and hardscape for the proposed new residence.

Mr. Small asked about the landscape border for the north property line. Mr. West responded.

Mr. Corey was in favor of the landscape plan and thought the plan was well done.

Mr. Vila asked Mr. West if he would consider a Cuban Laurel in place of the proposed Banyan tree. Mr. West stated he would speak with his client about the option. Mr. Vila provided a suggestion for the landscaping proposed for the front border.

Mr. Zukov asked if any landscape lighting was proposed. Mr. West stated his client did not request him to prepare lighting in his proposed plan.

Motion by Mr. Zukov and seconded by Mr. Corey to approve the plans as presented with the caveats that Mr. West speak to the owner regarding the possibility of replacing the proposed Banyan tree with a Cuban Laurel tree, to consider Ficus trees in place of Noronhia trees and to return to the Commission with a plan for the landscape lighting at the June meeting. Motion carried unanimously.

B-049-2018 New Construction

*ARCOM TO MAKE RECOMMENDATIONS RELATIVE TO

VARIANCE(S)*

Address: 1558 N. Ocean Way

Applicant: The 1558 North Ocean Way Realty Trust

Professional: Richard Seaberg/RS Architectural Partners, LLC

Project Description: Proposed guesthouse (detached structure) for existing house

at 1558 N. Ocean Way.

VARIANCE INFORMATION: Construction of a 1,809 square foot, two-story, guest house on a lot having an area of 29,145 square feet, thereby requiring front and rear yard setbacks and building height plane provisions to comply with those provisions of the R-A Zoning District despite the fact that that the subject property is located in the R-B Zoning District. In connection with the proposed construction, the following variances are being requested: a. Section 134-843(a)(5): A request for a variance for the existing house with a front yard setback (east side of the property) of 32 feet in lieu of the 35 foot minimum required in the R-A Zoning District. b. Section 134-157 6: A request for a variance for the proposed guesthouse with a rear yard street side setback (west side of the property) of 30 feet in lieu of the 35-foot minimum required in the R-A Zoning District. c. Section 134-843(a)(7): A request for a variance for the proposed guest house with a building height plane (west side of the property) of 30 feet in lieu of the 38 foot minimum required in the R-A Zoning District.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure of several members.

David Klein, attorney for the owner, answered a question regarding the unification of the lots.

Mr. Floersheimer asked about the size of the two lots. Mr. Klein responded.

Mr. Seaberg presented the proposed architectural plans while explaining the variance requests for the new guesthouse.

Ms. Catlin questioned the variance request for the guesthouse. Many of the other Commission members agreed.

Motion made by Mr. Garrison and seconded by Mr. Corey that implementation of the proposed variances for the rear yard setback and building height plane will cause negative architectural impact to the subject property; and implementation of the proposed variance for the existing home will not cause negative architectural impact to the subject property. Motion carried 6-1 with Mr. Ives opposed.

Mr. Seaberg presented the proposed architectural plans for the new guesthouse.

Mr. Garrison asked about the floor to ceiling heights. Mr. Seaberg responded.

Mr. Ives questioned the roof plan design and thought it seemed complicated. Mr. Seaberg responded.

Mr. Zukov was in favor of the guesthouse.

Mr. Small was not in favor of the design and thought that it needed more charm.

Mr. Catlin thought the design was out of proportion, lacked charm and a connection to the main house.

Ms. Shiverick thought the guesthouse was too big and suggested making more of a guest cottage.

Mr. Vila asked Mr. Seaberg if the guesthouse could be lowered. Mr. Seaberg stated he could lower it by one foot. Mr. Vila suggested looking reducing the roof pitch as well.

Mr. Corey requested to see cross-sections of the main house at the next presentation.

Motion made by Mr. Corey and seconded by Mr. Small to defer the project for one month to the June 27, 2018 meeting with a caveat to return to the Commission with cross sections of the homes as well as a landscape lighting plan. Motion carried unanimously.

Adam Mills presented the proposed landscape and hardscape plans for the residence.

Mr. Small stated he liked all the newly installed landscaping. He asked Mr. Mills if there would be any vehicular access to the guesthouse. Mr. Mills stated there would not be any vehicular access.

Ms. Grace requested a separate, legible plant list at the next presentation.

B-051-2018 Demolition/New Construction

This project has to be approved in its entirety before it can be heard at by the Town Council to address the Site Plan Review application

Address: 232 Bahama Ln.

Applicant: 232 Bahama Lane, LLC

Professional: Patrick Segraves/SKA Architect + Planner

Landscape Professional: Che Wei Kuo/Fernando Wong Outdoor Living Design Project Description: Demolition of existing one story house. New construction of two-story Island style home to be approximately 4,300 square feet. Final landscaping and hardscaping to be provided.

SITE PLAN REVIEW INFORMATION: Site Plan Review to allow the construction of a 4,300 square foot, two-story, single family house on a non-conforming platted lot which is 90 feet in depth in lieu of the 100 foot depth required in the R-B Zoning District.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure of several members.

Mr. Segraves presented the proposed demolition of the existing home.

Motion made by Ms. Grace and seconded by Mr. Small to approve the proposed demolition as requested with the caveats to remove all exotic and invasive plant species and to sod and irrigate the property within 30 days. Motion carried 6-1 with Mr. Garrison opposed.

Mr. Segraves presented the architectural plans for the proposed new residence.

Mr. Zukov asked about the window panels proposed on the south elevation in the family room. Mr. Segraves responded. Mr. Zukov stated he felt they were too narrow and provided some suggestions for the windows.

Mr. Ives thought the house design was too similar to many others on the north end of the island. Mr. Segraves responded.

Ms. Grace suggested reducing the roof height and making the gable wider. Mr. Segraves responded.

Mr. Garrison asked about the bay window measurements and questioned the proposed louvers below the windows on the front entrance. Mr. Garrison also questioned the second floor balcony and window on the front entrance. Mr. Segraves responded.

Ms. Grace asked about the proposed materials for the second story balcony. Mr. Segraves responded.

Ms. Shiverick suggested removing the louvered panels under the windows to create a graceful bay window.

Ms. Catlin agreed with other comments from the Commission and suggested lowering the roof height.

Mr. Corey supported the design and recommended widening the gable and lowering the roof pitch. Mr. Small agreed and was in favor of the design.

Mr. Vila suggested reducing the pitch of the roof. Mr. Segraves agreed and presented a sample of the roof material. Mr. Vila stated that the second balcony and window needed to be corrected. He suggested lightening the balcony, reducing the front door and changing its style. He suggested restudying the bay windows and adding more of a slope on the copper roofs.

Motion made by Mr. Garrison and seconded by Mr. Corey to defer the project for one month to the June 27, 2018 meeting based upon the comments made by the Commission.

Mr. Kuo presented the proposed landscape and hardscape plans for the new residence.

Mr. Vila questioned the proposed Alexander Palms for the front of the home. Mr. Kuo responded.

Mr. Floersheimer questioned the plantings proposed for the border next to the golf course. Mr. Lindgren stated he believed that the country club would be adding new plantings that he just administratively approved. A short discussion ensued.

Mr. Corey thought the landscape plan was fine.

Ms. Grace was in favor of the proposed Madagascar Olive trees. She asked about the location for the mechanical equipment. Mr. Segraves responded.

Mr. Vila recommended adding some informality and irregularity in the landscaping.

Mr. Garrison asked for landscape cross sections as well as more details for the new residence at the next presentation.

Mr. Vila requested a presentation for the landscape lighting at the next presentation.

Motion carried unanimously.

B-052-2018 Demolition/New Construction

*ARCOM TO MAKE RECOMMENDATIONS RELATIVE TO

VARIANCE(S)*

Address: 1030 S. Ocean Blvd.

Applicant: Nedim Soylemez/Contract Purchaser

Professional: Harold Smith/Smith and Moore Architects, Inc. Landscape Professional: John Lang/Lang Design Group

Project Description: Demolition of an existing single family residence with pool. Construction of a new 2-story single family residence with basement and pool.

Final hardscape and landscape.

VARIANCE INFORMATION: 1. Request for a variance to allow the construction of a new 13,049 square foot two story residence with a point of measurement of 17.17 feet North American Vertical Datum ("NAVD") in lieu of the 15.16 foot NAVD maximum allowed for the (i) overall building height and (ii) building height. 2. A request to have a building height plane setback 53.16 feet in lieu of the 69-foot minimum setback required for the gable end pediment architectural feature.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure of several members.

Maura Ziska, attorney for the contract purchaser, explained the zoning requests and advocated for a positive recommendation to the Town Council.

Mr. Smith presented the proposed demolition of the existing residence.

Mr. Lang presented the proposed demolition plan for the landscape and hardscape materials.

Mr. Floersheimer asked about the possibility of keeping the existing house and adding a second story. Mr. Smith responded.

Motion made by Mr. Corey and seconded by Mr. Ives to approve the plans as presented with the caveats to remove all exotic and invasive plant species and to sod and irrigate the property within 30 days. Motion carried unanimously.

Taylor Smith, Smith and Moore Architects, presented some additional information to assist the Commissioners in understanding the variance requests.

Mr. Garrison stated that the proposed home was very similar to the projects that the Commission heard in the morning, specifically the home and lot sizes. He thought the variance request was a result of the size of the proposed home in relation to the lot size.

Mr. Corey stated he would support the first variance request but not the second request.

Ms. Catlin suggested looking at the home before making a recommendation on the variance requests. Mr. Small agreed.

Mr. T. Smith presented the architectural plans for the new residence.

Ms. Catlin stated that the front entrance looked like a side elevation. She asked the professionals to reduce the mass of the home as well as to restudy the garage element.

Mr. Small expressed concern for the north elevation and the garage. He also questioned the need for the variances requested. Mr. T. Smith responded to the questions.

Mr. Corey was in favor of the design but thought it could be designed without the variance requests. He suggested restudying the fenestration on the east elevation.

He suggested reworking the north façade entrance and questioned the need for the chimney on the north façade.

Ms. Catlin debated the need for the front load garage.

Ms. Grace agreed with Mr. Corey's request for a reduction in the fenestration on the east elevation.

Mr. Garrison suggested making the front door more prominent as well as a reduction in the ceiling heights.

Mr. Vila was in favor of the architecture and appreciated the materials proposed. He thought the fenestration on the east side was appropriate but suggested making the front door more prominent.

Mr. Ziska provided more explanation for the requested variances.

A second motion made by Mr. Ives and seconded by Mr. Zukov that implementation of the proposed variances will not cause negative architectural impact on the subject property. Motion carried 4-3 with Messrs. Small, Corey and Ms. Grace opposed.

Mr. Lang presented the proposed landscape and hardscape plan for the proposed new residence.

Mr. Zukov provided a suggestion for the front entrance. Mr. T. Smith responded.

Mr. Small asked about the proposed landscaping for the east side border along the street. Mr. Lang responded.

Mr. Garrison suggested the possibility of reducing the curb cuts to 12 feet versus the 14 feet proposed.

Mr. Vila made a few suggestions for landscaping for east and north facades.

A third motion made by Mr. Zukov and seconded by Mr. Ives to defer the project for one month to the June 27, 2018 meeting for a restudy based on feedback from the Commission. Motion carried unanimously.

B-054-2018 Additions/Modifications

Address: 1214 N. Ocean Blvd. Applicant: Mr. & Mrs. John Sculley Professional: MP Design & Architecture

Project Description: One story loggia addition to existing pool cabana.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure of several members.

Michael Perry, MP Design & Architecture, presented the architectural plans for the new loggia.

Mr. Vila expressed concern for the roof height of the proposed loggia. Mr. Perry responded. A short discussion ensued.

Motion made by Mr. Small and seconded by Mr. Garrison to approve the project with the caveat that the roof is reduced and the columns are increased in size. Motion carried unanimously.

B-055-2018 Additions/Modifications

ARCOM TO MAKE RECOMMENDATIONS RELATIVE TO SPECIAL EXCEPTION WITH SITE PLAN REVIEW AND VARIANCE(S)

Address: 1338 N. Lake Way

Applicant: Sailfish Club of Palm Beach Professional: Keith Spina/GliddenSpina

Landscape Professional: Steve West/Parker Yannette Design Group

Project Description: Expand kitchen, create new walkway from existing parking lot to existing electrical room. New generator room. Pool deck renovation to include replacing pool deck floor, eliminate cabanas and replace with new locker rooms, new cabanas, youth rooms, seating area, covered walkway, awning, new sundeck. Replace wood shake roof with new to match existing.

SPECIAL EXCEPTION WITH SITE PLAN REVIEW AND VARIANCE INFORMATION:

1. A request for special exception approval with site plan review to allow the following modifications to the Sailfish Club property: Expand kitchen 505 square feet to the east into existing service area (wall and parapet roof will be extended); create a 157 square foot walkway from existing parking lot to existing electrical room and new generator room for service access. Pool deck renovation to include: replace existing pool deck floor with new floor finishes, eliminate cabanas and replace with new locker rooms, new cabanas, youth recreation rooms and seating area, add covered walkway from north side of pool deck to south side of pool deck, awnings to the west side of the pool deck and north side of existing pool deck between existing terrace and dining area (see roof plan), add a 704 square foot sun deck on the southwest side of the pool deck; Install 150 KW generator in a 325 square foot building on east side of the building; Replace wood shake roof with new roof to match existing. 2. A variance is being requested to allow a decrease in landscaped open space to 19.2 % in lieu of the 20.1 % existing and 45% minimum required in the R-B Zoning District.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure of several members.

Maura Ziska, attorney for the applicant, explained the zoning requests and advocated for a positive recommendation to the Town Council.

Mr. Spina presented the proposed architectural modifications for the existing club.

Mr. Ives asked about the proposed variance requests. Mr. Spina responded.

Ms. Shiverick was in favor of the improvements. She questioned the reduction of umbrellas and cabanas. Mr. Spina stated that the members were happy with the changes. She asked about the proposed material for the deck. Mr. Spina responded.

Mr. Zukov asked about the proposed generator and the noise level. Mr. Spina responded.

Mr. Catlin was in favor of the changes.

Mr. Floersheimer asked about the removal of the existing awning. He also questioned the planters in the pool area. Mr. Spina responded.

Mr. Zukov inquired about the exterior fenestration changes. Mr. Spina responded.

Motion made by Mr. Garrison and seconded by Mr. Small that implementation of the proposed variances will not cause negative architectural impact to the subject property. Motion carried unanimously.

Mr. West presented the proposed landscape and hardscape plans for the club.

Mr. Small questioned the landscape buffer on the east side along N. Lake Way and asked for more landscaping to be added. Mr. West responded.

Mr. Zukov asked about the landscaping next to the sundeck. Mr. West responded.

A second motion made by Mr. Garrison and seconded by Mr. Zukov to approve the project as presented. Motion carried unanimously.

D. MINOR PROJECTS – OLD BUSINESS

A-012-2018 Modifications Address: 500 Island Dr. Applicant: Boldan Nowak

Professional: Steven Knight/Alexis Knight Architects, Inc.

Project Description: Replacement of existing lights in the driveway entry pier (4)

locations).

A motion carried at the April meeting to defer the project for one month to the May 23, 2018 meeting.

Please note: This item was deferred to the June 27, 2018 meeting with the Item V. Approval of the Agenda.

A-015-2018 Additions/Modifications

Address: 528 N. Lake Way

Applicant: NLWFL LLC

Professional: Mario Nievera/Nievera Williams Design

Project Description: Proposed concept for north yard to include demo of existing pool, construction of new pool, open-air structure, relocation of generator and pool equipment with new enclosure, new site walls and remodeled landscape.

A motion carried at the April meeting to defer the project for one month to the May 23, 2018 meeting at the request of the architect.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Matt Jackman, Nievera Williams Design, presented the proposed modifications to the existing landscape and hardscape. He presented additional material on the overhead projector.

Mr. Floersheimer asked about the new location for the generator and pool equipment. Mr. Jackman responded.

Motion made by Mr. Garrison and seconded by Mr. Zukov to approve the project as presented. Motion carried with all in favor.

E. MINOR PROJECTS - NEW BUSINESS

A-017-2018 Modifications/Landscape

Address: 735 Island Dr.

Applicant: Ocean Island One LLC

Professional: Thomas Kirchhoff/Kirchhoff & Associates

Project Description: New site walls and associated perimeter landscaping.

Modify equipment locations.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Mr. Kirchhoff presented the architectural modifications for the new site walls.

Mr. Garrison asked if the neighbor would be protected during construction. Mr. Kirchhoff responded.

Motion made by Mr. Ives and seconded by Mr. Small to approve the project as presented. Motion carried unanimously.

A-021-2018 Modifications Address: 232 Colonial Ln.

Applicant: SKIK, LLC (Zvenka Kleinfeld, Manager) Professional: Pat Segraves/SKA Architect + Planner

Project Description: Proposal of fenestration changes to previously approved

project.

Call for disclosure of ex parte communication: Disclosure by several members.

Daniel Clavijo, SKA Architect + Planner, presented the architectural modifications for the residence.

Mr. Corey asked about the removal of the muntins. Mr. Clavijo responded. Mr. Corey was not in favor of the removal of the muntins.

Mr. Vila agreed with Mr. Corey but was in favor of the front door fenestration changes.

Motion made by Mr. Ives and seconded by Mr. Small to approve the project as presented with the caveat that the second story section remain as previously approved. Motion carried unanimously.

IX. OTHER BUSINESS

None.

X. <u>ADDITION COMMUNICATION FROM CITIZENS (3 MINUTE LIMIT PLEASE)</u>

There were no comments heard at this time.

XI. COMMENTS OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION AND DIRECTOR OF PLANNING, ZONING AND BUILDING DEPARTMENT

There were no comments heard at this time.

XII. ADJOURNMENT

Motion made by Mr. Ives and seconded by Mr. Small to adjourn the meeting at 5:42 p.m. Motion carried with all in favor.

The next meeting will be held on Wednesday, June 27, 2018 at 9:00 a.m. in the Town Council Chambers, 2nd floor, Town Hall, 360 S County Rd.

Respectfully Submitted,

Robert J. Vila, Chair ARCHITECTURAL COMMISSION

kmc